IMMIGRANT ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND CITIZENSHIP IN ROME:
ENTREPRENEURSHIP AS A PREDICTOR OF POLITICAL RESOURCES AND
INTEGRATION

Le Anh Nguyen Long

Submitted to the faculty of the University Graduate School
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree
Doctor of Philosophy
in the School of Public and Environmental Affairs,
Indiana University
September 2012
Accepted by the Graduate Faculty, Indiana University, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Doctoral Committee

_____________________________________________
David B. Audretsch, Ph.D., Committee Chair

_____________________________________________
Yvette Alex Assensoh, Ph. D.

_____________________________________________
Charles Bonser, Ph. D.

_____________________________________________
Sameeksha Desai, Ph. D.

_____________________________________________
Jeffrey Hart, Ph. D.

[Date of Dissertation Defense – August 30, 2012]
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank all of the members of my research committee: Professors David B. Audretsch, Yvette Alex-Assensoh, Charles Bonser, Sameeshka Desai, and Professor Jeffrey Hart. Thank you for your guidance and support.

In addition, I would like to thank other faculty members at Indiana University who have also inspired me, taught me, and showed me kindness. Eileen Braman, Barbara Hershey, Mike McGinnis, Patrick O’Meara, Maureen Pirog, Evan Ringquist, Timothy Tilton, and Gerald Wright.

This research would have not been possible without the support of Professor Giuseppe De Arc Angelis, Professor of International Economics at La Sapienza University of Rome and Director of Research Centre of International Economics (CIDEI). Additionally, this work was supported by a Fellowship in Italian Studies awarded by the Collegio Carlo Alberto, and a Grant in Aid of Research from the Indiana University Graduate School.

Many others served – in different capacities --as resource people. I would also like to thank them. Thank you Dr. Franco Pittau of Migrantes and Dr. Antonio Riccio of EMN Italy, Professor Evelyn Tan, at the University of the Philippines Department of Mathematics, Dr. Cristina Liamzon at Ateneo di Manila, Professor Giovane Zincone at FIERI, and Gabriela Sanna of Roma Multietnica. Also to friends who helped with securing funding, editing and providing advice at critical junctures in the research: Cassandra Chambliss, Yamir Velez Gonzalez, and Kelsey Adams, and Lauren Anaya, thank you.
I would also like to thank all of those who opened their homes and lives to us during this period. Thank you Angiola, Katiuscia, Alice, Bea, Re, Enrique, Rosa, Salvatore, the angels of Via Buonarotti (Valeria, Elena and Silvia) and my LSE7 family (especially Emerjon, Rosalie and Nanay Belle).

To the friends who convinced me to go to grad school: thank you Dorothy, Jackie and Christine.

Then there is my Bloomington family to thank. Thank you Gwen Arnold, Yogita Mantri, Joice Chang, Donna Pritchett (Ms. P.) and Darcee Nolan (and Justyce, Elijah and Solomon). I want to thank two women who had babies while at SPEA and showed me it could be done. Thank you Shane. Thank you Eva.

Of course, I would like to thank Le Kim Nguyen and Le Mai Nguyen. I will always remember our summers of tree climbing, eating star apples on the roof, and reading books. Thank you to Salud Liwag for being the woman that I want to be. To Elvira Liwag Nguyen and Nguyen Van Nguu: thank you for setting the bar high. And then making me believe I could touch it and that I could set it higher.

Francesco and Kaytlin: I love both of you and this is perhaps the best gift of all. Lau Tzu, whose teachings have informed our lives so much, also wrote: “Being deeply loved by someone gives you strength, while loving someone deeply gives you courage.” Thanks to you both, I know what he meant.
Le Anh Nguyen Long

IMMIGRANT ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND CITIZENSHIP IN ROME:
ENTREPRENEURSHIP AS A PREDICTOR OF POLITICAL RESOURCES AND INTEGRATION

My thesis is that entrepreneurship enhances immigrants’ social and political resources and that the benefits resulting from these improvements accrue and spill over to their co-ethnics in ways that are politically meaningful. I challenge the idea that ethnic entrepreneurship serves to ‘embed’ immigrants into their ethnic community, further isolating them from social opportunities in the mainstream (Portes and Sensenbrenner, 1993). By introducing a novel application of network analysis to study social capital, my research offers some insight into ways in which entrepreneurial activities and activism produce socially valuable interactions. I employ theories of civic engagement (Leighley, 1995; Verba et al., 1995), in testing my hypothesis that immigrant entrepreneurship serves to cultivate political mobilization capacity within groups (Klandermans and Oegama, 1987). In exploring these theories’ further applicability to an alternative socio-political context --- that of immigrant communities in Rome, Italy --- I find that political activity is network driven. Through this research, I provide an empirical account of migrant activism which demonstrates that what may seem like silent and inactive communities are, in reality, active in responding to collective action problems through the deployment of within community institutions. Finally, in seeking to understand whether entrepreneurial activity creates opportunities for immigrants to improve their reputations with the host society in a way that expands the political opportunity structure, I employ techniques and analysis from the recently developed literature on social construction in public policy (Schneider and Ingram, 1993). In sum, the findings of this project not only
confirm previous research that locates political participation within civic associations, it expands upon it by locating it in day to day interactions captured through social network analysis methods. My study contributes to our understanding into the many ways that ‘new’ groups join ‘established groups’ and the opportunities for agency in institutionally and historically determined social arrangements. Thus it informs our understanding of the potentialities (and limitations) for immigrant political and social integration.

_____________________________________________

David B. Audretsch, Ph.D.

_____________________________________________

Yvette Alex Assensoh, Ph D

_____________________________________________

Charles Bonser, Ph D

_____________________________________________

Sameeksha Desai, Ph D

_____________________________________________

Jeffrey Hart, Ph D
# Table of Contents

Introduction .................................................................................................................. 2  
Research Focus ............................................................................................................. 5  
Background .................................................................................................................. 6  
Intellectual Contributions .......................................................................................... 9  
Organization of the Dissertation ................................................................................ 13  

Chapter 1. On Entrepreneurial Citizenship ................................................................. 16  
1.1 Entrepreneurs as a Subject of Study ................................................................. 18  
1.2 Entrepreneurship and Immigration .................................................................. 19  
1.3 Using Social Capital to Study Entrepreneurial Political Participation .......... 20  
1.4 Using Networks to Study Social Capital ............................................................ 26  
1.5 Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 33  

Chapter 2. Methods of Study ...................................................................................... 34  
The Qualitative Interviews and Ethnosurvey ............................................................ 42  
Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 54  

Chapter 3. Political Discourse and Migrant-Network Responses ............................ 56  
3.1 Method of Study .................................................................................................. 58  
3.2 Immigration as an Emerging Problem in Italy .................................................. 59  
3.3 A Brief Review of Italian Migration Policy ....................................................... 61  
3.4 Social Constructions and the Security Act ......................................................... 69  
3.5 Social Constructions, Social Networks, and Political Participation ............. 77  
3.6 Bridging Relationships and Migrant Political Participation ........................... 78  
3.7 Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 87  

Chapter 4. A First Look at Networks and Migrant Political Participation .............. 88  
4.1 Background ........................................................................................................... 89  
4.2 Data and Methods ............................................................................................... 91  
4.3 They Don’t Want To: A Question of Engagement ............................................. 92  
4.4 No One Asked Them: A Question of Networks ............................................... 95  
4.5 Migrant Community Networks in Action ........................................................... 97  
4.6 They Can’t: A Question of Resources ............................................................... 108  
4.7 Migrant Community Networks and Municipal Elections ............................... 117
### Chapter 5. Location, Location, Location: Authority and Influence in Immigrant Social Networks

5.1 Methods and Network Measures .............................................................................. 134
5.2 Results ......................................................................................................................... 136
5.3 Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 151

Subsection 5.5 Descriptions of Network Components ..................................................... 151

### Chapter 6. Social Capital, Networks, and Political Participation ................................. 178

6.1 Background: Social Capital Mechanisms and Political Participation ................. 178
6.2 Data and Methods ......................................................................................................... 183
6.3 Results ......................................................................................................................... 187
6.4 Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 194

### Chapter 7. Discussion and Conclusion ....................................................................... 196

### Bibliography ................................................................................................................. 209

### List of Figures

- Figure 1.1 Social Capital Measurements ...................................................................... 22
- Figure 1.2 Examples of Small Networks ....................................................................... 29
- Figure 2.1 Fieldwork Map ............................................................................................. 34
- Figure 2.2 Word Frequency Count: Places ..................................................................... 49
- Figure 2.3 Visual Map of Immigrant Information Network ............................................ 53
- Figure 3.1 Frequency Counts for Articles Featuring Topics on Migration .................. 59
- Figure 3.2 Word Frequency Count, Policy Makers ......................................................... 68
- Figure 3.3 Word Frequency Count, Policy Proposals ...................................................... 70
- Figure 3.4 Word Frequency Count, Media Labels placed on Italy’s Migrants .............. 71
- Box 3.1 ............................................................................................................................. 79
- Figure 3.5 Entities Associated with Migration ................................................................. 83
- Figure 3.6 Word Frequency Counts, Entities Associated with Policy Implementation ................................................................. 85
- Figure 4.1 Nodes and Ties ................................................................................................ 95
- Figure 5.1 Map of In-Degrees, Whole Network ............................................................... 124
Figure 5.2 Out-Degrees by Occupation........................................................................138
Figure 5.3 Betweenness by Occupation.........................................................................142
Figure 5.4 Authority by Occupation ..............................................................................144
Figure 5.51 Map of In-Degrees, Whole Network...............................................................152
Figure 5.52 Map of the Peruvian Network...............................................................156
Figure 5.53 Map of the Filipino Network ...............................................................162
Figure 5.54 Map of the Bangladeshi Network..........................................................170
Figure 6.1 Categories of Components ........................................................................184
Figure 6.2 Component Categories ........................................................................190

List of Tables
Table 2.1 Mapping Questions to Methods ......................................................................36
Table 3.1 Mapping Constructions to Policies .................................................................72
Table 3.2 Migrant Referrals for Document Processing Assistance ..................................80
Table 4.1 Attributes of Survey Respondents ................................................................110
Table 4.2 Binary Logistic Regression for Voting and Protesting .................................113
Table 4.3 Outcomes of Municipal Elections, by Nationality and by Occupation ....118
Table 5.1 Characteristics of Relationships ................................................................130
Table 5.2 Node Occupational Information ................................................................134
Table 5.3 Roles of Respondents ..................................................................................136
Table 5.4 Descriptive Statistics ..................................................................................149
Table 5.51 Central Node Characteristics ................................................................158
Table 5.52 Measures of Within-Component Node Distance .........................................182
Table 6.1 Basic Measures of Constraint .....................................................................187
Table 6.2 Central Connector Centrality Measures ......................................................189
“A journey of a thousand miles must begin with a single step.”
- Lau Tzu
INTRODUCTION

Political representation is a tenet of democracy. The ideal of a representative democracy where constituents are ‘present’ in policy making (Pitkin, 1967) is challenged by the diversity of preferences that seek representation (Madison, 1787). The growing presence of phenotypically distinct, resident non-citizens in what have been termed “Northern states” (Appleyard, 1991) further complicates democratic representation.

As archeologists, historians, and even evolutionary biologists have documented (Kolbert, 2011), human migration makes up part of our earliest histories. Seeking to take advantage of contextually produced ‘novelty’, I employ immigrants’ status as new ‘members’ of a polity to explore if ethnic entrepreneurship serves to ‘embed’ immigrants into their ethnic community, further isolating them from social opportunities in the mainstream (Granovetter, 1973; Portes and Sensenbrenner, 1993), or if it creates opportunities for integration¹. The migrant context brings to bear the question of political and social learning, as we are reminded by Ralph Waldo Emerson’s journal entry (1839): “children are all foreigners.”

Specifically, I am interested in representation achieved through political participation. When marginalized groups participate in mainstream politics, they communicate their policy preferences thereby participating in the deliberative function of democracy (Mansbridge, 2003). In their influential book on civic engagement, Voice and Equality, Sidney Verba, Kay Lehman Schlozman and Henry E. Brady (hereafter, Verba etal. 1995), propose that involvement in civic organizations impels political action primarily through

¹ I define integration as the minimizing of social distance between immigrants and hosts.
the development of civic skills that are transferable to the political arena. Entrepreneurial learning has the same, if not greater, potential to invoke political participation. Entrepreneurship cultivates what Schumpeter (1934) describes as intuition borne out of learning through experience. Furthermore, many of the ‘important’ political skills learned via participation in civic organizations were borrowed or adapted from successful entrepreneurial models.

Market based models are everywhere, their influence is so widespread and can be found in the management of communities, cities, states and nations (Porter, 1990). This work posits that gains in skills knowledge and social capital cultivated through entrepreneurship are transferable to politics and that this spillover is vital to the socio-political integration of immigrants. The answer to the central research question, “Does entrepreneurship contribute to the political participation of immigrants?” will further our knowledge of the social impacts of immigrant entrepreneurial activity and the determinants of immigrant political participation. The research presented in this thesis was guided by the following research questions:

**Question 1. Which activities create the capacity for collective action?**

**Question 2. Which roles and social positions are advantageous for political participation? And how are entrepreneurs positioned in their communities?**

**Question 3. Who are the important points of access in migrant communities that can be approached to access state institutions and vice-versa?**

**Question 4. What structures are conducive to exchange? How do these structures contribute to political mobilization?**

This work focuses on political participation and its cognates. Activism speaks volumes about the level of immigrant emotional investment and comfort with host country
institutions (de Rooij, 2010). Formal citizenship alone is insufficient for ensuring political integration. As Castles (2000) writes, “Equally important is the extent to which people belonging to distinct groups of the population actually achieve substantial citizenship: that is equal chances of participation in various areas of society such as politics, work and social security”.

Political participation lends itself to study because, unlike other forms of political integration, it is easy to observe\(^2\). As the “active dimension of citizenship” (Martiniello, 2005, p. 3), political participation concerns each individual’s agency in the political process. It includes all activities that individuals undertake to influence political outcomes. Therefore, it concerns actions (Verba et al., 1995) and motivations (Klandermans & Oegama, 1987). Allowing members of the polity to exercise their voice is the only legitimate precursor to democratic representation (Hirschman, 1970; Schmidt et al., 2010).

The political integration of immigrants via their participation in the civic and political life of the host ensures their representation, decreases the likelihood of inter-group conflict, and contributes to the overall health and legitimacy of democratic governance (Castles, 2000; Gradstein & Schiff, 2006; Hochschild & Mollenkopf, 2008; Maxwell, 2010, & Rogers, 2006). Leighley (1995) observes that “many types of participation are not singular pursuits…even if one is motivated to attend a meeting or sign a petition, unless a meeting is scheduled or a petition available to sign, the act of participation is precluded”. The ease of participation increases (costs decrease) if a community is well organized. I

\(^2\) This research adopts the standard set by Verba, Schlozman and Brady (1995) of limiting the study of political engagement to actual activity: like them, I am “concerned about doing politics rather than talking about politics”.

4 | Nguyen Long
employ social network analysis to capture these ideas and to apply them to my subjects of study: immigrants in Rome.

RESEARCH FOCUS

This is a study of entrepreneurial citizenship. By ‘citizenship’, I refer to the assortment of commitments that motivate an individual to pursue his/her rights and interests within a polity; therefore, I am not referring to formalized ‘membership’ in a nation state, but to the ‘active’ and psychological components of ‘belonging’. I focus most of my attention on collective action—or those actions that aim “to improve the status, power, or influence of an entire group rather than of one of a few individuals” (van Zomeran & Iyer, 2009).

Arguably, many of the critical skills that would increase an individual’s capacity to participate in collective action are also skills that an entrepreneur would develop (and improve) through the establishment and management of a business. In establishing a business, an entrepreneur gains specialized knowledge about how exchanges are conducted in the host society; the important ‘sape’ fa’ (know how) of day-to-day life (Pardo, 1996). Because of their necessarily increased interaction with natives, entrepreneurs are more likely to learn the host country language. As such, they benefit from reduced information collection costs (Verba et al., 1995) and lowered transaction costs (Djajic, 2003). Additionally, entrepreneurs are uniquely positioned to assist co-ethnics in accessing mainstream institutions. Entrepreneurs often serve as intermediaries, a critical function for migrant communities (Ambrosini, 2006). Constantine et al. (2008), for example, observed that Turkish business associations in Romania provide political and cultural advocacy for the Turkish community. Their visibility means that
entrepreneurs are within the ‘reach’ of host natives wishing to exchange information and ideas about life, society, and politics (Zhou, 2004).

The idea of the entrepreneur is so entrenched in our culture that a range of public behaviors have come to be known as ‘entrepreneurial’. Terms like social entrepreneur, political entrepreneur, and policy entrepreneur are commonplace in discussions of individual’s attempts to address collective action problems (Barendsen and Gardner, 2004; Thompson, 2002; Mintrom & Vergari, 1996; Schneider and Ingram, 1993). The meager scholarly attention given to the contributions of entrepreneurs to political mobilization is curious given the prevalence of entrepreneurial models that have been adopted in public life (Porter, 1990; Staeyert & Katz, 2004).

BACKGROUND: LOCATION OR SETTING IN WHICH THE STUDY TAKES PLACE

The subjects of this research are non-EU immigrants residing in Rome, Italy. Italy had 4,570,317 foreign residents in 2009. The number of immigrants who seek to become permanent immigrants has risen significantly over the past decade as evidenced by the increases in (i) the number of applications for residency permits, (ii) increases in immigrant homeownership rates and (iii) the increasing number of inter-marriage between native Italians and immigrants (Pittau, 2009). This trend has been supported by the country’s increased dependence on foreign labor (Campani, 2007; Okuth, 2003; Pittau, 2009). Italy is also a primary target for illegal immigration into Europe given its geographic location and its expanse of coastline (over 8,000 kilometers).

3 These numbers are reported by ISTAT (Italian National Institute of Statistics) at http://www.istat.it/en/archive/40658
Compared to other member states of the European Union, Italy has a negligible colonial tradition. What results is a heterogeneous mix of migrant national groups. In this sense the Italian immigrant experience more closely mirrors the Northern American experience that that of other European states (Ambrosini, 2002: Ammendola et al, 2004). The composition of immigrant groups continues to change reflecting geopolitical developments. For host country institutions and communities such diversity complicates policy making. For the immigrant groups, diversity creates competition and organization problems that can have significant problems for civic engagement (Costa & Khan, 2002).

Non-EU immigrants increasingly account for a larger portion of immigration into Western Europe, introducing cultural and racial differences that promote conditions with implications important for study. Given the relative novelty of immigration in Italy, it stands as an interesting case for the larger policy-making community.

The eternal city itself is no stranger to visitors. Discussing his film, *Gente di Roma*, Etoe Scola observed, [Translation:] “I have met many immigrants, and speaking with them I have discovered that Rome is the European capital where non-EU immigrants live the best, not because it is a particularly cordial or easy-going place, but because its inhabitants are so used to seeing history unfold before their very eyes that nothing surprises them anymore” (Montini, 2009). This does not, however, mean that immigration does not present a challenge in the city.

In 2004, the former mayor of Rome, Walter Veltroni, established Adjunct Councilor positions in the city’s municipal government for elected migrant representatives. These positions provide an additional avenue for migrants to participate in political discourse.
They also provide one of the few opportunities for non-EU\(^4\) migrants to vote in Italy. Moreover, by providing a space where immigrant leaders may form relationships with each other and with representatives of Roman government, they have expanded the possibility for migrant communities to capture selective benefits\(^5\).

The timing of Mr. Veltroni’s decision is interesting given that this symbolic empowerment of migrants in Italy’s capital occurred as the nation and its neighbors adopted increasingly restrictive policies towards migration (see Chapter 3). I took advantage of this new development in Roman policy, to look across migrant participation in multiple arenas. This research places special focus on three understudied migrant communities, Filipinos, Peruvians, and Bangladeshis. These national communities were selected because of the differences in their community composition. It bears mentioning that these national groups stand out because of the quality of their participation in the municipal elections and in other forms of political activity, most notably *associazionismo* (group membership) and protest.

**Immigrant entrepreneurial activity in Italy**

The abandonment of reciprocity requirements for foreign direct investment in 2000 (via Law 39/90) opened doors for migrant business in Italy. Given that the alternative to entrepreneurship for most immigrants can be unpalatable—most jobs open to immigrants have famously been characterized by sociologist Maurizio Ambrosini (2003) using the five Ps: *pesanti, precari, pericolosi, poco pagati e penalizzati socialmente* (heavy, unstable, dangerous, low paid, and socially penalized) — it is no surprise that immigrants

---

\(^4\) EU citizens can vote in administrative elections.

\(^5\) Olsen (1965) proposes that individuals are motivated by *selective benefits* (benefits that can be captured only through participation) when they participate in collective action.
in Italy are opening businesses at an impressive rate (opening about 20,000 new firms each year from 2003 to 2007). The rate of increase from 2007 to 2008 was \( \frac{1}{6} \), faster than the native business growth rate (Caritas Dossier Statistico Immigrazione, 2008). These businesses are generating 500,000 jobs (Dossier Statistico, 2009) and establishing clusters of relationships along which their socio-economic activities move.

**Intellectual Contributions**

This work contributes to the literature on civic engagement by (1) producing results that extend what we know about political participation, (2) providing an empirical account of understudied and emerging immigrant populations, and (3) introducing a novel measure for social capital that grounds it firmly in relationships of exchange.

The results of this work extend what we know about social capital and political participation.

Previous research on immigrant political integration in Western Europe attributes most of its growth to individuals’ involvement in voluntary and social activities (Jacobs & Tillie, 2004) which is measured primarily as group membership (Putnam, 2000). Group membership, as this research shows, is important for political participation as it connects group members to those people, groups, and activities that would channel them towards political participation.

Focusing solely on group membership, however, ignores how other human exchanges also enable political participation. Furthermore, this body of research privileges civic associations even as empirical work shows that associational life carries limited importance for most immigrant communities in Europe (Ambrosini, 2005; Caponio, 2005; Jacobs *et al.*, 2004; Schrover and Vermeulen, 2005). More importantly, this
research does not differentiate between political participation within immigrant communities and participation in mainstream/host country politics. As I will illustrate, participation which does not extend beyond the bounds of the ethnic community has limited value for improving migrant capacities.

Immigrant political participation that are limited to immigrant communities may restrict participation elsewhere (Uslaner and Conley, 2003). I consider immigrant collective action as simultaneously occurring in two ‘locations’. The first is within their community - that is their national community. Here co-nationals seek to resolve collective action problems that they confront for themselves. The second is within host society where migrants seek both recognition and representation. Previous work suggests that strong participation within community commonly results in marginalization and social isolation from host society and its institutions (Portes and Sensenbrenner, 1993; Gradstein & Schiff, 2005). In contrast, one of the findings of this research is that, under certain conditions, within community participation can function as a training ground and capacity builder for participation in host society.

My work on migrant political participation confirms that group membership is the most popular vehicle for immigrant political participation. Network analysis and interview records show that immigrants in Rome participate more fully in civil society than they do in other forms of political action (such as protest or voting). This work shows, however, that most of this activity tends to be concentrated within migrant national communities and requires the strong activism of centrally positioned nodes to be mobilized for other purposes. Entrepreneurial networks, in contrast, tend to cross group boundaries.
When I sought out political activists in Rome’s migrant communities, I confirmed my hypothesis that migrant entrepreneurs are underappreciated activists. The findings reported in this work suggest that migrant communities rich in entrepreneurs have higher stocks of social capital and easy-to-mobilize social networks. These are the communities that have advantages in collective action and representation. The resources that entrepreneurs bring or cultivate become even more critical when we consider communities disadvantaged by institutional rules that push them to the margins of society. Finally, this research shows that entrepreneurs are important figures of authority in their ethnic communities, providing the leadership and vision necessary for collective action.

This work provides an empirical account of understudied and emerging immigrant populations. This work joins others in answering the call for empirical research on political activism (Francisco, 2010). The case studies included in this work provide new information on the social organization of three emerging migrant groups in Rome: Bangladeshis, Filipinos and Peruvians. In answering the research questions (above) that stimulated this work, I observed, recorded, and reported the variety of ways in which disadvantaged groups have organized to solve problems for themselves. Previous work has shown that participation varies among ethnicities (Tam Cho, 1999; Garcia Bedolla, 2010) and nationality (Lien, 2004). Not only is there significant divergence in strategies undertaken --- which my research shows is network driven--- (Togleby, 2007), there is also variance in the level of success that these groups experience (Bevelandur&Pendakur, 2010).
This work situates political participation at the meso level, in between individual agency and historically-derived institutions and cultures. Bakkar, (1994) defines the meso level as “the structures which mediate between individuals and the economy such as public sector agencies”. This thesis examines how structurally-produced possibilities ---while operating on human behavior ---- are themselves malleable to human decisions. That is, I look at how social structures condition political participation by situating the individual within a structure of relationships that serve to facilitate or stymie ‘activism’. Social position within a web of relationships is the source of possibilities and potholes in an individual’s opportunity structure (Burt, 2000). Studying political participation at the meso level was facilitated by the employment of social network analysis.

This work introduces a novel measure for social capital.

I accomplish this by uniting the literature on social capital in civic engagement with the literature on social network analysis. Networks allow us to quantify and explore relationships across institutional arrangements and to detect consistencies in behavior. Behavior is bounded not solely by over-arching elite driven institutions (Ramakrishnan and Espenshade, 2001) but also by the social norms within the communities within which the individual is entrenched (Coleman, 1988). This research focuses on how social networks channel participation towards host society politics through the cultivation of social capital.

Social capital has been defined in a number of ways. In this work, social capital is understood to be the value embedded within the structure of human relationships (networks) which can be activated in pursuit of individual and collective interests (Coleman, 1988). The use of social capital in political science was popularized by Robert
Putnam (2000). He proposed that the political capacity of a community was dependent on the accumulation of social capital; an accumulation that results from the community’s civic participation.

I quantify social capital by looking across a set of network attributes that indicate the strength and reach of network ties. A review of the literature on social capital in combination with the literature on social network analysis is used as a guide in employing these measures. This guide can be adapted for application in other studies of social capital.

Studying social capital as networks permits us to overcome some of the important limitations that researchers face when employing alternative frameworks. For example, the current operationalization of social capital as group membership (Putnam, 2000) overlooks social capital that is embedded in other forms of relationships. Additionally, it ignores the multi-dimensionality of relationships and thus fails to captures the variation in utility of social capital.

Organization of the Dissertation

In Chapter I, I develop and explore the theory of entrepreneurial citizenship that undergirds the investigation undertaken in this research. Within this chapter, I take a closer look at the concept of social capital; a construct that has been adopted and applied widely in the social sciences. Most importantly for this investigation, it is a concept that has recently gained leverage in studies of political participation (Lancee, 2010; Putnam, 2000) and is underused in the study of entrepreneurship (Burt, 2000).
Then the dissertation proceeds to a review of methods employed for the completion of the research. The complexity and complication involved in arenas – such as immigration - commonly considered “social problems” makes empirical research necessary for any such inquiry (Glaser, 1967).

In chapter 3, I apply a social construction framework approach to describe and discuss the treatment of migrants in law as a reflection of the country’s socio-political environment. Social construction theory assists in describing the possibilities and constraints that facilitate and challenge migrant political participation. Research on individual and group participation cannot be divorced from an exploration of the socio-political environment within which such action takes place (Francisco, 2010). I then begin to explore how networks produce participation by allowing members of these national communities to “plug into” Italian society.

In the remaining chapters, I look at social and political activities by individuals and groups within the network I developed. In Chapter 4, survey results are employed to discuss ‘who participates’ in varied forms of political activities. Then interview records are used to explore higher cost forms of participation. Because they are very present in these activities, it is here that I begin to explore entrepreneurial participation. I follow with a synthesis of survey results that indicate whom migrants refer to when addressing practical concerns. This analysis permits us to infer a referral network within the migrant community.

In Chapters 5 and 6 I report the findings of the network analysis that I undertook to locate political activity and outcomes in the migrant community which I complement with an
ethnographic report in subsection 5.5. Looking at individualized measures of network location, I compare the capacities for action accruing to nodes as a result of their position in the network (Chapter 5). I follow and conclude with an analysis of network properties of diverse subgroups in the network. These properties are used to understand and compare the social capital stocks that these subgroups possess and to complement the observations that are made in Subsection 5.5.
CHAPTER 1: ON ENTREPRENEURIAL CITIZENSHIP

Entrepreneurial learning, what Kirzner (1973) describes as “the most creative act of discovery learning,” carries many potentialities for both private and public life. Arguably, many of the critical skills that would increase an individual’s capacity to participate in collective action are those same skills that an entrepreneur develops (and improves upon) through the establishment and management of a business. In establishing and managing a business, an entrepreneur gains specialized knowledge about how exchanges are conducted in the host society; the important ‘sape’ fa’ (know how) of day-to-day life (Pardo, 1996).

I begin with the baseline assumption that there is nothing remarkable about entrepreneurial activism. Sidney Verba, Kay Lehman Schlozman and Henry Brady (1995) suggest that political resources (time, money and skills) interact with social structures (recruitment networks) to determine political participation. From their model, we know that political participation requires that actors have political capability (political skills), that actors are interested (engagement in the political system), and that actors have opportunities to act (access to political institutions). In all these things, entrepreneurs may simply fall into a category of advantaged citizens with the necessary resources for participation, nothing new or remarkable.

I do not propose that entrepreneurial activism itself is markedly different from the activism of other citizens. Rather, I propose that the presence of entrepreneurs, the roles that they play in society, and the social networks that they establish permit communities to be better at political mobilization and at addressing collective action problems. Do entrepreneurs promote political participation through their business activities?
case studies of entrepreneurship in transitional economies suggest that they may. These studies indicate that when institutionalized solutions to collective action problems are missing, entrepreneurial exchanges result in the necessary social capital that bolster weakened social institutions such as courts (MacMillan and Woodruff, 2002) and that promote civil society (Neace, 1999).

This work looks specifically at entrepreneurship and social capital accumulation. In order for the individual to choose to participate, the opportunity for choice must exist (Jackson, 2003, Costa & Khan, 2002, Leighley, 1995). As Verba et al write, “Opportunities to exercise skills are not distributed evenly along lines of class, race, or gender. Instead, different institutions provide opportunities for different sets of people. In some cases, the allocation of opportunities to practice civic skills reinforces other processes that create advantage, in others, it counterbalances this process”.

Entrepreneurial activities promote collective action through the accumulation of group level social capital. Previous research has found that not only are communities with high social capital stocks better at solving problems for themselves, they are also better at lobbying the wider community for support and resources (Aldrich, 2010).

If entrepreneurs do increase a community’s social capital, we should find that communities rich in entrepreneurs also possess greater capacities to mobilize and act politically. How do I look at entrepreneurial contributions to social processes? My work unites the literature on social capital in political participation with the literature on social network analysis to study immigrant entrepreneur’s political participation.

The research presented in this thesis was guided by the following research questions:
Question 1. Which activities create the capacity for collective action?

Question 2. Which roles and social positions are advantageous for political participation? And how are entrepreneurs positioned in their communities?

Question 3. Who are the important points of access in migrant communities that can be approached to access state institutions and vice-versa?

Question 4. What structures are conducive to exchange? How do these structures contribute to political mobilization?

1.1 Entrepreneurs as Subjects of Study

The multidimensionality of the concept (Audretsch, 2002), makes delimiting ‘entrepreneurship’ a challenging exercise (Iverson et al., 2008). For simplicity’s sake, I define entrepreneurs by what they do, rather than their personality traits, which is in line with entrepreneurs’ self-definitions (Gartner, 1990). I employ a commonly applied measurement of entrepreneurship, self-employment. More than one-tenth of the adult foreign population in Italy is self-employed.

The availability and comparability of this measure make it a popular measure of entrepreneurship (Audretsch, 2002). As the least demanding measure of business ownership, it encompasses a wide range of activities from single person ventures to large and medium sized businesses. A majority of immigrant businesses tend to manifest in the former arrangement. Therefore not only is self-employment an appropriate measure for this study, it is also the measure that is most likely to capture the breadth of immigrant entrepreneurship in Rome.
1.2 ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND IMMIGRATION

The relationship between ethnic entrepreneurship and social mobility has been studied by political scientists, economists and sociologists (Valdez, 2003). It is an important source of social mobility, if not for first generation migrants, then at least for their children (Borjas, 1994). Moreover, ethnic entrepreneurs are important sources of employment opportunities for co-ethnics who sometimes themselves become entrepreneurs after a period of informal apprenticeship (Zhou, 2004; Portes and Sensenbrenner, 1993; Aldrich and Waldinger, 1990). This has certainly been the case for Chinese immigrants in Italy (Crane, 2004; Ceccagno, 2003). Likewise, the relationship between social mobility and citizenship (political incorporation or political assimilation) has been studied (for a summary see Alba and Nee, 1997). But no study exists that investigates the possible relationship between ethnic entrepreneurship and citizenship.

Looking at immigrant entrepreneurship permits us to study if belonging to and being is dependent on a mixed network within which both business and community interests live. And if the network provides entrepreneurs with motivations to promote community rather than personal (business) interests by supplying a clear demarcation with which to categorize “the Other”. Entrepreneurs have been found to exhibit pro-social preferences that surpass non-entrepreneurs’ (for a review, see Payne and Joyner, 2006) and to employ their economic capacities to benefit their communities (Chaganti and Greene, 2002).

One way to consider the centrality of entrepreneurship to community is to look at the anti-case. In their study of the impacts that absentee business owners have in predominantly black neighborhoods, Reiss and Aldrich (1971) found that while the economic behavior of absentee business owners was no different from ‘local’ or present
business-owners, their social behavior was markedly different. They conclude that, “absentee owners and managers are not as oriented toward the area or local residents as local owners and managers.”

1.3 Using Social Capital to Study Entrepreneurial Political Participation

The Merriam Webster dictionary defines capital as:

- a (1): a stock of accumulated goods especially at a specified time and in contrast to income received during a specified period; also: the value of these accumulated goods (2): accumulated goods devoted to the production of other goods (3): accumulated possessions calculated to bring in income
- b (1): net worth (2): stock
- c: persons holding capital: capitalists considered as a group
- d: advantage, gain
- e: a store of useful assets or advantages

This is the metaphor that social scientists have borrowed to describe how relationships hold value. The idea of capital as used by social scientists suggests that there are dormant asset in our relationships that can be activated when necessary. I treat social capital as a value entrenched in our relationships that can be transformed into tangible assets for the pursuit of individual and collective interests (Coleman, 1988; Putnam, 2000). It eases social and economic transactions and is especially useful in environments where dominant institutional mechanisms for facilitating these exchanges are missing or ill suited (Fukuyama, 2001).

The numerous definitions of Social Capital all have two things in common: (1) they implicate networks --- see discussion in 1.41 below--- (2) they see social capital as a means to an end. That is, social capital produces the mechanisms through which individual (Burt, 2002; Portes, 2001) and group (citation) goals can be achieved. As Putnam (2000) writes, “in general, social capital has many features that help people
transform aspirations into realities”. Social capital stretches a flexible social structure producing windows of opportunity for groups and communities.

The parsed out conceptualization of social capital that I propose here allows us to “conceptually separate resources themselves from the ability of actors to draw upon these resources” (Lee, 2010: 784) in a way that (I would submit) increases the utility of the concept. In his critique of the literature on social capital, Alejandro Portes (2001) noted that different types of capital are valuable for different goals. Similarly, Coleman (1980) observed that the “function” of social capital is what determines its “form”.

Taking a look at the literature on social capital and political participation (function) gives us clues about the mechanisms that may be valuable for political participation. The mechanisms by which goals can be attained vary by definition (see Figure 1.1 Social Capital Mechanisms). One commonality shared by these mechanisms is that they lay dormant until a situation in which their utility becomes apparent presents itself, thus making the metaphor of ‘capital’ appropriate.

It has been proposed that social capital is a critical resource for encouraging participatory acts (Leighley, 1995; Putnam, 2000). It moves political participation through (1) lowering the costs of information dissemination of politically relevant knowledge, know-how, and ideas (Jacobs & Tillie, 2004; La Due Lake & Huckfeldt, 1998), (2) facilitating the cultivation of norms of participation (Leighley, 1995; Putnam, 2000), and (3) establishing and maintaining relationships that promote participation (Aldrich, 2008).
**Institutionalized Relationships**

“Social capital is produced through a series of social interactions and its consequences for individuals must be assessed relative to these interactions” (La Due Lake and Sprague, 1998)

Repeat interactions (Bankston and Zhou, 2001; Fukuyama, 2001)

Group membership (Putnam, 2000; Small, 2009)

Family and Friendship Ties (Coleman, 1980)

Historical and hierarchical relationships (e.g. churches, cultures, governments) (Fukuyama, 2001)

Entrepreneurship (Burt, 2007; Casson & Giusta, 2007; Hoang & Antonic, 2003)

**Form**

“Those expectations for action within a collectivity that affect the economic goals and goal seeking behavior of its members even if these expectations are not oriented toward the economic sphere (Portes & Sensenbrenner, 1993)

- Norms and Values (Fukuyama, 2001; Tsai & Goshal, 1999; Westlund & Bolton, 2003)
- Traditions (Westlund & Bolton, 2003)
- Trust (Smithe and Lorkhe, 2005; Tillie, 2004)
- Information (Reagans and McEvily, 2004; Buskens and Yamaguchi, 1999; Tsai & Goshal, 1999; Sandefur and Laumann, 1990)

**Goal Attainment**

Examples:
- Political participation (Putnam, 2000)
- Healthcare (DeVillanova, 2007)
- Economic Development (Fukuyama, 2001)
These studies focus primarily on *civic engagement* or *group membership* (Costa & Khan, 2002; Putnam, 2000, Jacobs and Tillie, 2004). For example, Small (2009) demonstrated that individuals who regularly interact with local organizations benefit from their unplanned introduction into broader social networks. Civic engagement provides immigrants the opportunity to build trust and relationships with natives and their institutions, thereby aiding integration. Macedo et al. (2005) define civic engagement as “*any activity, individual or collective devoted to influencing the collective life of the polity*”. Through civic participation, citizens gain access to information, skills and opportunities that make them more sophisticated citizens (Putnam, 2000, Leighley, 1995 and Ray, 2002).

Immigrant associations are important for building such relationships. In his survey of immigrant associations in Milan, Casselli (2009) found that immigrant associations are the avenue through which Italian government agencies and political groups make contact with immigrant communities. Today, it is standard practice for local governments to contract work out to these associations. As such, they are often the the primary providers of social programs to their communities (Campani, 2007). Empirical studies show that, in Southern Europe, voluntary organizations are critical for the survival of legal and illegal immigrants alike (Baldwin-Edwards, 2002). Additionally, these organizations often serve as advocates for cultural maintenance and intergroup cooperation.
To summarize, civic engagement builds social capital by (forms):

- Civic engagement is proposed to facilitate information exchange.
  - Group membership promotes horizontal information exchange by providing opportunities by which members may be exposed to new ideas (Putnam, 2000) or cues that reinforce their ideas (Verba et al., 1995). Additionally, in some cases, group membership increases exposure to individuals with some measure of ‘expertise’ on a topic/policy issue (La Due Lake and Sprague, 1998).
  - Group membership promotes communication with political representatives and policy makers. In essence, by putting people together, it amplifies group demands and makes them more noticeable to decision makers (Aldrich, 2010; McClurg et al., 2004; Putnam, 2000; La Due Lake and Sprague, 1998).
  - Finally, exchanges of practical information on how to participate or of political information tend to encourage participation (La Due Lake, 1998; Stamm, Emig, & Hesse, 1997).

- Civic engagement promotes the institutionalization of norms of participation by widening individual awareness of how they share common concerns and how the outcomes of policy affect all of their lives (Putnam, 2000; Aldrich, 2010). An important function as policy preferences seem to be driven by how individuals feel policy outcomes affect their reference groups (Citrin et al., 1997).

- Producing generalized “trust” (de Rooij, 2006; Tillie, 2004) that makes individuals believe that political participation has value and that public institutions respond (positively) to such participation.

There are interesting parallels between the forms of social capital proposed to impel political participation and those that are proposed to promote entrepreneurship; parallels that I explore through this research. The opportunities to transform social capital into economic capital are plentiful (Lancee, 2009; Putnam, 2000). Entrepreneurs have been described as individuals who possess the unique aptitude for recognizing ‘opportunity’ and then turning them into profits (Casson and Giusta, 2007; Kirzner, 1973; Rae, 2007; Schumpeter, 1934). As such, they are among the most adept at transforming social capital into economic capital.

Casson and Giusta (2007) identify three ways in which entrepreneurs make use of social capital:
1. Entrepreneurs use social capital when *Opportunity Seeking*. Opportunities come to entrepreneurs in the form of information (Hoang and Antonic, 2003) or advice and moral support (Salaff and Greve, 2003). The cultivation of information networks is critical at this early stage.

2. Once an opportunity is recognized, entrepreneurs need to mobilize resources. In this stage of *Resource Acquisition*, they need to find suppliers and employees whom they can trust not just to deliver but also to be loyal. Ethnic entrepreneurs tend to be dependent on ‘high density networks’ of co-ethnics who form part of the supply and demand chains necessary for the sustenance of ethnic business. The bonds of these networks are built on reciprocal relationships founded on trust, reputation and repeat interactions. Thus, trust is a necessary social capital input for entrepreneurship (Smith and Lohrke, 2005). By uniting resources under control of different owners, entrepreneurs both lower and absorb the riskiness of a new endeavor (Peters et al., 2010).

3. Finally, entrepreneurs need to build a customer base. When organizing the market, entrepreneurs essentially redirect demand towards their business. Through civic action, ethnic entrepreneurs increase their visibility and improve their standing in the community and in so doing expand their customer base (Chaganti and Greene, 2002; MacDonald and MacDonald, 1964).

The types of social capital mechanisms that entrepreneurs foster and use then promote trust (Smith and Lorkhe, 2005), information exchange (see Huang and Antonic, 2003 for a review), and norms of cooperation and exchange (Casson and Giusta, 2007; Burt, 2000 and 2002; Uzzi, 1997), In fact, entrepreneurs might have advantages over civic associations in promoting political participation in the mainstream stemming from their tendency to produce *mixed embedded* structures.

Observing that some groups promote anti-social, extremist, and anti-democratic values, Theiss Morse and Hibbing (2005) remind scholars studying civic engagement to consider that not all associations promote pro-social values. In fact, groups can sometimes promote exclusive identities that isolate members from society (Fukuyama, 2001; Putnam, 2000, Gradstein and Schiff, 2006). In the immigrant case, membership in ethnic associations can at times serve as a substitute rather than a conduit to mainstream participation (Uslaner and Conley, 2003).
1.4 Using Networks to Study Social Capital

“Unless the social capital concept is used with some degree of precision and in a comparable manner, it will come to have little value as an analytical construct.”
--- Castle, quoted by Robinson et al., 2010: page 1

Recently, the value of ‘social capital’ to social science research has been called into question (Knorringa et al., 2007). Social capital is difficult to encapsulate. It is the least tangible of all forms of capital. The imprecision with which it is measured limits social capital’s use and utility. By its very nature, social capital is ‘jointly owned’ by the parties in which it is embedded (Burt, 1992; Nahapiet & Goshal, 1998), and this creates problems of measurement.

Previous research measures social capital as group membership, particularly in formally structured associations or groups (Putnam, 2000; Lillibacka: 2006; de Rooij, 2011). To produce social capital, there must be sufficient opportunities for interaction to cultivate norms of reciprocity between two actors (Bankston III & Zhou, 2002). Thus, many studies of social capital emphasize institutionalized relationships (Van Oorschot et al., 2006). While a few others have employed alternative measures like trust (Rampersad et al., 2010), group membership remains the dominant operationalization of ‘social capital’. Equating social capital to group membership, however, privileges ‘institutionalized’, formalized relationships and provides a limited picture of social capital.

When social capital is operationalized as group membership, it gains a static rather than dynamic quality. Convenience encourages us to study established rather than emerging groups. We know, however, that social capital is (1) a harbinger of change (Sandefur & Laumann, year), (2) changeable as the relationships that constitute it, and (3) often a
reaction to change (Coleman, 1988). Additionally, there is a tendency to overlook secondhand or third-hand benefits of social capital that are not embedded in direct contacts. For example, one fails to consider the benefit that an activist’s familiares and friends stand to gain from his/her group membership. As such, there is a tendency to see local rather than global effects of social capital. Lastly, many studies of social capital overlook variability of roles within groups and the diversity between groups. These studies consider social capital as having the same ‘quality’ despite important differences in group activity, tenure in a group, intensity of involvement, competing activity, and group goals. A church choir, for example, possesses different qualities and potentialities than a chess club. In sum, the current tools employed to measure social capital are inadequate for studying its ‘mechanics’.

Network analysis can remedy these empirical shortcomings. The methods of network analysis provide techniques and tools useful for gaining clarity on the components of ‘social capital’ discussed here and promise to provide a different, more nuanced and encompassing explanation for political mobilization.
A number of leading definitions and descriptions of social capital involve the idea of networks:

“an individual's personal network and elite institutional affiliations” (Belliveau et al., 1996, p. 1572)

“the sum of the resources, actual or virtual, that accrue to an individual or a group by virtue of possessing a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition” (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 119)

“the brokerage opportunities in a network” (Burt, 1997, p. 355)

“the process by which social actors create and mobilize their network connections within and between organizations to gain access to other social actors' resources” (Knoke, 1999, p. 18)

“the ability of actors to secure benefits by virtue of membership in social networks or other social structures” (Portes, 1998, p. 6)

“the sum of the actual and potential resources embedded within, available through, and derived from the network of relationships possessed by an individual or social unit. Social capital thus comprises both the network and the assets that may be mobilized through that network” (Nahapiet & Ghoshal, 1998, p. 243)

“social capital refers to the norms and networks that enable collective action” (World Bank Website)

However, network analysis is rarely employed in studies of social capital (McClurg, 2003), particularly in the field of policy studies.

I introduce a Social Network Analysis–based measure of social capital to illustrate how individuals, foremost entrepreneurs, cultivate political resources for their communities through their activities. I build on the work of Ronald Burt (2000) to propose a social network–based recruitment model where group membership is both an outcome and a determinant of action.
The beauty of network analysis is that it understands one’s access to resources beyond one’s immediate contacts. Rather, networks place value on one’s contacts and one’s contact’s contacts. As Hanneman and Riddle (2005) propose, “one advantage of network thinking and method is that it naturally predisposed the analyst to focus on multiple levels of analysis AND most social network analysts think of individual persons as being embedded in networks that are embedded in networks.”

**Figure 1.2 Examples of Small Networks**

The location and structure or relationships matter for meaningful exchanges (Borgatti et al., 2009). Figure 1.2 *Examples of Small Networks* allows us to compare network structures for three simple networks. Each of the three networks illustrated in the figure contains the same number of individuals, eight. However, the structures are different and thus their potentialities and promise are different.

Figure A is a completely connected network. Each of the nodes is connected to one another thus resources may be exchanged quickly in this network. However, because it shows no connections to the outside, few new resources are ever introduced into this network. Network B is just as bounded as network A except with two individuals with connection to an out-group individual. Thus, while resources still circulate quickly in this
network, the out-group connection sometimes introduces new resources into the group. Figure C is the network with the lowest density (smallest number of in-group connections) and the highest access to out-group resources. This is the most entrepreneurial of networks as it increases the potential for combination and exchange while maintaining connectivity (notice that each member of this network is within “one” relationship of reaching another. That is, June may not know April, but since she knows Tim, who knows April, she may still access April (and her resources) via Tim.

The debate regarding the ideal network structure for pursuing opportunities continues. When all the relationships within a network are direct and when each member of the network knows each other, the network can be described as “closed”. In such a network, the ties are dense and the trust is “thick” (Coleman, 1988). Thus rules are easier to enforce because penalties are easier to impose on ‘findable’ targets (Habyarimana et al, 2007). The resultant “thick trust” enables members of closed networks to work together to overcome shared challenges. For immigrants, membership in a community of co-ethnics can be instrumental for survival, especially in the early years of immigration (Borjas, 1994, Djajic, 2003; MacDonald and MacDonald, 1965; and Portes and Sensenbrenner, 1993). The type of social capital cultivated by members of a closed network is often referred to as bonding social capital.

While a closed network fosters norms of reciprocity that enable members to work together to overcome shared challenges by building enforceable trust (Coleman, 1988), it also produces homogeneous information and predisposes a community to repetition and replication rather than innovation (Walker et al., 1997). It may also serve to reinforce
group identities in ways that further marginalize communities (Portes and Sensenbrenner, 1993; Fitzpatrick, 1974). As Uslaner and Conley (2003) observe, “People with strong ethnic identifications and who associate primarily with people of their own kind will either withdraw from civic participation or will belong to only organizations made up of their own nationality.”

In contrast, a network with structural holes allows its members to gain access to new information and work with new partners in achieving their goals (Burt, 1992). Relationships outside the closed network form what is called the wide social network. The links within these networks can be strong or weak, direct or indirect. The social capital built on relationships to members of groups/institutions to which one does not belong is called bridging social capital. ‘Bridges’ form opportunities for economic gain (Lancee, 2010). It is commonly thought that these weak ties are infinitely more valuable in creating economic and social opportunities (Granovetter, 1973; Lancee, 2010; Putnam, 2000) than ties within a closed network.

Nevertheless, access to new information and opportunities are not useful when the types of social relationships that foster cooperation through network closure are missing (Burt, 1998; Gargiuglio and Benassi, 2006). For example, Djajic (2003) observes that while the tendency of immigrants to cluster together along national (and even to some extent provincial) lines reflects the incompleteness of their integration, it is these community structures that provide the stable environment which supports the academic performance and economic success of the second generation. Moreover, the ability to create new ties that bring information and resources is facilitated by some degree of cohesion (Kenis and
Knoke, 2002). Given that most individuals belong to multiple networks characterized by both closure and structural holes, it is useful to understand networks as possessing both qualities.

I employ the metaphor of a tree. Utilizing network measures, I propose to study the social structures in the network that I have constructed during my period of fieldwork in Rome, Italy (see Chapter 2) to compare social capital forms and functions within this migrant community. My research suggests that the most favored bridging nodes are those who have deep roots, those who are deeply bonded in migrant group and community. These stable ethnic ties signal the legitimacy and access that their Italian contacts seek. Roots provide material benefits, but, more importantly, stability and dependability. These anchoring relationships (Weber, 2001) direct decision making and are a guarantee in cases of risk. For political mobilization, weak ties bring in the resources around which people mobilize, while cohesive ties supply the people to mobilize. Through their activities entrepreneurs are likely to manifest the relationship structures necessary to pursue both business and social goals. This investigation allows us to understand how entrepreneurs are positioned within and produce benefits for their communities in terms of political participation.
1.5 CONCLUSION

In the following sections we explore the answer to the research questions of this study.

Question 1. Which activities create the capacity for collective action?

In Chapter 4, I discuss political activism located within the mainstream community (voting and protest) as well as activism located within the immigrant community. Looking at these activities I describe the mobilization potential in the three immigrant communities under study (a discussion which is expanded in Section 5.5), and also compare the values each activities hold for the eventual integration of immigrant groups in Italy.

Question 2. Which roles and social positions are advantageous for political participation? And how are entrepreneurs positioned in their communities?

This is a question which I explore throughout the dissertation. However, the most thorough exploration of this question is made in chapter 5 when I study the network position of individual nodes within the network and then proceed to discuss their social positions and how these are valued by their co-ethnics and by Italians.

Question 3. Who are the important points of access in migrant communities that can be approached to access state institutions and vice-versa?

I begin to address this question early on in the dissertation, in Chapter 3’s discussion of Italian intermediaries and proceed to look (in Chapter 4,5, and 6) at Immigrant nodes who serve as points of access.

Question 4. What structures are conducive to exchange? How do these structures contribute to political mobilization?

By comparing the structures for social capital in Chapter 6, I both develop and apply a tool to address this and similar questions.
CHAPTER 2: METHODS OF STUDY

This research employs multiple research techniques and analytical tools to study migrant entrepreneurship and political participation. Like all studies that concern social problems, this study is affected by issues that stem from the very nature of the subject under study. The subjects and behaviors that interest this research “raise problems of secrecy, sensitivity, taboo topics, stigma, and legality, and because people in these situations are usually adept at covering the facts when necessary,” (Glaser, 1965, p. 436) thus, traditional data collection methods are unsatisfactory.

One challenge lies in the dearth of reliable data on immigrants (Castles, 2000). In Italy, the data on immigrants reported by the national census (ISTAT) is rife with inconsistencies in data collection (Mudu, 2006) and inadequacies in reporting. As such, it was necessary to collect this study’s information first hand.

The approach employed here was patterned after the ethnosurvey (Massey, 1987) which pairs qualitative methods with survey methods in an ‘interactive’ design. In the ethnosurvey, findings from one methodology inform and influence the design and conduct of other methods in subsequent rounds (see as described in Figure 2.1. Fieldwork Map). Unlike the ethnosurvey, this research was not conducted in both home and host countries. Rather, I spent a total of 12 months in Italy from 2010 until 2011, 7 on site in Rome and five in Torino, to collect information through surveys, interviews, and observation.

In all, this study employed five research methods: content analysis (CA), qualitative interviews (QI), semi-structured surveys (SSS), ethnographic research (ER) and social
network analysis (SNA). Survey research permits the comparison of entrepreneurial political participation and non-entrepreneurial political participation pointing to areas for more in-depth inquiry. Network analysis has been applied to locate and examine ‘loci’ of organizational capacity within the three immigrant networks studied and to understand how these clusters of relationships are mobilized in private and public pursuits. Survey methods are then employed to validate the network. Finally, qualitative methods (participant observation, qualitative interviews, and content analysis) are employed to explain the patterns of behavior that have been identified and examined using network analysis and surveys.

**Figure 2.1 Fieldwork Map**

This ethnosurvey-based research design comfortably falls into what Tashakkori & Cresswell (2007) call “true mixed methods” where separate streams of information flow in from different methodological directions and meld into one. Figure 2.1 *Fieldwork Map*
provides a diagrammatic depiction of this process. Many times, moving forward (for example with interviews) provided information that guided the refinement of another aspect of data collection, such as preparing surveys. This approach also facilitated the employment of multiple lenses through which to view and undertake the research project.

Table 2.1 *Mapping Questions to Methods* maps the methods used to the guiding questions of the research. Each lens provided both new insights and a built-in method of triangulation to validate findings to ensure reliability.

### Table 2.1 Mapping Questions to Methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Question</th>
<th>CACA</th>
<th>QI</th>
<th>SSS</th>
<th>ER</th>
<th>SNA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 1. Which activities create the capacity for collective action?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1.1 How does mobilization unfold in various migrant communities?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1.2 Is social capital relevant for mobilization?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 2. Which roles and social positions are advantageous for political participation? And how are entrepreneurs positioned in their communities?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 3. Who are the important points of access in migrant communities that can be approached to access state institutions and vice-versa?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3.1 How do critical network actors behave?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 4. What structures are conducive to exchange? How do these structures contribute to political mobilization?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4.1 What network characteristics are important for mobilization?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*where CACA = computer aided content analysis; QI = qualitative interviewing; SSS = semi-structured surveys; ER = ethnographic research; SNA = social network analysis

**Participant Observation.** Altheid (1987: p.66) defines ethnography as “the description of people and their culture.” I conducted ethnography through participant observation. I participated in the day-to-day lives of immigrants by visiting them in their place of work, at their homes, and also as they were participating in community events such as festivals, embassy meetings, and worshipping at mosques or churches. My daughter and I lived for a week in the home of one of my informants, an Adjunct Councilor (elected migrant representative) and businessman, and my daughter attended a nursery that is managed by an ethnic association. I attended over 14 celebrations, half a dozen meetings and
assemblies at the City of Rome, worked at a service desk with a large trade union, and visited and sat in stalls at five markets featuring varied levels of ethnic business. Additionally, I volunteered for an ethnic association, shadowed an association head, and taught English to the Ambassador and staff at one of the embassies for a South American country.

From the aforementioned activities, I was able to understand the extent to which relationships operated in the network I had constructed. For example, I learned that informal agreements and arrangements move exchange more than formal ones. I learned that the park --- where mothers go to meet other mothers --- is also where these parents make agreements to exchange practical favors like baby sitting or translations. I learned that while formal businesses are few, informal businesses abound and operate in migrant gathering spaces, even religious spaces. I also learned that no matter how wired a community is, the preferred method for passing important information is in person over a hot tea or a coffee.

More importantly, I learned that there is a business in service. During my time in Rome, I observed that same pathology that Francisco (2010) observes in his empirical study of leaders of revolutions. That is, there is a profit to be made in helping others. And oftentimes a profit in social status transforms itself into remuneration. In a labor market characterized by blocked mobility (Portes et al., 2007), associations make an alternative path to economic mobility.
I also observed my subjects on electronic social networks. I learned that Facebook was the space where many Filipino association heads communicated with association members. Because a good number of Filipinos live with their employers, meeting with co-nationals must happen on days off of work. However, electronic social networks permit them to stay connected. Other national groups are differently constrained and also considerably less enthusiastic in employing social network interfaces for organizing and informing.
The information gathered through observation was both complete and challenging to encapsulate systematically. Participant observation permitted me to see social capital in action—that same social capital that was described in interviews and located by the network model. It permitted me to, as Peshkin (1988: p.417) describes, “first, bring the complete range of our senses to our investigation; sufficient time in which to be attentive; and third, the breadth of scope, that is the fullness of what we are able and willing to attend to.”

**Surveys**, an important tool for research into immigration, are commonly employed in migration research to compensate for inadequate or missing data (Aldrich & Waldinger, 1990; Fawcett & Arnold, 1987). The study focuses on the political, social and economic activities of working age, first-generation immigrants. To collect the information necessary to compare the political behavior and social networks of immigrant...
entrepreneurs to immigrants with non-entrepreneurial occupations, a survey of working-age (18-64 years old) first-generation immigrants was conducted.

Like other surveys on migration, convenience sampling was employed. Given the absence of systematically produced data about the target population, making the necessary calculations to achieve scientific sampling requirements (Ho & Biggeri, 2005, p. 246) was not possible. For example, rudimentary aspects such as ‘locating’ targets were complicated because of target mobility. One interview subject reflecting on the difficulty of campaigning in Rome observed, “nobody knows where immigrants are, not even consiglieri!”6 The difficulties in reaching subjects was the first important challenge for this research.

Thus, the Roman neighborhood with the highest concentration of non-EU migrant residents, the Esquilino was selected for the site where the survey instrument (a mix of closed and open-ended questions) would be administered. The survey was conducted during the daytime (between the hours of 10:00 to 18:00).

Each survey required an average of 15 minutes to complete. Data collection was undertaken in English, Tagalog, and Italian. All surveys were conducted face-to-face to avoid attrition and non-response bias. While introducing selection and other forms of bias, this recruitment strategy resulted in much higher response rates than random selection would have. That is, conducting face-to-face surveys decreased the likelihood of non-response because of non-cooperation (Nicoletti & Peracchi, 2005) by reducing the ‘costs’ of responding to the survey.

---

6 Consiglieri [Aggiunti] are migrant representatives to the City of Rome elected by the city’s legal immigrants.
This strategy proved to be fruitful. The survey was undertaken by a single interviewer to reduce the variance produced by differential responses to different interviewers. Surveys were refused in 37 of the cases (the response rate was 82.9 percent). In the end, 180 subjects agreed to a survey interview, and 40 of the resulting surveys were discarded because they were incomplete.

Because of the sampling technique and the small number of responses, the generalizability of findings from the surveys is easily called into question. Additionally, I am an Asian woman of Filipino and Vietnamese descent possessing recognizable Filipino features. This impacted some respondents’ willingness to participate in the survey, positively in the case of Filipinos and less positively for other national groups, like Eastern Europeans and Africans. Thus, this survey does not tell us very much about two important non-EU migrant groups in Italy, Africans and Eastern Europeans. These groups are important members of the migrant community in Italy that have (and continue to) experienced important instances of racial branding and ostracization.

What this survey does provide is some information about a set of understudied and visibly emerging non-EU migrant populations in Rome and within the region of Lazio: East Asians, South Asians, and Latinos. Not only is there significant and unstudied variation in the social and political behavior between migrant groups (de Rooij, 2011), the ‘relevant’ determinants of these behaviors also vary along ethnic, racial, cultural, and national ties (Garcia-Bedola, 2004; Lien, 2004). The survey provides valuable clues about the political behaviors of migrants. In many cases, the result of the qualitative fieldwork provides further evidence in support of survey results. Notwithstanding, the
survey still provides the necessary information to assist in characterizing how individuals participate and, to some extent, why they participate.

As the amount and accessibility of survey data increases, studies of ‘social problems’ have moved from qualitative methods to quantitative methods (Howland et al., 2006). Capturing the complexity of migrant political participation in Rome, however, would be difficult to achieve given Rome’s position within a nation whose approach to migration has been uniquely conditioned by multi-state institutions that emerged contemporaneously to the nation’s shift from sending to receiving state and to the proximity, both geographically and politically, of the Vatican City. Thus, other methods are necessary to complete the picture of participation in Rome.

THE QUALITATIVE INTERVIEWS AND ETHNOSURVEY

A broad range of activities fall under the label ‘qualitative research’. When qualitative methods are discussed, they are often described vis-à-vis how they ‘stand up to’ quantitative research. This can be dissatisfying as the logic underpinning qualitative research may be discordant with those of quantitative processes (Peshkin, 1998). Ambert et al. (1995) identify “depth rather than breadth” as the goal of qualitative research. This ‘double fitting’ process “where researchers generate conceptual images of their settings, and then shape and reshape them according to their ongoing observations thus enhancing the validity of their developing conceptualization” (Peshkin, 1988) produces reach observation invaluable to theory development.

Moving beyond the qualitative-quantitative dichotomy one must consider that qualitative methods are richly diverse and produce different types of knowledge. A unifying trait of
qualitative inquiry is the space it gives complexity in the study of human behavior. The flexibility of qualitative methods allows simultaneous study of multiple procedures and behaviors at different levels of inquiry (Ambert et al., 1995).

Content analysis has been described as a technique that “aims at describing with optimum objectivity, precision, and generality, what is said on a given subject in a given place, at a given time” (Lasswell, Lerner, & Pool, 1952). This analytic technique assists the researcher to make sense of textual data by uncovering patterns in words and meanings.

Language and patterns in language reflect the tone, direction, and intensity of public attention (Dowling & Kabanoff, 1996) on a topic. For the study of policy and politics, content analysis permits the identification of (1) a range of themes, topics and ideas that the news media have associated with a policy issues and (2) the different ‘publics’ implicated by the emergence of these policy issues. The method is not simple to apply. As Graber (1923) writes, content analysis “involves a complex, implicit, simultaneous analysis of the total societal context in which the communication has occurred, an evaluation of each of the communications and of their interactions, and judgments concerning the long and short term objectives of communication.”

Content analysis is useful for process tracing. It allows us to observe how themes/categories/frames evolve through time and the importance of ‘events’ in producing mutations in language use. Robert Greene (2011) reminds us that “words are shifting—together, as part of a system—all the time.” By following the discourses on immigration we can trace the development of language and meaning.
Content analysis also points the researcher’s attention to what is not said. However, understanding the absence of rhetoric requires a certain level of familiarity with the populations being studied. Silence may indicate lack of public interest in an issue. Alternatively, unspoken words may reflect hegemonic cultural practices. As Graber (1923) observes, “one delicate aspect of learning the cultural context of verbal behavior is to comprehend what elements of communication are not verbalized because they are presumably well known.” Background knowledge of ‘entities’ included in text (people, organizations, places) is critical for making interpretations grounded in the reality that text is being used to describe. Therefore, it is recommended that researchers possess this knowledge a priori and seek, with awareness, to keep cultural practices in mind, or they must find ways to familiarize themselves with these cultures. I accomplished this through a period of immersion which involved ethnographic research.
The methodology has some important limitations. Content analysis provides limited information about the effectiveness of policy messages. While content analysis can locate ‘messages’ within text and even identify both sender and target of messages, it cannot tell us how messages are received and perceived (Howland et al., 2006; Dowling & Kabanoff, 1996). Each receiver digests information through their own perceptual screen that conditions how information is interpreted and absorbed (Gamson, 1992). A second concern when conducting content analysis has to do with coding. Coding can be a subjective process. It relies greatly on a researcher’s judgment on what themes to consider and what ideas to include or exclude from these themes. Commonly, a second pair of eyes, or a second coder, can be employed to cross check a coder’s work.

However, because methods for cross-checking are not perfect, researchers working with content analysis must cultivate a certain level of confidence and comfort in work that is colored to some degree by the analyst’s perspective. Once categories have been determined, software packages can aid with computer-aided content analysis (Altheid, 1987). Computer-aided content analysis minimizes the number of subsequent ‘mistakes’

“Consciousness can never be anything else but conscious existence, and the existence of individuals is their actual life process… This means that considerations of language, public opinion, and media are necessary elements of any explanation of the material or intellectual and spiritual growth of society and provide central themes for discussing those social, economic, and political processes that help shape the human environment.” Hardt, H. 2001
that can result from researcher bias, such as the tendency to overemphasize positive results and to overlook contradictory cases or evidence (Lowe, 2003).

Content analysis for this project unfolded in five stages: building a newsbank, thematic analysis, word frequency analysis, conceptual content analysis and relational content analysis.

**Building a Newsbank** Howland et al. (2006) propose that news accounts can be considered “an immediate first draft of history.” The most complete accounts of immigration in Italy have been recorded and reported by the news media. This work looks at how the political participation of migrants is conditioned by overarching structures, namely social and opportunity structures. Because the historical, institutional, and political arrangements in place determine the migrant’s opportunity structure, an examination of these arrangements was necessary.

While readership of Italian newspapers is low, the contents of the news media still stand as a reflection of public concerns and elite driven responses to these concerns. The level of attention given to policy issues in the news is a reflection of the ‘intensity’ of public opinion on the issue. Simple comparisons of the number of times an issue appears relative to other issues on the news and where they are placed in a publication are indicative of the centrality of that issue to the Italian collective consciousness. Additionally, and relevant to this research, it permits an evaluation of how policy makers, so called *policy entrepreneurs*, manipulate media messages to direct public concern in ways that favor their preferred policy outcomes.
Contemporaneous to the exploratory fieldwork in Rome, I began collecting and reviewing newspaper articles from the newspapers, *Il Messaggero and Il Manifesto*, which are based in Rome and two additional national newspapers, *Il Giornale* and *La Reppublica*. In the end, analysis included in the study was confined to articles published in *La Reppublica*. This newspaper was selected for a practical reason: compared to the other news outlets, data was easy to access in a systematic manner. The newspaper gives its readers access to an archive of all articles published in their newspaper since 1984. The internet-based interface (which is available for free) is simple to use and allows readers to ‘call’ articles by topic, then to sort them by year, month, location, and personalities.

The preliminary review and cataloguing of newspaper materials proved multiplicatively beneficial. It brought clarity to key concepts that were considered in earlier stages of research. Additionally, it was instructive in the process of instrument development (especially for elite interviews), in subject identification, and to cross-check findings from the surveys and interviews.

**Analysis** Two types of content analysis were employed: (1) *thematic analysis*, where I searched through the articles to find key themes in the text and (2) *word counts*, where all words featured in the selection of articles were counted (see frequency table below) for preliminary analysis.

Word frequency analysis is a count of all words that appear in a selected text or selection of text (Lowe, 2003). It assists in validating and strengthening the selection of categories.

---

7 The online archive of La Reppublica can be found at: [http://ricerca.repubblica.it/repubblica](http://ricerca.repubblica.it/repubblica)
constructed through thematic analysis. While the software package employed in the analysis, NVivo and AtlasTI, permitted automated word frequency counts, I began by selecting 10 articles for a ‘manual’ word frequency count. I did this because most of the software packages that are available are designed primarily for analysts who are working with documents written in English.

Having a familiarity with the pre-existing background of words (in this case achieved through reading and examining text) is instructive when interpreting the results of quantitative content analysis (Cardillo et al., 2011). Words are often used interchangeably. Performing the counts by hand permitted an initial assessment of patterns where nuances in tone could be considered. A measure of ‘intensity’ (frequency) can be easily underrepresented if one does not have a good grasp of the background. For example, Roberto Marroni, Ministero Del Interno...Viminale etc. all refer to the same person, or the term ‘regolare’, which typically means ‘regular’, switches meaning to ‘documented’ when speaking of immigration. Thus, we may miss or overemphasize a point if using computer software. Manual counts allow us to be conscious of the degree to which our estimates may be erroneous. Additionally, by doing counts manually a researcher can also track how words are used in combination with one another—an exercise helpful for progress toward the second stage of content analysis, that is the development of a synonym list and lemmatization.

In all, the word frequency analysis illuminated interesting aspects about the nature of Italian responses to immigration. It provided information about how migrants were being

---

8 A process that “removes the grammatical structure from a word, leaving only the stem; words are then counted as identical when they share a stem” (Lowe, 2003).
characterized and what ‘solutions’ were being proposed to address the problems resulting from immigration. For example, the chart below counts the number of times a location was mentioned in the articles analyzed. These frequency counts indicate that immigration is seen as an issue that affects the region rather than the city. Another interesting piece of information is that the European community is seen as a significant location for issues related to immigration.

**Figure 2.2 Word Frequency Count: Places**

In content analysis, *thematic analysis* or ‘coding’ involves the cataloguing of words or phrases that represent a concept. It involves the identification of themes, which was done by reading, examining, and comparing a subsample of 12 articles (with an article randomly selected for each month of the year). A frame (or coding process) was defined and designed by close examination of a collection of randomly selected articles that feature the words ‘stranieri’ (foreigners) and ‘immigrati’ (immigrants) using a sample of articles published in each month of 2009. The year 2009 was selected because it was the year in which the most recent national level amendment to migration policy, the *Security*
Act, was passed. Thus, it is a period when I could take advantage of high levels of ‘public attention’ given to the issue at this point in time. As the year progresses from January to December, I tracked how the discourses on immigration changed and how groups (from grassroots movements to the European Union) mobilized to impact proposed policy changes.

This was followed by ‘category frequency analysis’ (Lowe, 2003). Category frequency analysis involves the mapping of words appearing in each article to these concepts within each theme. The resulting dictionary of codes includes codes which allow for entity recognition that considers the variety of ways entities are referenced in the newspaper articles.

**Qualitative Interviews**

In total, 85 qualitative interviews were conducted for this project. In an ‘elite interview’, the selection of the interview respondent is purposive and based on the subject’s occupation, position, or experience that grants him/her the ability to add greater context and information. Hochschild (2009) says: “instead, intensive interviews should focus just on doing just what surveys cannot do, that is finding out how people frame their views, and how they make connections, or demonstrate disjunctions among discrete opinions.” I began a series of interviews with experts on Italian immigration (such as researchers at Iniziative e Studi sulla Multietnicita (ISMU) and Dossier Statistico Immigrazione (IDOS), journalists, and service providers (administrators of the neighborhood sportelli, embassies, and NGO groups). Like the Newsbank, the interviews served multiple purposes. They provided contextual information, important for situating my analysis in
the institutional and practical realities of immigrant life in Rome, and allowed me to identify important opportunities for participant observation. These interviews permitted me to further develop some of the ideas that I began to lay out in earlier stages of research design and contributed to the theoretical framework of this study. Additionally, through these interviews, I gained greater access to communities of interest.

Interviews were transcribed and then placed into an interview form (See Appendix A). This interview form was later employed to perform constant comparative analysis. Glaser and Strauss (1967) developed the method. Glaser (1965) defines it in the following way:

“the constant comparative method is concerned with generating and plausibly suggesting (not provisionally testing) many properties and hypotheses about a general phenomenon...[and] since no proof is involved, the constant comparative method does not require consideration of all data, nor is data restricted to one kind of clearly defined case.”

Steps in the constant comparison method:

1. Comparing incidents applicable to each category
2. Integrating categories and their properties
3. Delimiting the theory
4. Writing the theory

Initial elite interviews also served as the base of a snowball sample for follow-up intensive interviews on political behavior. Fifteen initial subjects were identified (via referral from the City’s office on multi-cultural programming –Roma Multietnica) and recruited to participate in a series of semi-structured interviews. These subjects identified important relationships within their information network. Besides describing the types of information they routinely distributed and received, they discussed the frequency and modalities through which this information is exchanged.
These fifteen initial subjects provided the information necessary for constructing the information network presented here using a snowball sampling technique (Hanneman & Riddle, 2005). The resulting network maps 396 nodes with information about the direction of relationships and different attributes of nodes, ties, and modalities of communication. This method is employed to trace information (and other exchanges) back to its sources. The second question of how each node passes information forward was employed to cross-check the resulting network.

By employing the methodology of graph theory, *Network Analysis* allows us to study the patterns of exchange in a system of relationships. It helps us understand how individuals extract value from their social networks. To begin with, the clustering of relationships in a network can help us identify the loci of ‘activity’ in a social structure. Additionally, the presence (and therefore also the absence), direction, and strength of relationships (or “ties”) between actors (or nodes) provides information about the location of power and opportunity within a network. Ties (or relationships) indicate the possibility of accessing resources and, perhaps, producing exchanges that add value whilst the strength of ties may be a source of both cooperation or pressure/discipline --- *cooperation* is a voluntary behavior where exchanges are mutually beneficial, while *discipline* is involuntary behavior where ‘compliance’ comes at a considerable personal cost to the disciplined actor even while providing a gain to that actor’s reference group.
The elite network that was constructed is critical for understanding political mobilization. It is the network through which representation takes place/is actualized (Klanderman & Oegema, 1987). Elite networks are equivalent to those interlocking directorates described where “trust can travel ... and by doing so increase” (Fennema & Tillie, 1999). Another way to think about elite networks are as communities of practice (Leighley & Arnold, 1999) that have shared communication channels, language, and procedures.

Developments in graph theory permit us to employ techniques that identify clusters of relationships within a network. Ethnographic and survey data permit the validation of reported and recorded relationships and to understand if the mathematical techniques of SNA produce the same results (identification of groups) as observation.
The methods used to collect data for this paper, snowball sampling, can introduce bias as it, “may tend to overstate the ‘connectedness’ and ‘solidarity’ of populations of actors” (Hanneman & Riddle, 2005). Another, more challenging limitation of snowball sampling is that it fails to locate unconnected (isolates) or poorly connected (pendants) nodes in the network. I try to address this limitation by supplementing the ‘targeted’ interviews with some of the survey findings. Survey respondents identified the individuals and/or organizations where they would refer friends seeking information on childcare, employment, language courses, and documents (permits to stay). It is through these surveys that we can understand how migrants access the elite network.

**CONCLUSION**

I believe that this multi-method approach permitted me to systematically analyze the political mobilization of migrants without losing the contextual richness of the conditions under which these mobilizations are taking place. Appropriately mixed qualitative observation lends context while quantitative observation lends generalizability. This multi-method approach permits the researcher to overcome some important limitations of research on migrant socio-political participation. Namely, it offsets limitations related to data availability, reliability, and validity that create questions of inference. Built in tools, such as triangulation and member checks, are a natural part of some of the methods employed. For example, the qualitative interview design, when conscientiously undertaken “requires substantial amount of preparation” to give the researcher “credibility and ability to seek response” (Hochschild, 2009).
In preparation for interviews, third person accounts, newspapers, and the Internet were employed and synthesized to procure the most usable information out of each sitting. Third person accounts were enabled because the egocentric network approach employed in selecting interviewees called for a snowball sample. Snowball sampling permitted me to collect third person accounts on subjects before interviews, while follow-up interviews permitted the triangulation and corroboration of information given by subjects found later in the snowball sampling frame.

I am confident that the collection and analysis of data from multiple sources provides a built-in system of triangulation and ‘member checks’ within the research that makes part of all phases of fieldwork from data collection to coding to the analysis of codes. Thus, the results presented in subsequent chapters are, in my assessment, reliable and generalizable; built on a rigorous research programme that allowed me to study context and causality simultaneously.
CHAPTER 3: POLITICAL DISCOURSE AND MIGRANT-NETWORK RESPONSES

“Politics is obviously fueled by word power.”

-- Betty Graber, 1923

A word both carries and imposes meaning. Words may deliver multiple messages at a time. Words are very powerful instruments. They can convey hope, incite fear, and induce laughter and levity. The use of symbolism and imagery in political discourse may bring messages about ‘opportunity’ or ‘threat’.

Migrants in Italy combat a language that stereotypes immigrants as intellectually and culturally inferior. The adoption of the derogatory phrase ‘vu compra’, for example, assigns an identity of marginality, poverty, precariousness, and ignorance to immigrant workers from North Africa. The term is said to come from a mispronunciation of Neapolitan dialectal phrase for “do you want to buy?” by early Moroccan migrants (Andall, 1990). It typifies the immigrant as ignorant and of low education and abilities.

While the phrase may have disappeared from print media (Scortino & Colombo, 2004), it lingers in the memory of Italians and the national groups it was most commonly associated with. Touching on the sensitive phrase, Informant 795, a Moroccan businessman, recounted an incident that for him reflects the pervasiveness of *vu cumpra* in the Italian discourse on migration.

“They called them Macaroni. We have the rotole; rotole means all Italo-American migrants. We organized a convention which featured Italian-Americans; a convention in Pescara.... They wrote, “Rotoli”....on the program. I took a picture of it because it made an impression on me. They wrote, “Macaroni and Vu Compra”. What I liked is that this gentleman from Rai who is a writer,
who has been to Morocco and to Africa, to many countries, the first thing he said was, “look, I agree with everything except with the title of the program, I disagree with this ‘Vu Compra.’” He did not say I disagree with Macaroni. He said I disagree with Vu Compra. Vu compra diminishes the identity of these people who have experienced horrible things to be here.iii (2011, own translation)

Stereotypes are closely tied to policy preferences. These often-negative generalizations impinge upon information processing and influence policy outcomes (Burns&Gimpel, 2000).

In this chapter, I describe the socio-political environments that confront immigrants in Italy. Theories of group mobilization consider the socio-political environment as salient to political activity (Miller et al., 1981; Turner, 1982). These conditions result from and reinforce the institutional arrangements that promote or inhibit participation (Bobo & Gillam, 1990; Ramakrishnan & Espenshade, 2001).

I employ a social construction framework to guide this exploration. The framework suggests that policy-making begins with the definition of a problem followed by the placement of the problem in the public arena. Problems are “interpretations of conditions that have been subjectively defined as problematic and as such, deserve some type of ameliorative action” (Ingram et al. in Sabatier, 2007, p. 94). In Italy, the project of “immigration as a problem” began with the increasing visibility of the migrant community. These phenotypically and culturally distinct newcomers meet the basic requirement for identifying a group as a problem: they are a clearly delineable target group (Nicholson-Crotty & Meier, 2005).

The content analysis performed for this study indicates that immigration is an emerging problem of increased importance. Italians seem to feel that these are problems that are best dealt with by the State. Immigrants, like other groups or factions are subject to a set
of constructions (positive and negative) which indicate their position in society (Schneider & Ingram, 1993). Over the last fifteen years, their presence has been increasingly politicized and selected for ‘social blame’. These social constructions have implications for the immigrant political participation.

3.1 Method of Study

Textual analysis, such as this analysis of news records, is a common method for capturing and analyzing social constructions. Given the importance of news as a source of political information (MacLeod et al., 1999; Branton&Dunaway, 2009) news items and other textual records are commonly utilized in social construction research (Schneider & Ingram, 1993).

I treat newspaper articles as a form of historical record where the mood of the nation towards immigrants is encapsulated. To study the most recently adopted policy on immigration in Italy, the Security Act, I perform content analysis on the articles published in 2009, the year that the act was adopted by the Italian government. Policy is a common way in which many citizens encounter politics (Hibbing & Theiss-Morse, 2001). The social construction framework connects the socio-political environment, as captured by policy, to the observed political behavior of immigrants which is reported here using records from the ethnography and interviews.
3.2 **Immigration as an Emerging Policy Problem in Italy**

Figure 3.1 *Frequency Counts for Articles Featuring Topics on Migration 1984-2010* tracks the number of articles that featured immigration in the newspaper *La Reppublica* since 1985. The number of articles that featured immigration (the dashed line in the chart) jumped significantly at the end of the 1990s. In 2000, the number of articles on the topic jumped from 1,648 in 1999 to 3,973, an increase of 2,325 articles or 141 percent. The average growth rate in the 10-year period preceding the jump was 1.2 percent per year.

**Figure 3.1 Frequency Counts for Articles Featuring Topics on Migration 1984-2010 (Articles per Year)**

While the number of articles which featured the word *straniero* increased significantly from 1999 to 2000 (the number jumped by 1,506 articles, a 116 percent increase), there was comparably significant growth in the number of articles that featured the word *immigrati* (an increase of 819 articles or 232 percent change).
There is a nuanced distinction between the words *immigrati* (immigrant) and *straniero* (foreigner) that reflects the distinctions gradually given to these groups by Italian institutions. As the number of foreign workers increased, the word *straniero* increasingly became reserved for upper middle class foreign residents and the term *immigrato* for low-skilled migrant workers. Scortino and Colombo (2004) explain,

“The ‘foreigner’ is hardly new to Italian public discourse. On the contrary, foreign residents in Italy have long been a key element in national self-definition. Their presence has often been used to demonstrate positively the quality of life of Italy (and its inhabitants, the good people) as well as to highlight negatively the provincial and backward nature of the country compared with those of foreigners. The birth in Italy of a public discourse on immigration does not derive, therefore, from the emergence of a distinction between Italian and foreigner, that is from the discovery of the Other, as much as from the progressive codification of a distinction among different types of foreigners, the gradual institutionalizing of a distinction between ‘foreigner’ and ‘immigrant’, and the establishment of relations between these conceptual oppositions and the distinctions applicable to the Italian population.”(page 97)

In Italy, immigration is commonly characterized as a social disease from which the nation must cleanse itself (Allen & Russo, 1990). Immigrants are seen as a threat to a cohesive national identity.

*I am telling you, the pride of the Romans, Romans [emphasis], that pride inside that with the arrival of immigrants says, “they will ruin the purity of the genetics of the Roman people.” There is that pride that even today remains. If you take a Roman, one from Lungotevere, Trastevere, and he will respond in a rude way saying, “Ehhhh, the Italian race is mixing. This is not right. I am a Roman from Rome.” The pride of the Ancient Romans remains ingrained.* iv (own translation, 2011)

This wish to distinguish themselves from newcomers, to maintain a separation between Italians and the *immigrati* is a source of tension between host and migrant and drives the policy preferences of Italians.
In December 2010, violence exploded between immigrants and Italians in a small Southern town called Rosarno in the province of Reggio Calabria. The incident saw an extended period of violent protest by the city’s African immigrants following an assault on a group of African agricultural workers by a gang of Italian youth. Rosarno invited questions of racism, legality, and even criminality. It called into question the effectiveness of Italian measures to confront immigration. The presence of more than 8,000 illegal aliens working under exploitative conditions in one small town in the South suggests that the situation is far from being under the government’s control.

Complex patterns of conflict and cooperation characterize the relationship between native Italians and immigrants. Conflict can lead to exploitation (Gradstein & Shiff, 2006), interruption of public service delivery (Alesina et al., 2002), or in the worst case, episodes of violence. Political integration, on the other hand, mitigates conflict by opening lines of communication between host and immigrants. Without political integration, immigrants are left without a voice in the processes that result in policies that impact their daily lives and shape their interactions with natives.

3.3 A BRIEF REVIEW OF ITALIAN MIGRATION POLICY

Until 1926, Italian immigration policy was governed by the philosophy: “freedom to work abroad regulated by agreement” (Golini & Birendelli, 1990). With the establishment of its Department of Immigration [Direzione Generale della Emigrazione], bi-lateral agreements on migration became the nation’s strategy of choice for regulating out-migration. The formal establishment of the European Community via 1957’s Rome treaty expanded the possibilities for Italian out-migration. The immigration policy
belonging to that era focused on regulating migration in order to limit migrant exploitation (MacDonald & MacDonald, 1964). Policy then and now is sticky (Baumgartner & Jones, 1993; Schneider & Ingram, 1990), and the regulatory practices at the turn of the century inform Italy’s approach to migration today. Italy continues to enter into bi-lateral agreements for migrant labor, except this time as the receiving country with the power to set conditions and constraints on sending countries.

Golini and Birendelli (1990) identify 1980 as the year that Italian immigration flows switched from *out-migration* to *in-migration*. This began with an economic boom in the early 1960s and was further encouraged by the continued aging of the Italian population. The demographic changes which promoted in-migration to Italy are part of a larger trend faced by all Western European Countries (Eurostat, 2011). Contemporaneous to this increase in Italian in-migration, many Western European countries began to adopt stricter immigration policies, and in doing so redirected immigrant flows towards Italy and her neighbors in the Mediterranean (Knights, 1996). In the late eighties, Italy moved to regulate migration flows into the country. One of the incentives for formalizing rules on migration was to attenuate the political pressure from neighbors in the European community for ‘secure’ Italian borders (Knights, 1996; Zincone, 2006).

To understand Italian immigration policy one must necessarily see Italy as part of a region within a larger political-economic zone (the Mediterranean and Western Europe). An example is the adoption and the continued use of the term *extra-communitari* (*non-European Community*). In their analysis of the treatment of immigrants in over three decades of newspaper articles, Scortini and Colombio (2004) show that the now-common
term was rarely employed before 1989. The “disparaging descriptor” (Andall, 1990: 156) is infused with connotations of belonging and exclusion and very definitively puts a box around the ‘other’.

In Europe, identity politics is very much alive. Recent statements coming out of the leadership in Germany and France are unmistakable in their departure from policies of multiculturalism. As German Chancellor Angela Merkel is famously quoted as stating:

> “Of course, the multicultural approach, living side by side and being happy with each other, this approach has failed utterly. That is why integration is so important. Those who want to participate in our society must not only comply with the law and follow the constitution but above all, must learn our language. They must know German.”

Being part of the region means that aspects of neighboring countries’ policies are incorporated into Italian policy. At times, Italy has initiated changes in migration policy that have been adopted by other EU states. For example, the exportation of detention centers to Libya was a program that Italy initiated and the European Union later adopted. Moreover, Italy—like other countries in the Mediterranean—is seen by many migrant groups as a country of passage. Since Italy, by definition, functions as third country (country of transit), it faces different challenges from its Northern neighbors who also are part of the Schengen agreement. These challenges limit Italy’s ability to fulfill promises made in transregional agreements.

In considering Italian migration policy, one must look back to look forward. No longer able to deny the growing migrant presence, the country moved to regulate migration in 1986 (Legge 943/86) through the blanket ‘regularization’ of all employed migrants in
Italy. In 1990 the law was followed by the nation’s first attempt at a comprehensive national policy on immigration, Legge 39/90 or the Martelli Act.

Apart from instituting what was meant to be a one-time (the country has since had three more: 1995-96, 1998 and 2002) amnesty for all migrants – legal status notwithstanding – the Martelli Act introduced some important rules on migration. The act introduced provisions for family reunification and made important concessions to migrant labor. It also introduced a series of provisions for migrant politics, such as the recognition of migrant federations and associations.

Migrants participated early in legislative discussions beginning with the Martelli Act. Leveraging their relationships with trade unions and leftist political parties, a multi-ethnic coalition of leaders participated in these efforts through associational work and protest, giving a face to the issue of migration. Informant 714, a Filipino union representative in one of Italy’s largest and most active unions, describes the activism of that period. In the interview transcript, the importance of personal connections and network position is apparent.

“In the 90s we began to make more concrete demands regarding migrant rights. In those days, our work contract was different from those given to Italians. So we pushed the labor unions to support us in asking for equal contracts for migrant domestic workers. This was a success not only for the Filipino community, but also three others⁹, the contratto nazionale, a national labor contract for domestics. From this, we established a migrant federation composed of different migrant associations including students, like an Egyptian Student Association [and] Palestinians. This expanded our concerns to the political realm, beyond labor. these were the rights we helped establish through Martelli, like the right to convene in federations and migrant initiatives. Or to petition for family members to join us in Italy, which before was not there. These initiatives that go beyond

---

⁹ Informant 714 was referring to the three other communities in Italy involved in domestic services during that time, Capo Verdans, Eritreans, and Ethiopians.
Eight years after Martelli was enacted, Italy passed its second national policy on immigration, 1998’s Turco-Napoletano Law or Legge 40/98. Scholarly articles describe the overarching philosophy that drove this policy as one of ‘reasonable integration’ which considers “the recognition of the person’s integrity and a low-conflict potential integration” (Campani, 2007). These ideas relate closely to that of multi-cultural democracy. A concept which Fennema and Tillie (2001) define as

“a democracy where ethnic minorities participate in the democratic process, thus providing the political elite with reliable information about the political preferences of the immigrant population and the democratic institutions with popular legitimacy among the minority groups.”

Where Europe goes, Italy seems to follow. As the salience of immigration has risen, European countries have adopted increasingly restrictive policies to manage legal immigration and to reduce illegal immigration (Callovi, 1992; Givens & Leudtke, 2004). Four short years after its adoption, Turco-Napoletano was replaced by the Bossi-Fini Act (Law No. 189), the first national law on immigration to be adopted under the leadership of a Center-Right government. The series of reversals in policies that ensued between Turco Napoletano and Bossi Fini is reflective of a clear divide and policy debate between Center Left and Center Right politics in Italy. The three most important aspects of these were:

- **The criminalization of clandestine immigration and the increased emphasis on detention and repatriation.** During this period, the Berlusconi government entered into agreements with Gaddafi to house its clandestine migrants in detention centers in Libya for the deportation of migrants to Africa.
- **The expansion of the Influx Decree** The Influx Decree sets annually-determined quotas on the number of migrant laborers to be allowed in the nation each year.
- *The increased stringency given to work permits.* For the first time, migrants were asked to pay for their work permits (part of the Anti-Crisis Initiative) and to provide proof of housing, income and other supports.

The Italian law on migration was revisited in 2009, with the Berlusconi government’s Security Act. The promoters of the Security Act, the Center-Right government of Silvio Berlusconi, were the most active movers (534 counts in the word frequency count), reflecting a strong push to move this policy forward. The Center-Left politicians were somewhat active (291 counts) and led the opposition. Among them were the authors of the 1998 Law on migration, Livia Turco and Giorgio Napoletano. The Centrist party the UDC (Unione dei Democratici Cristiani e di Centro/Translation: Union of Christian and Center Democrats) – which was quite active in the deliberations on Turco-Napoletano (Zincone, 2006) – were notably silent (40 counts).

In Figure 3.2 *Word Frequency Count, Policy Makers*, the names identified show an active center-Right and a less-active center-Left, with the exception of Giorgio Napoletano. The two most-mentioned personalities were Berlusconi (the Prime Minister and main sponsor of the law), Giorgio Napoletano, Roberto Maroni (Minister of the Interior and administrative arm for national rules on migration), and then Gianfranco Fini (president of the senate). Roberto Maroni, the Minister of the Interior, is most often mentioned in reports on the controversial detention centers or CIE. As the face of the campaign to push the security act forward, Mr. Berlusconi was both moral and policy entrepreneur in the campaign to win public acceptance for the policy change.

The term, *policy entrepreneur* is used in a number of different theories of the policy process. The theoretical frameworks have policy entrepreneurs involved in different activities. In the *Multiple Streams* framework, for example, unite the ‘three streams’ to
create a policy window in which they may promote a policy preference while in the *Social Construction* framework, they make use of social constructions. Regardless of the framework, the activities of the entrepreneurs are the same: they point the public’s attention to a policy program and skillfully use this ‘concern’ which they have promulgated to promote a specific policy outcome. Meeting these goals requires skills and strategic thinking. This actor or set of actors “are more than mere advocates of particular solutions; they are power brokers and manipulators of problematic preferences and unclear technology.” (Zahariadis, 2007; page 74). The ability of policy entrepreneurs to establish their preferred policies convincingly depends on their abilities to couch policies and frame targets in ways that are compatible with the ‘tastes’ of the public. Schneider and Ingram (1993, p. 338):

“*Important public issues do not always permit elected officials to find congruence among social constructions, power, and logical connections to goals; and problems cannot always be solved so straightforwardly. Many officials care about outcomes and fear widespread public reaction against ineffective policy, lack of attention to important problems, and too much favoritism to special interests.*”
Mr. Berlusconi was front and center in the campaign to convince the Italian public, its parliament and the EU of the merits of the Security Act. In the articles analyzed for study, then Prime Minister Silvio Berlusconi was identified as the locus of authority in the decision-making process on immigration. Newspaper accounts show Mr. Berlusconi as actively engaged in pushing the Security Act forward. His advocacy is clear in this newspaper article from 15 April 2009:

“Silvio Berlusconi called the Lega headquarters twice. From Porta Rotonda, he first spoke with Roberto Calderoli, then he spoke directly to the entire Lombardian coalition which was meeting at Via Bellerio. The premier did not mince words with the ‘big guns’ of the Carrocio\textsuperscript{10}. ‘We want guarantees or else there will be consequences,’ was his hardnosed challenge to Umberto Bossi...Berlusconi wants the Lombardians to sign on to the pact which decides

\textsuperscript{10} La Carrocio is a nickname for the Northern Party: La Lega.
the destiny of the civic patrols, on the rules that govern the treatment of immigrants in detention centers (they must be detained for at least 6 months), and the directive that healthcare specialists report illegal immigrants as specified in the rules for administrators.\textsuperscript{VI}(La Reppublica 2009, own translation)

As the implementing arm of the policy, the Ministry of the Interior and its chief administrator Mr. Maroni made the policy fact through action.

3.4 Social Constructions and the Security Act

For constructions to take hold, a dominant policy design must emerge, delivered by an enterprising policy maker. These policy entrepreneurs, decision-makers with the most to gain from the establishment of new policies, take on the costs and risks of policy advocacy to facilitate policy adoption.

The political gains from defining and treating migration as a problem are numerous. First, it aligns Italian policy with Western European policy, allowing Italy to claim support in other areas. Second, it redirects national attention from other pressing problems, such as the economic crisis which some argue that Mr. Berlusconi mishandled (see The Economist, June 7, 2011). And third, it allows Italy to position itself as a ‘doorway’ to Europe and a location of strategic importance. If a high word frequency indicates where attention lies (Lowe, 2003), then a quick look at Figure 3.3 Word Frequency Count, Policy Proposals suggests that security has overtaken integration as a guiding philosophy for Italian policymaking.

Successful political discourses manifest as policy. Social Construction Theory proposes that “policy makers typically socially construct target populations in positive and negative terms and distribute benefits and burdens so as to reflect and perpetuate these constructions” Ingram et al. in Sabatier, 2007: p.93). Since policies carry the syntax of
institutions (Crawford & Ostrom, 1995), they are the common and often unavoidable
door through which individuals are exposed to politics (Hibbing & Theiss-Morse, 2001).

**Figure 3.3 Word Frequency Count, Policy Proposals**

![Word Frequency Count, Policy Proposals](image)

COLOR LEGEND: GREEN: benefits; RED: burdens

The word frequency counts illustrated in Figure 3.4 Word Frequency Count, Media Labels placed on Italy’s Migrants show that migrants have been constructed both positively and negatively. There are many ‘targets’ implicated/elicited in the Italian discourses on immigration.

Immigrants are often labeled as a deserving but weak (dependent) group. Often couched in universalistic ideology, these arguments characterize immigrants as helpless and in need of saving. For example, in February 2009, the newspaper La Reppublica published a ‘call to arms’ labeling new educational policies as a variant of apartheid and describing

**Figure 3.4 Word Frequency Count, Media Labels placed on Italy’s Migrants**
COLOR LEGEND: GREEN: positive constructions; WHITE: neutral constructions; RED: negative constructions

the discriminations levied against migrant children:

"Italian children are also forced to cross the city every day as parents migrate towards the ‘whiter’ schools in these neighborhoods, and in September when the bell sounds announcing the beginning of the 2009/2010 school year, Italy will find itself even more divided as actual apartheid classes of only immigrants and ‘select’ classes composed only of Italian children." (La Reppublica, 14 February 2009, own translation)

Aligning policy closely with ‘winning’ constructions – or descriptors of target groups - is important for keeping politics ‘safe’. In the social construction framework, high-power individuals always receive benefits while low-power individuals receive burdens. Migrants – without the right to vote – should enjoy very few political benefits. What is more, when this power is combined with negative construction, migrants should be subjected to a politics of punishment (Ingram et al. in Sabatier, 2007).
Immigrant workers are often described as a deserving class of migrants. However, as the economic crisis progressed, not even legal migrants were safe (Baldwin-Edwards, 2002). As in other advanced democracies (Hello et al., 2004; Hope-Pelled, 1996), immigrants in Italy are the target of economic competition. Themes of crisis, unemployment and recession were mentioned 162 times in the articles analyzed although the theme was nowhere near as salient as the ‘need for migrant labor’ (577 mentions). Perceptions of working immigrants changed, and they switched from a deserving class of immigrants to a contender group. Migrant laborers were selected for policy burdens in the Security Act (see Table 3.1 Mapping Constructions to Policies). Some of the limitations placed on them were:

1. Instituted a point-based system for the permit to stay and a fee for the permit
2. Expanded the types of crimes which would make one ineligible from getting a permit to stay
3. Imposed a language test for the carta di soggiorno (long-term permit to stay)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Burdens</th>
<th>Benefits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Helpers (COLF, Badarzi)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Other Migrant Workers</td>
<td>X X</td>
<td>X X X X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Migrant Business Owners</td>
<td>X X</td>
<td>X X X X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rom Families</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clandestine Immigrants</td>
<td>X X X X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refugees</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminals</td>
<td>X X X X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 3.1 Mapping Constructions to Policies**
Immigrant entrepreneurs are an important component of this privileged subset of migrant workers held up as deserving in Italian society. Migrant entrepreneurs are often lauded for their economic contributions, as shown in the excerpt below from an article published on May 12, 2009:

“The Italian economy is already multi-ethnic: 9.7% of the country’s productivity (Income) is tied to workers and business owners coming from non-EU countries. And despite the crisis, this measure seems destined to grow. Whether we like it or not then, our economic health is tightly linked to our immigrants.” (Grion, own translation)

These observations are echoed by the Representative for Africa to the City of Rome, Victor Emeka Okeadu:

“If I may use an Italian word, [what?] is “un salto”. Because this is….one thing you should understand is that this is…one of our problems is the unqualified jobs where we are commonly located reflects also the image of our status in the society. Then if we can have this, you know, shift definitely it is an uplift of our image.”

These privileged immigrant groups provide political motives around which immigrants and their allies seek rights and recognition within the polity.

Even within a liberal news organization like La Repubblica, the themes that dominate discourses on immigration hold negative connotations. The Security Act of 2009 was promoted using three general justifications: economic security, physical security, and national security. The negative construction of immigrants reflects these themes and has immigrants cast as either liability (in the case of clandestine immigrants and refugees) or threats (to national security or to national identity).

An emergent theme of the period was that of immigrants as criminals. A series of rapes—allegedly perpetrated by immigrant men—was reported in Rome in 2009. Since the
articles included for analysis were taken from La Reppublica’s Roman edition, the word frequency count picked up on this theme. As did national attention. The rapes in Rome were often referenced in the promotion of the civic patrols, one of the policy changes included in the Security Act. Contemporaneously, immigration was linked with criminality at a larger scale. The word ‘mafia’ was mentioned 32 times in conjunction with immigration and the words rape/rapist/rape victim 137 times.

La Lega, the extreme Right party from the North, established itself as the anti-immigration party (Allen & Russo, 1990). The job of bringing policy problems to the public attention falls on the shoulders of moral entrepreneurs (Nicholson-Crotty & Meier, 2005) who manipulate social constructions in ways that increase the salience of policy problems. In this way, La Lega’s politicians served as the moral entrepreneurs for this policy issue, framing it as a problem for the polity to solve.

La Lega adopts a strategy of blame. It plays a critical role in the social construction of immigrants. The party often insinuates that migrants introduce threats of terrorism and jihad and suggest that migrants are a source of unfair economic competition that threaten Italian households.
The poster (above) was plastered across Rome in Spring 2011. It reads, “The Chinese Shadow over the Italian Economy.” This is a typical example of the campaigns undertaken by Rightist politicians to ‘raise arms’ by raising awareness.

Of the immigrant groups against which the *Lega* claims Italy needs protection, above all it is concerned with clandestine immigrants. Its geographic location and its expanse of coastline (over 8,000 kilometers) make Italy an attractive target for illegal immigration. Estimates by charitable organizations place illegal immigration into Italy at 100,000 to 250,000 people per year [BBC, 2009]. The nation’s fascination with clandestine migration is fueled by news images of refugees disembarking on Italian soil. Events that involved Albanians in 1997 and Libyans and Tunisians in 2011 have fomented Italian concerns with clandestinity.

Clandestine immigration was the central theme of the Security Act period, gaining the most attention in the media. Often depicted negatively and linked to criminality,
clandestine immigration is a theme that Italy shares with the rest of Europe. *Immigrants as clandestines* and *immigrants as criminals* fall easily into the ‘deviant’ category identified in Social Construction Theory (Schneider & Ingram, 1993; Nicholson-Crotty & Meier, 2005).

That theme that began to emerge during the Bossi Fini Act and carried forward into the Security Act was the idea of a link between clandestinity and criminality. The two are increasingly paired in both rhetoric and policy. The changing treatment for clandestines—from people who need to be helped to criminals who are willfully ignoring national laws—is reflected in the Security Act:

1. Jail time of 1-4 years for illegal migrants that fail to comply with expulsion decisions
2. Migrants required to carry and demonstrate documents at each point
3. Fines for illegal entry and stay
4. Employers of undocumented migrants punished with 6 months to 5 years imprisonment and with a sanction of up to 5000 euro for every person illegally employed.
5. Landlords who rents to undocumented migrants to be fined

While most of the proposed actions were punitive, with arrests and detention dominating, one interesting theme is that of ‘empowerment’. There were some discussions of providing immigrants with the right to vote in administrative elections. This move, which would have benefited politicians from the Left was not accompanied by initiatives to relax citizenship requirements which, practically, would have expanded migrant rights substantially. In fact, citizenship requirements were made more stringent with the requirement to increase up to two years the time for accessing Italian citizenship by spousal transfer.
In 2011, many of the propositions of the 2009 Security Act were not being implemented. Some had been abandoned, like the requirement that administrative officers report illegal immigrants, while others had not yet been put in place. Notwithstanding the increasing restrictiveness of immigrant policies on paper, demand for foreign labor in the country continues to grow spurred by the demographic realities of the nation (the country has the ‘oldest’ population in Europe and one of the lowest replacement rates in the OECD). One of the ironies of the Security Act was that the greatest proportion of non-compliant employers (employers who hired illegal immigrants) lived in those regions represented by the very politicians that championed the enactment of punitive measures against illegal migrants and their employers. So even as the country imposed sanctions of migrant workers, another sanitoria – immigrant asylum – was granted to immigrant workers. Therefore, one can consider the sanitoria as a benefit to a different “contender group”: employers. A typical case of client politics (Citrin et al, 1997).

3.5 Social Constructions, Social Networks, and Political Participation

Social constructions provide information about the possibilities within and permeability of the socio-political structure for different target groups. In addition, differential participation by groups can be seen as a consequence of social constructions. When groups become aware of their disproportionate receipt of policy burdens, they understand that the current political system is closed off to them (van Zomeren and Iyer, 2004). A politics of punishment often results in limited political participation by members of target groups (Ingram et al. in Sabatier, 2007; Eisinger, 1973). In the immigrant case, policy
burdens encourage immigrants to focus on group-centered\textsuperscript{11} activities rather than host-centered activities.

While we might expect a punitive environment to cause migrants to turn away from political participation (Schneider & Ingram, 1993), their social networks bring migrants into politics by expanding their possibilities. It is exactly this mix of institutional restriction and access (closed and open opportunity structures) that invite the political mobilization of marginalized populations (Eisinger, 1973).

Policy adoption begins with social construction and ends with networks. It turns out that the higher the number of within-community contacts a migrant’s associates has, the greater the likelihood that the migrant will be embedded in his/her community. However, migrants with contacts who have connections outside their national community are more likely to participate in politics. This supports the findings of Tillie and Jacobs (2004) and Lipjhart (1968), who propose that strong elite migrant networks are necessary for promoting migrant participation.

3.6 BRIDGING RELATIONSHIPS AND MIGRANT POLITICAL PARTICIPATION

Following the methodology employed by Gindengil and Stolle (2009), four questions were included to gauge migrant familiarity with Italian social programs (questions listed in Box 3.1 below). The open-ended questions were meant to assist in the evaluation of how widespread ‘correct’ knowledge of programs is for members of the migrant communities under study. An unplanned result was the reporting of information on migrant preferences for assistance in these areas (childcare, language courses, processing

\textsuperscript{11} I also refer to these as with-in community activities
documents and finding employment). Thus, the variety of pathways by which migrants accessed institutional resources or sought to comply with Italian regulations was uncovered. Who an immigrant approaches to gather information carries consequences for the quality and quantity of information received (DeVillanova, 2007).

**Box 3.1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The following four questions are to help the researcher know where, normally, someone from your country can go when seeking help with practical things in Rome.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22. Where should a parent go to sign up for public childcare?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. If someone wanted to learn Italian, where can he/she go?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. If someone needed help filling out his/her permesso di soggiorno where can he/she go?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. If someone needed help finding work, where can he/she go?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of the four referral categories\(^\text{12}\) included, *assistance in processing documentation* was identified as the single most important type of information (a separate question, which came beforehand, asked respondents what the most important need in their community is). Poorly processed documents are a common cause for expulsion and this insecurity pushed migrants to be very careful when deciding who to approach for help.

\(^\text{12}\) Referral categories included: childcare, language instruction, processing documents and job openings.
For migrants who require assistance, trade unions are important (see Table 3.2 *Migrant Referrals for Document Processing Assistance*). 25% of Filipinos, 40% of Peruvians and 35% of Bangladeshi prefer trade unions. The *patronato* are agencies that function as one-stop shops for migrant workers in Italy. All of the trade unions operate such service desks, as do many Italian and immigrant associations. The recognition of migrant labor in 1990’s Martelli Law placed migrant rights under the purview of labor movements. Migrant rights have been integrated into the mission of the many labor unions, particularly those that serve sectors that employ a large share of migrant workers, like APICOLF (*Associazione Professionale Italiana Collaboratore Familiare*), the union for domestic helpers.

The *Confederazione Generale Italiana del Lavoro* (Translation: Italian General Confederation of Labour, CGIL) received the greatest number of nominations by those

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total Count</th>
<th>Total Percent</th>
<th>Bangladesh Count</th>
<th>Bangladesh Percent</th>
<th>Peru Count</th>
<th>Peru Percent</th>
<th>Philippines Count</th>
<th>Philippines Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trade Union</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Government Office</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patronato</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don't Know</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embassy</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic Association</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friend(s)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Government Office</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjunct Councilor</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italian Association</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic Association (Italian)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Employment Agency</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filipino Chaplaincy in Rome</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
surveyed. CGIL was among the first to champion migrant rights under the leadership of Antonio Pizzinato (then National Secretary of CGIL). His advocacy for immigrant workers goes back to the 1970s when he encouraged the inclusion of immigrant workers in the trade union and established service offices. The CELSI (Centro lavoratori stranieri) was a pioneer office that provided immigrant workers with assistance with documentation and advocacy on other labor related needs. Two years before the enactment of the Martelli Law, the CELSI of Rome already began to mobilize for the political and social recognition of migrants.

Many immigrants surveyed nominated the ex-CELSI office in Via Buonarroti as important. Many trace their relationship back to its charismatic ex-manager, Simonetta Dandoli. When she was alive and in charge of the office, the services in the office went beyond labor into policy, “When Simonetta was in charge,” one of the Buonarroti employees observed, “we had more stringent relationships with immigrant leaders. Those days, each ethnic association used to have a representative to CGIL. The ex-CELSI office had structured relationships with every national community. CGIL was a ‘training ground’ for these organizations. Today, CGIL has taken on a more administrative role: meno sulla politica piu sulla pratica ([Translation]: less on policy making more on implementation)”

Some of the formal relationships of the past remain, though. Filipinos have a particularly strong relationship with CGIL (Krane, 2004). One of its most active leaders, Informant 714 is herself a union representative. Her relationship with CGIL predates the first Italian law on migration, 1990’s Martelli Law. This association’s leader, Informant 714, is a
pioneer association leader in the Filipino community and continues to bring Filipinos into
CGIL were she works as a representative every Thursday afternoon. Informant 714 is
also the president of one of the two politically-centered Filipino groups in Rome. 49
percent of the Filipinos surveyed nominated CGIL for services related to document
processing, many of them mentioning Informant 714 by her first name.

Returning to Table 3.2, we also see a higher reliance on Italian government among
Bangladeshis and Peruvians. Perhaps this is attributable to the longer stay and (thus)
greater stability within the Filipino community.

Migrants who are in Italy legally can access the same types of social programs accessed
by Italians from childcare to employment placement. However, survey responses show,
that in many cases, migrants preferred to work with intermediaries in accessing resources.
Italian intermediaries have been instrumental in facilitating migrant political
participation. Some intermediaries purposively sought to bring migrants into their
organizations. Informant 849 of an Italian labor union spoke of the efforts that were
undertaken to build relationships with the Sikh in the Latina region:

“It has been 8 years that we seek to get to know the Indian community because in
the beginning language was the obstacle: they speak 5 and we 1 and a half;
therefore, we communicated a bit in English but they spoke absolutely no Italian.
The first time we met them, and by meeting them I mean we went into the camps
where they work and then we discovered that there were many temples where they
pray in Latina. And we spent four years praying with them within the temples. We
got to know them. And now their community trusts us. In fact, the first words in
Italian for many was “FLI-CGIL” and this fills me with pride.”

xii
Figure 3.5 Entities Associated with Migration

Religion has emerged as another source of connection and separation between migrants and Italians (see Figure 3.5 Entities Associated with Migration). Italy is a predominantly Catholic country. The Catholic community is an important source of support for immigrants. Catholic charities and associations provide services and advocacy for many migrant communities. In fact, Catholic associations make important political allies (Zincone, 2006). The church’s advocacy can be felt at all levels from service to policy making (Zincone, 2006); as reflected in numerous newspaper accounts.

Religion is also important as it relates to policy. Diversity of religious practices can result in institutional mismatches. This is especially consequential for migrant communities from countries with weak institutional relationships with Italy, like those from South Asia. Informant 790 explains the high incidence of document falsification in
terms of these mismatches. “For example, Hinduism does not have a marriage certificate. The husband and wife walk around a fire a given number of times. And voila, they are married. However, this Italian government, this state requires this document. So what does one do? One falsifies…” (own translation. 2011).

In Rome, I observed that there is a diversity of Italian intermediaries that dually complement and compete with government agencies in providing public services to immigrants. After performing a word-frequency count on 535 articles featuring the word ‘immigrant’ and/or the word ‘foreigner’, eight general categories of intermediaries often associated with immigrant policy making and program implementation were identified (see Figure 3.1). These intermediaries work to actualize migrant policies either through enforcement – as bureaucratic agents like police officers and teachers – or through facilitation – as associations or church groups often assist in doing. The effective displacement of host institutions by intermediaries (Italian or not) may further isolate the most vulnerable immigrants from the mainstream.

Onlus stands for Organizzazione Non Lucrativa di Utilità Sociale [Translation: Not for Profit Organization of Social Uses], and many of the registered Italian associations that deal with migrants fall under this category. Compared to ethnic associations, Italian associations have better access to state resources. Caponio (2005) found a strong preference for and privileging of Italian associations over immigrant associations by the government when providing financial and political resources.
When asked if they ever participated in competitions for state funds, or bando, ethnic association heads who were interviewed often responded negatively. For them, it was seen as a waste of time.

“Alright, the bando pubblico, let’s say to fund associations, if the association is a migrant association it is already outside the competition because a majority of these contests are run by Italian associations. And, of course, the contests organized by the mayor, province, regions, well in these, of course the province, region and mayor, all of these prefer their own associations. Therefore since immigrants cannot vote these people into office, why should the region give money to Association X [his association], there is no return, do you see?”

Informant 790, Bangladeshi, Association Head, 2011

The resources that they receive permit Italian associations to employ staff (Italians and migrants) and thus lower opportunity costs for participation. This allows them to ‘do more’ than migrant representatives without these connections. Commenting on the work accomplished by migrant activists in Rome, Informant 799, an immigrant representative
elected to serve on Rome’s consultative body for migrants, made the following observation:

“They promote a lot of change because they work a lot on immigration and on social programs. First, because they have the necessary awareness and also because for them it is a job. It’s not as it is for me—I don’t earn anything from this. Many people who attend meetings at the consultative body come from their associations. That is, their time is paid for by these associations.” xv (2011, own translation)

Italian intermediaries make powerful allies for migrants. One caveat of this representation by proxy is that it may incorrectly or insufficiently represent the migrant condition (Verba et al, 1995). Politics requires presence that communicates the authenticity of the migrant experience. The wish to give a face to the ‘alternative’ reality in Italy provides a strong motivation for participation (Montouri, 2007). As informant 799 comments:

“You have asked me why I decided to work at the consulta and to participate in politics, it was exactly for this. I seek to, well, tell the story, no? From the point of view of someone who lives it.” xvi (2011, own translation)

Verba et al. 1995 write, “it is well known that social institutions play a major role in stimulating citizens and cultivating psychological engagement in politics by serving as the locus of recruitment activity.” But not all groups have the same capacity in assisting migrants. Fennema and Tillie (2011) propose that it is the position of one’s association in a network of relationships that promotes participation. In the following chapters, I undertake a network analysis to follow up on these propositions. Applying a network model of participation to immigration allows us to: (1) give further clarity to the relationship between ‘resources’ and participation, (2) closely examine the relationship
between structure and agency, and (3) explore the constraining and enabling qualities of relationships formed under the setting of transplantation.

3.7 CONCLUSION

Our personal contacts/interactions compel both participation and non-participation. It turns out that it is not the number of contacts or the ‘quality of contact’ (e.g. whether the contact is Italian, member of an Association, or endowed with resources) that matters for the participation. Rather, it is that contact’s position in the network that provides access to resources. One’s position dictates who one meets and the ability of one to leverage those relationships for his/her benefit. In most cases, these important relationships are missing:

“Let’s say that we are isolated from this social life. ....Contact depends on seeing. But those who make laws, who organize things, they organize them for.....who? Because once it was all for immigrants and after that period, immigrants have nothing left, they don’t even have the rights they had to begin with.” (Informant 795, 2011, own translation)

But where they are available, they spell opportunity for entire migrant communities. Immigrants in Rome hail from a variety of disparate social backgrounds. And while in Rome, their behavior is conditioned by different circumstances and driven by different hopes. The relationships around which their political actions are centered, then, provide both a necessary common ground and motivations for participation in a range of political acts.
CHAPTER 4: A FIRST LOOK AT NETWORKS AND MIGRANT POLITICAL PARTICIPATION

Juxtaposing the question of why people participate, Sidney Verba, Kay Lehman Schlozman, and Henry E. Brady (hereafter, Verba et al., 1995: 269) propose that people DO NOT participate because: “they can’t, they don’t want to, or because nobody asked.” Their Civic Volunteerism Model (CVM) has emerged as a dominant model on political participation. It explains differential participation across social classes by suggesting that political resources (time, money and skills) interact with social structures to determine political participation. The model combines three models into one: a resource model, an engagement model, and a recruitment model.

In practice, the emphasis remains on the resource model. However, it is not always feasible, nor is it always appropriate, to study participation in this manner (de Rooij, 2011). Resource models provide few and unsatisfactory explanations for why citizens possessing similar traits behave differently (exhibit different rates of participation, for example) when placed in different social contexts (Huckfeldt, 1979; McClurg, 2003). This suggests that social structure operates on these individual-level traits to determine participation (Leighley, 1995).

Upon their arrival, immigrants possess a set of skills, experiences, and cultural resources that impact their opportunities and incentives to participate in a host nation’s political affairs (Borjas, 1994; Djajic, 2000; and Rogers, 2006). If, when, and how participation takes place varies across groups with differential effects based on gender, ethnicity, class, legal status and the socio-political context in which immigration occurs (Castles, 2000; Costa & Khan, 2002).
4.1 BACKGROUND

In 2004 and 2006, Rome held elections for foreign representatives to serve on the city council. The city’s legal immigrants have elected four representatives to the city council and one to each of the 19 district governments—municipi—in Rome. Apart from these 23 positions, a consultative body of 19 elected representatives was also elected. Immigrant involvement in these elections provide an opportunity to observe immigrant political participation in institutionally sanctioned acts (like the vote) and compare them to non-sanctioned acts (such as protest). Normative acts are endorsed by host institutions (Martiniello, 2005) and serve to bolster institutional legitimacy (Wright et al, 1990). As a normative act, voting is supported by and reinforces the dominant political institutions in an area (Wright et al., 1990).

Voting is necessary for the maintenance and promotion of democracy and is the minimum standard by which governments achieve some semblance of legitimate rule. It is a low cost, egalitarian form of political participation. As Abraham Lincoln is quoted as saying, “The ballot is stronger than the bullet”.

There was much excitement surrounding the first round of elections. Informant 768 recounts, “the first time we had this experience, immigrants in Rome were very enthusiastic about it because there were many of them that had not even had any experience of voting before...it was a very interesting experience.”

Participation by migrants in elections is conditioned by institutional rules (Ramakrishnan & Espenshade, 2001). In Rome, only migrants whose legal stay in Italy is 5 years or

---

13 Interview given in English
longer are eligible to vote. This disenfranchises a number of the most populous migrant communities, particularly those from Eastern Europe. In contrast, protest is a form of action open to all.

Protest is a common and popular form of political communication in Europe. To some degree, participation in protest indicates a certain level of integration (Eisinger, 1973), however incomplete. It suggests an investment in host-country life, a recognition by the immigrant that Italian policy has an impact on his/her life, and a sufficient level of generalizable trust (or faith that one’s political activity matters --- i.e., a feeling of political efficacy). In the past, immigrants living in Rome have successfully used protest to access political rights (Knight, 1993; Montouri, 2007). Additionally, to amass sufficient numbers to make protest relevant, immigrants often have to work with Italian associations when organizing. Protest is a common and popular form of political communication in Europe. In the past, immigrants living in Rome have successfully used protest to access political rights (Knight, 1993; Montouri, 2007).

Protest allows participants to be very specific about their demands (Verba et al., 1995). Eisenger (1972: p.5) defines protest as “a host of types of collective manifestations—disruptive in nature—designed to provide ‘relatively powerless people’ with bargaining leverage in the political process.” What separates protest from other forms of political action is the implicit threat of violence and disruption carried within the action (Lichbach & Gurr, 1983; Eisinger, 1973).

A few migrant leaders suggest that protest is the only effective form of political communication. For example, Informant 790, a well-known Bangladeshi association
head, business man, and, in his own words—‘assumed terrorist’—, emphatically declared in an interview, “the institution only knows one language. This is the power of the public square. They don’t understand Italian, Bangladeshi, or Pakistani. Nothing. Nothing. If we are many in the square, in movement, they understand. That is, this is a language that they are familiar with.” (own translation, 2011).

4.2 DATA AND METHODS

In Chapter 2, I discussed the varied ways in which research was undertaken. The survey, which was conducted in the Esquilino neighborhood in the spring of 2011, was a central part of the effort. Table 4.1 Attributes of Survey Respondents summarizes the general characteristics of the 140 survey respondents. While immigrants from 19 countries responded to the survey, the three national communities that this study focuses on were overrepresented: Bangladeshis (19 percent of respondents), Peruvians (14 percent of respondents), and Filipinos (41 percent of respondents). In most cases, the respondents had at least 12 years of school, and in some cases, they had a graduate degree.

I use the survey results to describe immigrant participation in voting and in protest. I explore these acts by applying the framework commonly employed in the resource model of political participation. I then use interviews and ethnographic records to explore the engagement and recruitment model of political participation. The use of ethnographic methods to describe migrant networks is common (Ambrosini, 2007). I employ them to begin to look at migrant networks in their political mobilization. These methods allow us to describe the patterns that the graph theoretic models unearth.
4.3 They don’t want to: A question of engagement

Of the three models that make up the CVM, the engagement model is perhaps the least developed. Engagement is a concept that encompasses a number of predispositions towards political participation. Measuring engagement and understanding its origins is quite difficult (Brady, 1995). The engagement model is tied to networks and relationships (Leighley, 1995). Relationships play a role in determining the location of action. Our strongest social contacts—family, friends, and close associates—are said to be fundamental in determining our political predispositions (Campbell et al., 1960). Marriage, another fundamental social arrangement, is also known to influence the ideological predispositions of one or both partners (Campbell et al., 1960).

We know that engagement builds over time. Networks contribute to our understanding of political engagement. Participation can ensue as a process of social learning whereby individuals adopt certain behaviors, including political participation, after enough of their neighbors adopt the behavior (Cowan & Jonard, 2003; Valente, 1993) or when they expect their neighbors to adopt such behaviors (Klandermans, 1984). Social learning is a strategic behavior that allows organisms to survive environmental changes (Lebel et al., 2010). Interestingly, human behavior exhibits the same isomorphic tendencies that DiMaggio and Powell (1983) observed in organizations. Additionally, social position is important as social learning is more likely to occur when one’s ‘neighbors’ are also social equivalents (Huckfeldt, 1979).

One aspect of engagement that can be informed by networks is ethnic political identity. Sosyal (1997) defines identity as representing “the ‘unchosen’ thus the naturalizing language of kinship, homeland, and territory. One cannot help but have
Identity emerges as an ever pervasive and meaningful discourse of participation, and is enacted as a symbolic, organizational tool for creating new group solidarities and mobilizing resources in national and world polities”. Political identity results from seeing one’s status as a product of one’s group’s position relative to a reference group (White et al., 1990; Olsen, 1970). The decision to employ non-normative political action like protest is a function of political trust (de Rooij, 2011). Discrimination damages political trusts and channels participation to non-normative acts (Wright et al., 1990) or to purely ethno-centered politics.

Doubtless, immigrants will have particularized concerns related to their legal status and cultural needs as new citizens that activate an ethnic identification that promotes participation (Antunes & Gaitz, 1975; Knights, 1990; Miller et al., 1981; Portes & Sensenbrenner, 1993; Verba & Nie, 1972). Belonging to a network begets a sense of community that encourages participation (McLeod et al., 1999).

However, it is not a static identity. The potential to form and foment mobilization potential depends on the qualities of ethnic identity. Different network structures promote different immigrant identities. Even national groups have a lot of diversity that create a lot of divisions. Ethnic identity, it seems, is a flexible identity that “operates as a semi-permeable membrane that permits the transgress of other culture’s values and behaviors” (Peshkin, 1988: p.423).

Yinger (1985) defines ethnicity as “a factor in one’s identity [that] has both subjective and objective components. It draws on the behavior of a group that is located in a larger social context. The group has a distinctive sense of itself which in some ways others
recognize”. Strong ethnic identification results from the size of a migrant network (larger, denser networks are more likely to have strong identity characteristics) and group-based discrimination from host-country society. As immigrants integrate, ethnic identity may become less salient for mobilization. Portes and Sensenbrenner (1993) propose that many ethnic identities occur after repeated experience of discrimination against a community “brings about the construction of alternative definitions of the situations based on reenactment of past practices and a common cultural memory”.

Strong ethnic identity may promote mobilization by national communities but it may interfere with attempts at unified migrant mobilization. One of the roadblocks of effective migrant activism is the maintenance of divisive national boundaries between immigrant groups. The Adjunct Councilor for Africa, Victor Emeka Okeadu, described the continued divisions within the immigrant community as lethargizing.

“And you know the problem is that immigration rallies are just of recent. It’s of recent. We’ve not yet gotten the consolidated background. What I mean consolidated background is just as we were saying where maybe a Chinese can employ an immigrant not only Chinese. Or a Filipino can employ…we’ve not yet gotten that…it has been difficult to establish and up to now we cannot do that…if we don’t succeed in doing that what is the consequence? It makes the move up more problematic.”

Fragmented migrant communities, rich in bridges to other national groups and to host-country institutions, promote intergroup dialogue and unified immigrant mobilization.
4.4 NO ONE ASKED THEM: A QUESTION OF NETWORKS

Social position, that is access to and accessibility to recruitment networks, is necessary for political mobilization (Klandermans & Oegama, 1987). Studying recruitment as networks brings a number of advantages. Networks allow us to quantify and explore relationships across institutional arrangements and to detect consistencies in behavior. Additionally, networks allow us to study resources and structures simultaneously.

**Figure 4.1 Nodes and Ties**

Network Analysis has two basic elements: nodes and ties. Nodes are the actors/entities (this can be anything from a person to a government unit to a type of protein) and ties are the relationships between two nodes. In Figure 4.1 *Nodes and Ties*, we have three nodes labeled Kim, Ann and May and two ties. We have a tie between Kim and Ann and a tie between Ann and May. In practice, ties can represent a number of relationships: anything
from a business relationship between two entrepreneurs (Burt, 1997) to co-expression of two genes in tissue samples (Zhang & Hovarth, 2005). In the network presented here, ties represent relationship roles between individuals, be they marital relationships or work-based relationships. Moreover, the ties presented in the network are weighted to capture the intensity of the relationships being reported.

Two nodes with a relationship are each other’s alters. Relationships can be measured as undirected (all relationships in the network are assumed to be mutual) or directed (node A can claim a tie with Node B, but Node B does not claim a tie with node A). For example, if we ask the question, “where do we go for medical advice?”, Pat may report a ‘tie’ to his Doctor, Sam. But, in this case, it is unlikely that when confronted with the same question that Sam will report a tie to Pat.

All of the exploration involved in social network analysis is based on patterns that emerge when we look at the presence or absence of ties between nodes. For example, we know that once two nodes establish a relationship, this increases the likelihood that they will share ties with one another’s alters. This is the idea behind balance theory (also known as transitivity) which proposes that if there is a tie between A and B, and a tie between B and C, then there is an increased probability that there will be a tie between A and C.

A study of network-based participation recognizes that a number of political activities are also social, thus requiring coordination and cooperation between individuals (Costa & Khan, 2002; Jackson, 2003; Leighley, 1995). Moreover, some of the rewards from
activity come just as much from the social interaction that is part of collective action as it does from achieving the target of that action (Francisco, 2010).

When dealing with a disparate and dispersed group, studying participation as networks allows us to understand how otherwise unconnected individuals join together for collective action. For example, protest requires an active and well-placed recruitment network in which key actors are both able and willing to bring in the numbers required to make mass action worthwhile (Klandermans & Oegama, 1987). Protest requires issues, organizations, and people to be organized. Networks are necessary for organization and numbers. Protest in Rome is often facilitated by inter-elite cooperation. Protest requires numbers; only when a critical mass is achieved does a threat become credible.

Just as networks aide protest, they may silence them. The Filipino community is one that protects its reputation at all costs. Being associated with protest could be damaging for a community where a majority of members make their living by working in Italian households as servants or child minders. Participation in nonconformist or challenging acts may be frowned upon within the community itself. One important Filipino association—with Chapters throughout the world—goes as far as to prohibit its members from participating in any form of protest.

4.5 Migrant community networks in action

Although there is a low level of participation in activism in the mainstream, I observed a high degree of participation in national-community centered events. One of the weaknesses of research on minority politics is its disregard of ethnic or within community participation. When it does consider within community participation, it is
often treated as deleterious to political integration. Jones Correa (1998) proposes that a “politics of in between” permits migrants to participate in politics but on their own terms. Empirical work by Barreto and Munoz (2003) support his argument that migrants who are best able to balance a politics of home country with a politics of host --- that is, practice this politics of in-between --- also perform well in other aspects of socio-economic integration. Their performance is even better than those who participate only in host politics. Another reason to consider within community participation is that, if we consider that even illegal immigrants can (and do) participate in their community’s politics, including within community participation in our investigation of migrant politics gives a more complete picture of migrant desire for political expression.

Within community migrant political participation provides a pipeline for migrant political participation into the mainstream. First, political participation is said to beget further participation. And second, within community mobilization provides social structures that can be activated for participation in other acts. Introducing Italians to the non-conflictual nature of migrant cultures is one of the chief aims of many leaders in Italy. For Romulo Salvador, this sensibilization (Montuori, 2007) of Italian citizens to the migrant presence is an important function of his office. He explains,

“we are convinced that we have to show that the city is positively getting more and more multicultural and it’s a positive thing for the city. So we hold projects, conventions, film showings, every aspect of cultural event that we can collaborate with the Assessor of the Cultura. ... all of these things that the Italians must see for them to be able to realize that it is a good thing, having migrant[s]...”14

14 Taken from Transcript of Interview 1 with Romulo Salvador. Interview given in English and Tagalog.
In the spring of 2011, countless projects of cultural education were undertaken by migrants and Italians alike. The larger efforts were always undertaken with the support of or organized by Italian institutional intermediaries.

Below, we see photographic examples of two such events. The first picture, on the left, is part of the celebration of the Bolivian New Year. This event was organized by the new Ambassador from Bolivia in cooperation with Association heads and with Bolivian professionals working at the Food and Agriculture Organization (of the United Nations). Their institutional relationships eased the process of collecting all of the necessary permits from the City.

A smaller, less public celebration was hosted in the Mercato della Piazza Vittorio, in the Esquilino neighborhood a few days earlier. This was organized by an Italian Association housed in the market in coordination with a parents’ association of the nearby school and a Catholic Association.

In most cases, these events are attended by the same faces, which more often than not are ethnic rather than Italian. The effectiveness of these cultural events in educating and
informing Italians about migrant cultures is questionable. However, they bring unplanned benefits to immigrant communities. They bring migrant activists in contact with other activists and allow them to make important connections for their next project. Moreover, the successful planning and execution of a cultural event indicates a group’s ability to amass a crowd and buys social credit for future exchanges, especially between immigrants and Italians.

One of the emerging central associations of the Philippine community was born out of such efforts. In the beginning, the Philippine Independence Day event was organized by the embassy, Filipino professionals working at one of the many international organizations in Rome, and leaders of the Filipino migrant community (FilComm). This was the basis for some of the first exchanges between these upper middle class Filipino professionals and the FilComm leaders (many of whom worked as domestic helpers).

The Independence Day celebrations culminated in 1998 with its 100-year celebration. The event’s planning even resulted in an association, the Philippine Independence Day Association, which is composed of leaders from the FilComm (Philippine Community). Today, PIDA is one of the few Filipino “registered associations”\(^\text{15}\) whose membership includes the most active of FilComm leaders. Because PIDA meets at the embassy and is staffed by embassy employees, it provides a new channel through which these leaders can communicate and make proposals and work with the embassy. It also keeps the embassy on top of developments within the Philippine community in Rome.

\(^\text{15}\) The Italian government provides guidelines for associations in Italy. Many immigrant associations do not follow these guidelines
Building off relationships in PIDA, some Filcomm leaders later went on to access International NGO funds through the intercession of their Filipino contacts. Informant 715 was one Filipino leader who learned how to leverage her relationships to initially access funds and resources from the Food and Agriculture organization through her relationships with Informant 701, and later to access funds from the City of Rome through her relationships with Informant 705.

Then Filipino Ambassador to Italy, Romeo Manalo, learned—at cost to his career as Ambassador—the importance of respecting these informal yet institutionalized social networks. At issue were the rules on how Filipino names were to be published in Italian legal documents. Filipino names follow a Spanish model which follows the form: First Name, Middle Name, and Last Name. The middle name is the mother’s maiden name. This is a system that is not compatible with the Italian system. Because legal documents are important for maintaining legal status, Filipinos are eager to avoid the problems that can emerge from having ‘different’ names on different documents.

When he assumed office, the ambassador came to an agreement with the Ministry of the Interior on how the agency would deal with Filipino names. This is not the first time that Filipino names have been seen as an issue requiring administrative attention. The last time this issue was touched was about 5 years prior when the Ministry of the Interior contacted the embassy and an agreement was made.
In response, the Filipino community protested. 

“So people protested the fee for the certification, they organized a large protest to contest this action. So the embassy reduced this fee. After five years, the situation was neutralized as everyone began to adopt the institutional rules.” (2011, own translation).

History repeated itself with Ambassador Manalo. Once again, the format of Filipino names on Italian documents such as the permit to stay was changed through an agreement with the Minister of the Interior. And once again, Filipinos protested.

Filipinos interpreted the ambassador’s decision as a betrayal. Memories of the last policy change and the inconveniences it created are still fresh in Filipino memories. Informant 787 said, “Pipila (get in line), babayad (pay), in the past, it was a really negative month-long experience which Filipinos in Rome remember. One can lose face with employer because of frequent absences.” “It is a hassle.” echoes Informant 836 in an interview given a week later. This religious leader and member of PIDA continued, "especially for those paid by the hour, it’s a hassle to have to get the certification from the embassy....”

Additionally, Filipinos took issue with the fact that the ambassador failed to disclose that he had initiated the policy change. Informant 714 predicted, “so, who will they fight against? The ambassador who officially wrote to the Ministero del Intero to advice the agency not to consider our middle name any longer. We have the prova, or the proof. We have the affidavit that the Ministero provides to the service desk. So we have the copies of what he did not tell people. Okay?” (own translation).

However, the main problem that Informant 787 and the FilComm (Filipino Community Leaders) found with the action was that they were not consulted. This is another example where informal networks (knowing and adhering to the standard operating procedures in
a community) was seen as more legitimate than the formal networks. As the Ambassador, Mr. Manalo was within his rights to contact the Italian government and establish a policy for documents. However, he ignored long-standing norms in the Filipino community which involved a process of discussion and feedback with key stakeholders. “Brings to question the purpose of communities if ambassador does not consult them…,” continues Informant 787. “Many people feel disrespected by the ambassador. Kung gusto mong mahalin ka, tatanungin mo ang iyong nasasakupan (if you want to be loved, consult the people in your territory).”

Political actions such as these, those centered within the ethnic community, provide opportunities to participate in civil society without learning host language or participating in other mainstream activities. While ethnic groups and their members are often only active within their national community, their efforts rarely promote their national group’s interests in the mainstream (Uslaner & Conley, 2003). There are many separate and diverse collective action problems residing within and confronting the various nationalities that reside in Rome. It is often the case that these communities and their leadership seek to address these problems for themselves without the intervention of Italian authorities. These actions create multiple layers of governance structures and sometimes interfere with the proper implementation of Italian policies.

Participation in Italian society has a practical aspect that feeds into the political. Two important demographic shifts promise to change the dynamics of migrant participation in mainstream society. The first is the aging of the migrant worker, resulting in the presence of a retirement-age group who, because of the particularities and bureaucratic limitations
of the Italian pension systems, may find it more economically feasible to retire in Italy. The second trend is the growing presence of children whose numbers increased rapidly as family reunification was made possible through the Martelli Act of 1990. Not only do both trends create new needs around which the community must organize, they also lower the propensity for return migration and change the nature and number of institutional and social contact with Italians.

Having a family both isolates and introduces adults into politics. Family life may restrict the time available for political and related civic activities (Brady et al, 1995). However, family life also increases exposure to socializing institutions. Their children’s presence creates new interactions with Italians which open opportunities outside their national group. A case in point is Informant 724 a Filipina who, through her activities as a cultural mediator at her child’s school, has expanded her exposure and knowledge of Italian politics and processes. Her participation in the school-based association introduces other migrant parents to the institution and its services.

Schools are also places where co-ethnics may meet each other and perhaps organize (Zhou, 2004). Cultural constraints can limit Bangladeshi women’s participation in the social life of Italians. For many of the Bangladeshi women interviewed for the study, the language courses were an opportunity not just to learn Italian, but also to have social interaction outside of their homes. One of these women, Informant 748, used the contacts she made with Italian Informant 744 to lobby for Bangladeshi women. She currently serves as the vice president of his association. Ironically, her relationship with Informant
Informant 744 has increased connections to her co-nationals. One in particular, Informant 731 who works under contract for the city and is the secretary of Informant 744’s association.

One of the parents and active members of Informant 742’s school’s Parent Teacher Organization, Informant 763, spoke of the school’s early experience with immigration. “It became immediately clear that we needed shared spaces to overcome the differences resulting from parents’ diverse paces of life.” (2011, own translation) Informant 748, a cultural mediator for an Italian association (that of Informant 745), also began her career in Italy by leveraging relationships formed as a parent. Her first job, she recalls, was in the school’s kindergarten. She was able to secure the job by making an inquiry to the father of her daughter’s classmate who, during this time, was serving as the PTO president. Today, Informant 748 serves as the PTO’s treasurer.
4.21 The Survey Sample

Most of the migrants surveyed lived in Italy for five years or more. Thus, a reasonable portion of respondents were eligible to vote in administrative elections. The average period of stay was 11.1 (with a standard deviation of 8.6 years), and minimum period of stay was less than one year, while the maximum was forty years. When comparing our three target populations, we see that—on average—Filipino respondents have been in Rome longer. Filipinos were among the first national groups to arrive in Italy. The high standard deviation in period of stay suggests that a good number of Filipino respondents arrived early and that new waves of Filipino migrants continue to arrive in Italy.

*Period of stay* is a measure whose inclusion in models of participation is supported by the expectation that exposure to host institutions increases integration and, therefore, participation. As exposure to host society increases with the period of stay, social distance between migrants and host should be attenuated.

As shown in Table 4.1 *Attributes of Survey Respondents*, most of the respondents fall in two age brackets: 25-34 (28% of survey respondents) and 35-44 (31% of survey respondents) which represent the prime working years of the sample. This is reasonable to expect in a migrant population with relatively novel migration flows (there are very few second generation migrants and 3rd generation migrants are quite rare) and where a majority of the new arrivals are motivated to migrate by economic opportunity. These are age groups that should have higher rates of participation compared to others (Jennings, 1980). Because of the concentration of migrants in two age cohorts, it would not have been reasonable to measure participation as a consequence of age.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age Cohort</th>
<th>Average Years of School</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
<th>Average Period of Stay</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eritrea</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sudan</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Salvador</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As the outcomes of the survey were measured as binary values (“1” for participate and “0” for not), a logistic regression model was employed to model migrant participation. The results of the analysis are given in Table 4.2 *Binary Logistic Regression for Voting and Protesting*. These findings were supplemented with interview records, news records, and observations from participant observation.

### 4.6 They Can’t: A Questions of Resources

Low participation in both voting and protests were reported by respondents. When comparing voting to protest, 34.7 percent of those who were eligible to vote did while 21.5 percent of respondents reported having participated in protest. In Rome, migrants surveyed and interviewed expressed interest in Italian politics, especially in policies on immigration; however, they reported little interest in participating. Informant 795 succinctly stated, “participating in politics is a luxury.” The Brazilian employee of one of the trade union’s local service desk, Informant 850, provided greater detail saying, “they [immigrants] are always worried, I think, since there are many other immigrants they believe that if they miss one day of work they may be fired. And since they have come to Italy to work and to earn money to send home, this is their main priority.” (2011, own translation)

There was a weak correlation between these activities (Pearson’s R of .15) suggesting a difference between migrants who voted and migrants that participated in protest. These differences are network driven rather than trait driven.

Unlike Filipinos, the national boundaries of the Peruvian and Bangladeshi communities in Rome are blurred by the presence of other national groups with whom they share
substantial cultural and historical similarities. These similarities facilitate the cultivation of coordinated networks that can easily amass the numbers necessary for meaningful collective action.

34 (24 percent) of the survey respondents came from South Asia. The South-Asian identity is germane to political participation. Informant 790 identified the groups involved in protest. “In Rome, the South Asian community, only Indians, Bangladeshis, and Pakistanis are moving in the squares [protesting]. In Naples, Casserta, it is only the African world of Ghana and Nigeria. In Florence, North, it is organized and run by CGIL, UIL [two labor unions] because everyone there is a union member.”\textsuperscript{xxiii} (2011, own translation). The South Asian community is known to be particularly responsive to its leaders’ appeals for participation.

The results of the logistic regression (shown in Table 4.2 \textit{Binary Logistic Regression for Voting and Protesting}) indicate that educational attainment was not a significant predictor of participation. This suggests that status (that of having a good job) may be more important than socialization (school-centered learning about the importance of civic and political participation) in contributing to the role education plays in predicting political participation.

In my model, period of stay is not a strong estimator of either act of political participation while the other measure of integration I included, language proficiency, was significant only for voting. Similarly, the regression estimates (see Table 4.1 again) for gender (that is being male) indicate that it is not a significant predictor of political participation which contradicts previous research on political participation that has found a gender gap that
favors males (Nie et al., 1974; Conway, Steuernagel, & Ahern, 2005). Taken together, these findings suggest that the predictors of trait-based models, which have been so reliable for comparing participation across Socio Economic Status (SES) categories, are not predictors themselves but are indicators of the social forces underlying participation.

**Table 4.2 Binary Logistic Regression for Voting and Protesting**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Voting</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Protesting</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender(1)</td>
<td>.885</td>
<td>.837</td>
<td>.756</td>
<td>.553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period of Stay</td>
<td>1.119</td>
<td>.067</td>
<td>1.013</td>
<td>.710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim(1)</td>
<td>5.623</td>
<td>.217</td>
<td>.514</td>
<td>.391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years of School</td>
<td>.981</td>
<td>.852</td>
<td>.991</td>
<td>.914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction: Democracy and Period of Stay</td>
<td>.992</td>
<td>.279</td>
<td>1.001</td>
<td>.763</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>1.509</td>
<td>.690</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groups(1)</td>
<td>.803</td>
<td>.709</td>
<td>.428</td>
<td>.069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family In Rome</td>
<td>1.245</td>
<td>.520</td>
<td>1.503</td>
<td>.151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March(1)</td>
<td>.436</td>
<td>.166</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>.077</td>
<td>.188</td>
<td>.465</td>
<td>.577</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The case of Italy where migration is normally driven by gendered migration chains (Knights, 1993; Ambrosini, 2007) provides some interesting insights. 74 (53 percent) of those surveyed were women (see Table 1.1), possibly because of the overrepresentation of Filipinos in the sample (58 percent of female respondents were Filipino).

Theories of the conjugal contract suggest that when women’s economic contribution to the family increases, they can renegotiate their position in the household (Sen, 1999). Since female participation in politics tends to be centered on their gendered roles (Verba et al., 1995; Jennings, 1983), a shift in gendered roles favoring women may translate to a
rise in female migrant political activity (Jones-Correa, 1998). The survey findings reflect the strong tendency for migration to Italy to be headed by female migratory chains. Within communities constructed on female migratory chains, women often hold important positions of leadership and responsibility.

Conversely, in male driven migratory waves, the possibility of shedding gender roles varies depending on the patriarchal predispositions carried by the male partner (Moon, 2003). Women that come at the tail end of a male-headed migratory chain often find themselves suddenly thrust into the role of “symbolic markers of ethnicity who are responsible for securing and maintaining the boundaries between their ethno-cultural community” and consequently experience more acute forms of subjugation (Spitzer et al., 2003). As such, cultural expectations become more intense when they migrate and have consequences for political participation by women from these national groups.

Another interesting result of the analysis concerns group membership; that is, it indicates that group membership generally has negligible impact on participation. Group membership is seen as a key conduit for political participation (for a review see McClurg, 2003). It is even considered by some to be a form of migrant political participation (Martiniello, 2005). The standardized estimates for group membership were low (.823 for voting and .428 for protesting) and insignificant. If one is a member of a group with few important social contacts in the recruitment network, membership does not easily translate into participation.

In my stay in Rome, I observed that one type of group, religious groups, seem to be able to effectively mobilize members to participate. Similarly, in my analysis of survey
results, religion emerges as a salient to political identity. In the case of my survey, being Muslim had a significant effect on voting. The rules on associationism in Europe encourage Muslim groups to organize more as political or social associations rather than religious ones (Soysal, 2000); behavior that is different from more established Christian groups.

This effect is heightened by the socio-political environment for Muslims in Europe. Harding (2012: p.3) observes, “the defining term was Muslim: what Muslims did and thought was suddenly central to the immigration debate. Increasingly, the debate was about protecting European values by trying to bring existing minorities into line.” In such an environment, religion becomes a motivation for mobilization. Alex-Assensoh and Assensoh (2001: p. 888) write, “political behavior is socially contingent”.

An emerging migrant leader from the second generation spoke of a mass public prayer that she had organized in Rome’s main square, “Many immigrant children attend school and many of them, during the hour for religion \(^\text{17}\) remain like this [she gestures, slouching, eyes to the ground] waiting for the hour to finish. We organized this public prayer to make the State understand that they need to open their eyes and understand that it is not only Italians who are there, there are also foreigners and we need to serve these foreigners as well.” \(^\text{\text{xxiv}}\) (2011, own translation). Islam supersedes national and ethnic identities and has the power to unite people across ethnicities and national boundaries.

Usually, education and other forms of human capital confer an opportunity to improve status through employment. Verba et al. (1995) show that education and occupation do

\(^{17}\)Religion – that is Catholic education - is a required course in Italian public schools.
more than provide the financial wherewithal for participation, they create conditions that permit individuals to hone skills that are transferable to the public sphere, a socio-political variant of on-the-job-training (Brady et al., 1995). In her mobilization model, Leighley (1995) proposes that it is not wealth but social position that promotes political participation by determining the likelihood that an individual will be invited (recruited) to and expected (pressured) to participate in political activity.

Context matters greatly when considering the joint experience of blue collar, non-Western immigrants in Italy. For example, in Italy, there are special circumstances where education (found to be so powerful in predicting participation under other settings) is greatly diminished. Most of the new jobs in the last 2-3 years have been created in low-skill occupations. As a result, we observe that immigrant labor is commonly employed in the lower rungs of a highly bifurcated labor market. Despite reporting high levels of educational attainment, the top three occupations represented in the survey were domestic or reproductive work (55 respondents, 39 percent of sample), entrepreneurship or self-employment (18 respondents, 13 percent of sample), and food service or production occupations (12 respondents, 9 percent of sample). Entrepreneurship is one of the ways in which migrants have tried to circumvent discrimination in the labor market (Ndofor & Priem, 2011; Zhou, 2004), particularly in the case of women (Ambrosini, 2001).

When occupation was cross tabulated against participation, entrepreneurs did not show significantly higher rates of participation in either voting or protest. However, when we look at the election results (see Table 4.3 Outcomes of Municipal Elections, by Nationality and by Occupation), we see entrepreneurial participation in the more ‘costly
forms’ of electoral politics such as campaigning or running for office. Entrepreneurs participate in migrant politics and this is done at a high level. A quick look at the results of the municipal elections (see Table 4.3) shows how active entrepreneurs are in migrant politics in Rome. 15 of the 23 positions were won by entrepreneurs. Many entrepreneurs serve their communities in multiple capacities.

It is difficult to reconcile what is conventionally\textsuperscript{18} considered profit-making activity with public pursuits. However, the findings of this research support the argument that entrepreneurship is one of the most social occupations that exists (Ulhoi, 2005). Since the dividing line between social and political activity is thin, porous, and often traversed (Putnam, 2000; Verba et al., 1995, Verba & Nie, 1972), entrepreneurs should be as politically adept as they are socially adept.

Previous studies show that entrepreneurs tend to be committed to their communities (Payne & Joyner, 2006). Not only are entrepreneurs dependent on their ‘teams’ and communities for their livelihood, a reputation for fairness and trustworthiness is, in the end, what promotes the exchanges that keeps an enterprise going (Fukuyama, 2001; Neace, 1999), particularly ethnic entrepreneurs who are largely dependent on the ethnic community for survival (Chaganti & Greene, 2002). Studies have shown that entrepreneurs who select an enclave strategy often allow community-based concerns to override profit-motivated concerns in their decision making (Menzies et al, 2007; Chaganti & Greene, 2002; Portes & Sensenbrenner, 1993).

\textsuperscript{18} Arguably, the entire range of human activity is profit driven (Companys and McMullen, 2007)
Seven Bangladeshi candidates won positions as adjunct councilors and two secured places on the consultative body. These campaigns were organized by two centrally located businessmen, Informant 819 and Informant 790. These two men are the most nominated figures of authority in the Bangladeshi social network. Even Italians that provide social services to the Bangladeshi community recognize the central positions of these two figures. The activities of these two men have increased the economic power of Bangladeshis in Rome and made them a national group that is recognized, considered, and consulted.

When most nodes within a community have similar social status, the horizontal social network exhibits ‘flatter’ relationship structures – that is, relationship structures with low
measures of hierarchy (see Chapter 6). This carries important implications for group mobilization. While this may contribute to solidarity, it may also impede organization. An important consideration in the study of political participation is the role of those who coordinate action and an ideal structure within which to organize. Within these structures leadership is important. The idea of leadership makes relevant both social status and networks. It marries the resource model to the recruitment model.

Take the example of Filipinos who are mostly employed as domestic helpers. The flatness of their social networks means that exercising leadership can be time consuming. The phrase ‘servant leader’ was common among Filipino informants who note that it is difficult to command respect in a community where everyone is employed in the same occupation, holds the same wage, and faces similar sets of personal constraints and frustrations.

While entrepreneurship has been tightly linked to leadership in other arenas such as innovation, economic development, and civil society (Audretsch, 2001; Neace, 1999; Payne & Joyner, 2006; Schumpeter, 1934), it is barely mentioned in the literature on political and civic participation. In flat communities, there is the idea that leadership is easily substituted, which leads to a lot of instability (group mortality is high) and competition within the network. In trying to maintain loyalty, leaders in flat social networks often have to trade favors and capture substantive benefits for their followers. In flat communities, businessmen provide leadership that commands respect and authority.
4.7 Migrant Community Networks and Municipal Elections

For the elections in Rome, institutional support translated into institutional resources. For instance, the administration launched a campaign to raise awareness about the elections. It hired 19 immigrant leaders, the first consultative body, to promote the elections at locations frequented by immigrant groups. Despite this, not all communities participated in elections. It is here that the level of actual rather than formal organization—the social network—shows its value.

This is apparent in the difficulty African candidates experienced in securing positions in the districts and on the consultative body. Informant 768 observes, “for instance notwithstanding the African continent we have a very reasonable number of immigrants that are residents but in the experiences that we have had it appears that Africa had the lowest number of participants… I think that community organization then information sensibilization is part of it. The more a community is cohesive, the easier it is for them to understand the issues.”

It is not the largest communities but the best organized that managed to mobilize effectively. Paula Bidet Vivanco reported for La Reppublica (http://temi.repubblica.it/metropoli-online/roma-ecco-i-nuovi-consiglieri-aggiunti/?h=0):

“instead, the elections have confirmed the great initiative of the Asian immigrants, who also had the most organized campaigns and employed varied strategies: from using text messages to transporting lazy voters by bus. These efforts bore fruit: of the 19 districts, 7 went to Filipinos, 7 to Bangladeshis and 1 to an Indian.” (2011, own translation).

---

19 Interview given in English
Informant 707, Filipino and businessman, ran twice to be adjunct councilor. He recalls his friends’ encouragement to run for office: “you have many friends, you should run.” In 2006, he edged out the Bangladeshi incumbent. His campaign was managed by two association leaders. One was a union representative and radio personality (Informant 798) and the other was the leader of the area’s largest Filipino religious community (Informant 797). It was the ability to use his familiarity with the network and to exercise leadership that brought him success in the second campaign. Informant 797 has a long history of service in the district’s religious association and an extended period of residence in the district which enabled Informant 707 to go directly to the homes of the district’s Filipino residents in order to bus these voters back and forth to the ballots.

While it was this familiarity with the area that brought Informant 707 the electoral victory, it was his leadership that positioned him for it. When he ran for office in 2004, he came in 3rd after a Bangladeshi and a Peruvian. In the second round, he decided to talk to the other Filipino candidates. “In the first election, many Filipinos ran, there were three of us. So, I lost. A Bangladeshi won. So, in the following election [the one he won], I spoke with the Filipinos in the district. I said, if you think you will win, then you should run. If you don’t think you can, then only one of us should run.”xxvi (2011, own translation).

As cultivators of social capital and social networks, entrepreneurs like Informant 707 promote social action. The contributions that entrepreneurs make in developing and bringing products, services, and processes to market have long been the subject of scholarly inquiry (Schumpeter, 1934). Not only does the knowledge creation involved in
entrepreneurship promote external benefits such as economic development (Bramoulle & Kranton, 2007), it also yields an infrastructure for and ethos of exchange through the institution of routines that encourage simplified communication through the translation of information to digestible formats (Reagans & McEvily, 2003). The ‘project’ of business-making requires entrepreneurs to develop a shared language where new processes, products, and information are codified. The adoption of this shared language minimizes misunderstandings in ways that optimize current exchange relationships and promotes future exchanges (Abrams et al., 2003). These norms and instruments of exchange yield social as well as economic utility.

Given the multidimensionality of human relationships, these channels and techniques of information exchange are also deployed in political mobilization. More effective channels for the dissemination of political information increase psychological engagement in politics (MacLeod et al., 1999) and effective political participation. There is also a strong feedback effect; the institution and expansion of ‘working’ infrastructures for information dissemination encourage the type of human exchanges that promote entrepreneurial combinations and innovations in all spheres. These skills and capacities position immigrant entrepreneurs to make important contributions to their co-ethnics.

**4.8 Conclusion**

Immigrant political participation provides opportunities to observe networks in action. Survey results suggest that traits usually associated with participation, such as education or gender, have muted effects in the case of migrant political participation in Rome. This suggests that system-level traits hold more consequences for participation in this case.
The empirical research accomplished in Rome uncovers evidence that suggests that relationships are the current that pushes traits like status or race to be salient to participation.

Migration remains an uncrystallized issue in Italy. The nation’s immigration policy is a mix of loosely bundled intentions informed by vague ideas about an ideal Italy coupled with a poor understanding of the scope, scale, and intensity of migration. “The number one problem is the lack of a political model [that] deal[s] with immigration [which is] enforced in the political system,” says Romulo Salvador, Filipino migrant leader, businessman, and elected representative for Asia to the City of Rome. “Italy lacks a ‘working’ model for multi-cultural governance. And this absence of a policy response despite our presence in the country over 30 years creates difficulties for immigrants in Italy.”20 As policy-makers seesaw between the often incompatible goals of integration and security, they heighten migrant insecurity in the political process.

Migrant participation is a source of critical knowledge about immigration and citizenship that benefits and informs both migrants and host society. Not only did the elections bring migrants in to vote, it brought their leadership into closer contact with one another by providing another forum for exchange. Inter-elite cooperation can be useful for overcoming divisions between ethnic communities that tend to be embedded or exclusive, allowing them to jointly achieve political representation (Lipjhart, 1968). In a multiethnic Rome, political mobilization must cross the boundaries of the ethnic community.21 Informant 799 spoke about her decision to run under the ticket of Romulo Salvador as

---

20 Interview given in English
21 This study treats the population of co-ethnics sharing a national origin living within a city as the community, e.g. the Albanese community.
necessary to access the Filipinos vote. In Informant 799’s district, Filipinos have established and stable networks for political mobilization. Similarly, James John Mavelil was the only Indian to win a seat in part because of Mr. Salvador’s relationships. In a follow-up phone interview with the Adjunct Councilor, he described the political maneuvering and negotiations involved in building his campaign ticket. According to Mr. Salvador, an important Indian leader approached him and promised him the Indian vote in exchange for including Mr. Maviel as a candidate on his ticket.

Since this ‘experiment’ is quite recent, the value of the newly instituted elected positions is still debated. The positions carry little substantive power: foreign representatives do not vote in quorum. For some migrant leaders, the institution of municipal elections served to increase rather than mitigate migrant political distrust. Informant 799, representative to the consultative body, reported great disenchantment with the process. Having served her fellow migrants for over a decade as an association head and cultural mediator she indicated that she would not run again. She explained, “if you really want to change things, if you want to improve things for immigrants, if you really want to do this, then you must become a citizen. Without citizenship, you are nothing” (own translation).

This disenchantment is seen throughout the migrant community. It results from a perceived lack of commitment on the part of the Italians to promote immigrant political rights. Immigrant leaders are skeptical about the motives of their Italian political advocates. The opinion of an important Moroccan businessman and leader, Informant 795, is commonly shared by migrants from all walks of life. “At times, when things are
not going well for their party, those who are, perhaps, in the opposition party bring attention to ‘this thing here’. But it is not in principal rooted in ‘this thing here’, no. If they were to organize for this, you would be able to feel the weight of it give...even from the parties who are in power. They go in opposition but like this...because, if you go to see the presence when they go to vote on laws, here there is no presence. Those who are there, most of them don’t vote here or there, and they are the majority. And so that (the security act) passes easily. That is, this is the mechanism \textsuperscript{\textit{xxxviii}} (2011, own translation).

The very structure of the elections: one that allocates the most coveted elected positions to each continent makes the elections a divisive force among ethnicities (Montuori, 2007). The four representatives receive remuneration from the City as well as other benefits. The members of the consultative body and the 19 district representatives, on the other hand, participate as volunteers.

While the 19 district Adjunct Councilor positions have been set up as majority contests, the 4 positions in central government were structured differently. Each of the central Adjunct Councilor positions was set up as a contest between contestants from each continent. There is a position reserved for the Americas, Asia, Africa, and Eastern Europe. Thus, the contests are based on nationalities and jeopardize interethnic cooperation. These rules result in competitions that divide national groups and disincentivize multiethnic coordination.

Having low political power—that is no vote—immigrants are more a cause than a constituency in Italy, their success depends partially on convincing Italian voters to support their cause. Therefore, networks that can access conduits to Italian voters are
critical for the success of migrant political action. In the following chapters, I employ graph-theoretic approaches to quantify and compare the relationships that have been observed in this chapter.
Interview records were the base for the construction of the 396-node network of referrals that is described here. This is a network composed primarily of migrant leaders and their Italian contacts. It is a directed network, which means it does not assume that all relationships are reciprocated. Rather, it uses the number of ‘referrals’ that a node (an individual in the network) reports (Out-Degrees) to measure that node’s access to different resources. In that same line, it uses the number of referrals that a node receives (In-Degrees), what I call nominations, to indicate the extent to which that node functions as a point of access to resources or information. In a directed network, we distinguish between people who we know and people who know us.

**Figure 5.1 Map of In-Degrees, Whole Network**
A simple way to look at these measures is to consider them visually. In Figure 5.1 *Map of In-Degrees, Whole Network* we see a map of the entire 396 person network. The map considers the *geodistance* (lowest *path*) between nodes so it reflects some of the tendencies to cluster together in groups. A path is the number of relationships that must be passed to connect a ‘sending node’ to a ‘target node’. The size of each node in the network indicates the number of nominations (In-Degrees) that the node received.

Five\(^{22}\) distinct clusters are distinguishable from Figure 5.1. In each cluster there are individuals with higher authority (greater number of referrals), as shown by the size of their node. Moreover, in at least three cases, we see that these nodes provide the sole connecting relationships between their associates (alters) and other clusters. The relationships that the node makes between his/her group and another group are what we call *bridges*. Bridges are defined by Granovetter (1973) as “the line in the network that contains the only path between two points” (page 1364). This path or bridge constitutes those weak ties that he proposes promote dynamic exchanges that amplify the productive outputs of relationships.

This visual representation also illustrates that it is instructive to see a network as a structure within a structure that is within a structure (Hanneman & Riddle, 2002). A network is never uniformly dense. Relationships tend to be concentrated in subgroups called clusters, components, and cliques. Each of these subgroup types contains different relationship structures. For example, a clique requires that all nodes within the subgroup are directly connected by a certain number of direct relationships or ties, while in a

\(^{22}\) In truth, an analysis of the network identified nine distinct network components. I provide these components’ properties in the next chapter.
component, nodes are connected by paths rather than ties. In essence, components are ‘relaxed versions’ of cliques. The composition and location of these subgroups are what drive exchange in a network (Cowan & Jonard, 2004; Epstein, 1969).

The willingness to share opportunities increases with the strength of a relationship. Granovetter (1973) proposes that the strength of a tie comes from some combination of time, emotional intensity, intimacy, and reciprocity. Reciprocity is the only measure that can be calculated using a simple application of graph theoretic methods. The remaining qualities must be inferred through some other method. I accomplish this by weighting the relationships. The relationships measured here range from very strong (score 9 for marriage) to very weak (score 0 for no relationship).

The table below, Table 5.1 Characteristics of Relationships, describes the types of relationships that the network is composed of. It takes and reports the principal relationship between nodes (many nodes have multi-faceted relationships; for example, some are both co-workers and friends). The intensity of a relationship is partially determined by the quality of the tie that underpins it. For example, I expect, all other things held equal, that spouses have stronger relationships than people who belong to the same association.
Table 5.1 Characteristics of Relationships

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptive Statistic</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Nodes</td>
<td>396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Ties Present</td>
<td>1981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Network Density</td>
<td>0.0134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationalities Represented</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Type of Relationship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Relationship</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Related</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Together</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Same Association</td>
<td>598</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work together on projects</td>
<td>575</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meets routinely</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acquaintances</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has heard of</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Coleman (1990, Chap. 5) writes, “trust is committing to an exchange before you know how the other person will behave. You anticipate cooperation from the other person, but you commit to the exchange before you know how the other person will behave.” Trust is an important product of intense relationships. The more intense a relationship, the more costly it is to break, and thus nodes trust just as much in the relationship itself, what it denotes, as they do in the individual with whom they share that relationship.

Trust often determines who gets what. For example, Informant 703, who serves in many capacities in Rome, has a long working relationship with some of the important news outlets in the city. In fact, she publishes her own newspaper, one of the two most widely
circulated Filipino language newspapers in Italy. When a lucrative opportunity to work for another media outlet came to her attention, she recruited her close friend 709 for the post. She justifies this decision saying,

“The key word here is trust. Like you said, the decision to hire [Informant 709] was not my decision. Although, I already saw the curriculum, and I knew that [Informant 709] was qualified, even overqualified. I saw the potential and even though [Informant 709] is a Councilor and, by title, higher status than me, I am quite happy that the elected position has not caused any conflicts between us.”

Since the new position was closely tied to her job and would require some coordination, Informant 703 preferred someone whom she could trust.

Similarly, when responding to collective action problems, many migrant leaders show strong preferences for working with familiars rather than seeking opportunity elsewhere. Informant 709 is a businessman and political representative who shortly after entering migrant politics decided to start a charity with his wife. One of the charitable efforts for which they are most famous is the clothing drive that they organized. Informant 707 felt that it would be more effective to work with trusted friends who ran shipping businesses than with all Filipinos who owned shipping businesses. Not only did he trust his friends to be effective, but he could also rely on them to be willing to ship greater quantities as a favor to him. The strong preference for familiars dually stabilizes and constrains network structures.

It is interesting to observe that some subjects (9% of network nodes) nominated ‘acquaintances’, suggesting that they themselves recognize the opportunities in these contacts. Additionally, there are a few spouses (1% of network nodes) and relatives (2%
of network nodes) in this network. In many cases, married couples are both critical nodes in the network. I give four examples below:

Node 819 is one of two central figures in the Bangladeshi network. He is a businessman (he owns thirteen businesses) and an association head. His wife, Node 822, is a member of the consultative body to the City and also a business owner. Her election to the consultative body in 2006 allowed him to form new relationships—most notably with important women’s groups. His many businesses mean that Node 819’s influence continues to grow. Because of his largest business, Node 819 has had a long relationship with Node 704, another central player in the network, whose business is one metro stop away from 819’s main business.

Node 704 owns a business and is an important political representative from the Filipino community. His wife, Node 897, manages their business and her relationship with other business owners in the vicinity of Termini, including Node 718 (an remittance center manager who also serves Chinese businesses) provide additional help and support for her husband’s political activities. The couple’s membership in the association headed by Node 705 launched his political career and aided him in making important connections with Node 761 and Node 762.

Node 762 was the Italian contact that alerted Node 705 to an opportunity for government funding that enabled her association to establish the first Filipino managed public daycare in Rome. Node 762 and her husband,
Node 761, both work for CARITAS, one of the largest Catholic charities in Rome. He works in Research and she for an immigration service desk. Together they have brought many opportunities to immigrant communities.

Nodes 701 and 1088 are relative newcomers to the network of migrant ‘leaders’. They are founders of one of the few formally registered Filipino associations in Rome. It began with their involvement in the Filipino chaplaincy’s family ministry. Their social entrepreneurship program has units throughout Italy. Part of their success is their ability to take advantage from Node 1088’s social status (he is a Director at one of the largest International NGOs in Rome) and to leverage his wife’s connections to one of the most prestigious private Catholic universities in the Philippines.

A majority of the relationships identified are between members of the same association (30% of ties), followed by ties between nodes that routinely work together on projects (29% of ties). This suggests that organizational structures encourage the maintenance of stable relationships. The high number of relationships based on cooperative efforts, “work together on projects,” indicates that there are a lot of cross-organizational projects in the community. Interview records show that in many cases, cross-organizational coordination is the only way to amass the necessary resources and attention to bring an effort to bear. This suggests that networks are just as central as membership for mobilizing resources (Bramoulle & Kranton, 2007).
Details about each node’s occupation are given in Table 5.2 *Node Occupational Information*. Most of the nodes make their living as employees of Italians (146 nodes or 37% of network nodes) and their participation in the network is as a volunteer unlike, association heads who earn a stipend through participation. These nodes have low In-Degrees even if, in some cases, they have high Out-Degrees. Simply put, they know where to go for resources, but they are rarely expected to give resources.

**Table 5.2 Node Occupational Information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>As percent of Total Network</th>
<th>Italian</th>
<th>Bangladeshi</th>
<th>Filipino</th>
<th>Peruvian</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed by Italians</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association Head</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Businessperson</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association Member</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Employee</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embassy or Consulate Employee</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade Union Representative</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Leader</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee, ethnic business</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journalist</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee at International NGO</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawyer</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Works at University in Country of Origin</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member Political Party</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambassador</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The second largest employment category is nodes that are employed by associations (71 network nodes are employed as association heads and 54 as association employees/members). This confirms that ethnic associations are important points of contact in the network. Ethnic association leaders are critical nodes who provide leadership and connectivity in their own clusters as well as bridging relationships to Italians.
TABLE 5.3. Roles of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political Representation</th>
<th>Government Administration</th>
<th>Associational Activities</th>
<th>Patronato</th>
<th>Organizing Events</th>
<th>Cultural Mediation</th>
<th>Legal Services</th>
<th>Religious Services</th>
<th>Consular Services</th>
<th>Labor Union</th>
<th>Employment and Training</th>
<th>Media and Information</th>
<th>Private Individual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambassador</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embassy or Consulate Employee</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association Head</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association Member</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee, ethnic business</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed by Italians</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee at International NGO</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawyer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Leader</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journalist</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member Political Party</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Employee</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade Union Representative</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Works at University in Country of Origin</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The third largest category was Businessperson (51 nodes). Business owners share three qualities that are advantageous in civic engagement. First, by virtue of their occupation, they command respect. This facilitates the exercise of leadership. The level of respect given to immigrant business owners also allows them to deal on more equal footing with Italians. Second, their occupation provides increased physical autonomy. And finally, they are easier to find and thus easier to recruit.

When we construct pivot tables that cross-tabulate node occupations against the roles they play in the network, we see that the small number of business people in the network participate in the network by filling important roles (see Table 5.3 Roles of Respondents). One ran his own migrant service desk, another served her community as a cultural mediator, three were involved in ‘Employment and Training’, nine were involved in ‘Associational Activities’, and twelve served as political representatives for their communities in Rome.

Adjunct Councilors provide a new conduit for Italian institutions and businesses to reach immigrants. There are reputational gains from service. Borrowing legitimacy and authority from City Government, these elected representatives become figures of authority in their communities. This legitimacy is akin to Burt’s (2000) idea of borrowed social capital. That is, nodes are able to avail of exchanges because of reputational gains from being associated with another node with a good reputation. Ten of the seventeen Adjunct Councilors in the network were business owners.

Node 704 shared the observation that immigrant businessmen enjoy more physical and financial autonomy; thus, they are able to participate in more activities than their peers.
Businessman, author, and association head Marco Wong exemplifies this. He reported that the many roles he serves in the community allow him to make a variety of connections that he can mobilize for pursuits in other roles. His adept employment of multiplex or multilayered relationships is what permits him to be effective in all the activities he pursues. He recounted in his interview:

“As a member of Associna, we have a lot of interactions too with various institutions. For example, we had a project with the Ministry of Interior, and so conducting this project, w. We have relationships with the questura, prefectura. And since the aim of the project was to improve the social inclusion of the Chinese community, we have also relationships with various associations, Chamber of Commerce, and so on. With my business, I have to do some entrepreneurship, Chinese, Filipino and Bangladesh community, because we distribute. And thirdly, as editor of this magazine, we have relationships with the companies that place ads in our magazine. The role that gives me money is the business I run. The other two are positions that I hold mostly for interest.”

What it takes, he asserts, is a good knowledge of how to mobilize one’s network,

“But I must say that I rely a lot on knowledge, meaning that of course I live out a network of relationships so sometimes I can delegate to others what can be done. So for example, very recently we started Italian classes for recent Chinese immigrants, and the first year I had to involve myself personally a lot. This year, the courses started and I didn’t have to go there because there were persons that could do it independently. So it is a question of being capable to organize first yourself and then involving others.”

I have proposed that businessmen function as important nodes in any community and in this migrant network in particular. So far, what I have shown is the strong presence of these nodes in the network. Now, I move on to illustrate businessmen’s network positions give them comparative advantages in playing leadership roles within their communities.
5.1 METHODS AND NETWORK MEASURES

Network analysts want to know how structural properties affect behavior beyond the effects of normative perescriptions, personal attributes, and dyadic relationships (Wellman, 1983). My analysis involves calculations based on each node’s stock of relationships. These calculations enable analysts to (1) locate the position of the node within the network and the advantages (or consequences) accruing from such positions (Kenis & Knoke, 2002), (2) describe how these positions compare to others in the network (Burt, 2000, 2001), and (3) describe and compare structures within and across networks (Wellman, 1983; Scott, 1988; Borgatti et al., 2005). In this chapter, I calculate network measures to accomplish the first two functions of network analysis.

Connectivity can be measured in a number of ways. It is a function of the number of actors that must be removed in order to leave some actors unconnected (Kenis & Knoke, 2002). One way to understand connectivity is through measures of centrality. The measure—In-Degree—that was employed in constructing the whole network map (Figure 5.1 Map of In-Degrees, Whole Network) is one such measure of centrality.

Measures of centrality were calculated using UCINET. Afterwards, descriptive statistics were calculated for each measure (how many nominations each node reports in interview). These statistics are reported in Table 5.4 Descriptive Statistics. And finally, because the propositions in this research regard occupational activity and network performance, centrality measures were cross-tabulated against each node’s primary occupation. Results for the cross-tabulations are reported using stock charts which permit

---

UCINET is a Social Network Analysis software that was developed by Stephen Borgatti, Lin Freeman, and Martin Everett.
the visualization of not only mean estimates but also the range of centrality that nodes in each occupation can score. If we look at Figure 5.2 *Out Degrees by Occupation*, for example, we see that some occupations have nodes with very similar centrality scores, whereas other occupations have nodes with very different scores.

### 5.2 Results

To begin, I feel that it is important to specify that the network being examined is an information network to which immigrants in Rome refer when seeking information related to their status as immigrants in Italy. In a formal information network, one would expect to see individuals with institutional affiliations, such as professionals working with immigrants or state agencies that serve immigrants. Because this is also a social network, we find the individuals we expected and individuals whose practical roles as conduits of information make them part of an informal informational network.

The centrality measure, Out-Degree, is an estimate of centrality that indicates how well-connected a person is with reference to the whole network, based on how many alters a person claims. The Out-Degrees in *this* network indicate the number of people a node reports as a routine or important contact to obtain reliable information and other forms of assistance. The emphasis on routine or ‘important’ contacts indicates that these ties are sufficiently bonded or established so that the node confidently approaches that alter for help or can refer others to that alter. Research published by Reagans and McEvily (2003) shows that relationships need to be sufficiently strong to facilitate complicated exchanges like new or complex information. Similarly, when making referrals, each node’s
reputation hinges on her referral’s ability to carry through with the promised service. Thus, the Out-Degrees in this network indicate each node’s access to resources.

While, on average, nodes that worked for International NGOs (most of these nodes worked for the United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization) reported higher Out-Degree scores (as we can see from Figure 5.2 *Out-Degrees by Occupation*), nodes working in two other occupations reported Out-Degree scores that separated them from others, *Business Owners* and *Public Employees*.

In general, the Out-Degree measures in this network were very low. Only five nodes had Out-Degrees greater than 0.15. These nodes were embassy/consulate employees, an association head, a business owner, and a public employee (an employee of the regional government). Especially in the case of the Italian government employees and embassy employees, these individuals’ occupational roles as representatives of government provided access to relationships that were beneficial for capturing selective benefits for themselves and their co-nationals.

Immigrants in the network who worked for the Italian government—those under the category *Public Employee*—were often employed in the capacity of cultural mediator. The type of work they do requires them to serve as an intermediary between state and immigrants. Similarly, Italian public employees in the network commonly cited their ability to connect with immigrants as a boon to their performance, and in some cases, they identified this as the attribute that allowed them to secure their position with the state/city: “knowing many people...knowing many experiences is certainly an asset that
brought me this job that begins with human experiences and lodges itself in entrepreneurial and productive activities” (Informant 777).\(^{xxxi}\)

**Figure 5.2 Out-Degrees by Occupation**

![Graph showing out-degrees by occupation](image)

Business owners, on the other hand, maintain expanded networks that include families and friends, on whom they rely for emotional support (Salaff & Greve, 2003), their business associates, and other institutional relationships. These relationships are necessary to find the capital necessary for business and to muster the confidence needed to establish a business. All of the entrepreneurs interviewed felt that relationships were...
(and remain) critical for establishing and running a business. Four examples are given below:

Node 784, owner of one of the few legally operating Filipino beauty salons in Rome, began by working alongside other Filipinos in an informally operating business near Piazza Repubblica. “Here,” she said, “when we cannot afford to do anything unless we do it together.”

Encouraged by her parish priest, she decided to take the training necessary to obtain a business license. Once she had obtained the necessary certifications, she once again turned to her community. She joined a *paluwagan*, which is an informal arrangement where each person gives a certain amount and the pool goes to one individual for a month and goes to another in subsequent months. It is a common way to gather a relatively big sum of money fast. With the money from the *paluwagan* and loans from her family, she was able to collect the 7,000 Euro start-up necessary for the business.

Node 1054 claims that she began her business by chance. Her sister’s Mauritian boyfriend opened a grocery store business but soon lost interest. Since the business was located in the city’s Filipino quarter, she saw the possibility in it. She and her sisters chipped in to pool the capital and ‘bought into’ the business. After 2 years of running it, the business is now licensed in her name, and she was able to circumvent the laborious and expensive bureaucratic requirements of business ownership in Italy.
Node 834 owns a business with his brother-in-law. His brother-in-law began two businesses about 10 years ago. Because increased competition has made running a business more difficult, the brother-in-law approached him for help (to mitigate uncertainty). Similarly, Node 879 had always wanted to start a business since he arrived in Italy in 1999. When it became clear that his brother could come to Italy, he felt that he had the necessary support to start the business. Following the advice of his friends, he opened a shop in the Bangladeshi neighborhood of Tor Pignatara.

Entrepreneurs often mobilize these relationships for a wide range of purposes. Many of the ethnic entrepreneurs, for example, found that it was necessary to widen their circle of familiars in order to establish, sustain, or grow a business. One informant confided, “you go to Piazza Venezia (to attend a political event) because you want to make new friends/customers” (Informant 784).

Perhaps the low Out-Degree scores are just a reflection of the fact that individuals in the network know where to go for things that they need. The sort of community-centered knowledge is akin to the quality of ‘mutual findability’ identified by Habyarimana, Humphreys, Posner, and Weinstein (2007), which permits co-ethnics to “draw from a reservoir of common cultural material, that makes it easier for community members to communicate and work together” and to maintain institutions because it is simpler for these individuals to “find and thus punish non-cooperators”. The small Out-Degree scores also reflect the fact that these arrangements are most effective for smaller groups (Olsen, 1965). In this case, it is most efficient and effective to only approach these people. This suggests that relationships in the network are concentrated rather than diffuse.
The quality of social capital is not within a node’s relationships, but in how these relationships position them to (1) build power or (2) access resources. Here, we look at two additional measures that reflect these qualities. The first is ‘Betweenness’ and the second is the ‘Authority’ measure.

As calculated in UCINET, Betweenness is the ratio of the “sum of times a node lies between two other nodes” to the “total possible times a node could lie between two other nodes”. It measures the extent to which a node serves as a conduit for exchange. According to Hannemann and Riddle (2005), this measure captures each node’s social power, given that “the more people depend on me to make connections with other people, the more power I have. If, however, two actors are connected by more than one geodesic (short) path, and I am not on all of them, I lose some power”. In sum, Betweenness reflects the extent to which a network relies on a node to function effectively.

When these measures are calculated, a majority of the nodes had Betweenness scores of .05 or less. This indicates that very few nodes in the network are actively involved in brokering exchanges within the network. Most nodes simply participate in or profit from activities or exchanges organized by others. Only one business owner and one association head had Betweenness scores greater than 0.15.
With a quick look at Figure 5.3 *Betweenness by Occupation*, it is apparent that once again, certain nodes in the business community report significantly higher measures of Betweenness. As one gets adept at brokering exchanges, the costs of engaging in such activities decline substantially.

Nodes with high Authority scores are considered reliable sources of information. As authority figures, they can leverage the respect given to them to mobilize action. Nodes with high Authority scores have been consistently named as people who are important
resources within the community. The four occupational categories with high Out-Degree measures (embassy/consulate employees, association heads, business owners, and public employees) also have high measures of Authority. In addition to this, union representatives emerged as having high Authority measures.

Once again, we see that, in this case, nodes working for International NFPs have high measures of centrality. When they choose to participate, these nodes introduce a lot of resources into their community, making them highly valued and sought after. There is also a perception that because these individuals tend to live separate lives from other immigrants, they are ‘above the fray’, so to speak, and not involved in the competitions and controversies that tend to be present in any dense social network.
Finally, many of the nodes working in NFPs worked for one of the important UN offices, the United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization. These positions are normally high responsibility positions, which means that most of these individuals either possess high scientific credentials, have high social influence in their country of origin, or both.

Table 5.4 Descriptive Statistics reports the descriptive statistics for all the centrality measures calculated, including the standard measures (Out-Degree, In-Degree, and Betweenness) and alternative measures (Hub and Authority). Hub measures indicate the
extent to which a node has contact with reliable sources (Authority) of information while Authority measures indicate the extent to which a node is considered by others to be an expert on certain matters. These measures are closely tied to one another. For all measures of centrality given, the nodes in this network have very low measures, which suggests that the network is dispersed with activity centered primarily in subgroups that rarely interact with one another.

These findings are supported by the low density measure for the entire network, which is at .0134. Density is one of the most basic network measures. It is a ratio of the number of actual relationships in a network to all the possible relationships in that network.

Table 5.4 Descriptive Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Out Degree</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.224</td>
<td>0.013</td>
<td>0.022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Degree</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.164</td>
<td>0.013</td>
<td>0.021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Betweenness</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.234</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td>0.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hub</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.357</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td>0.047</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.252</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td>0.045</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Only two nodes in the network stand out in terms of individual levels of connectivity. These nodes are advantaged in both being ‘located’ strategically (being well-connected) and in terms of brokering exchanges. One node is an association head, and the other is a business owner. Associations and businesses are loci of relationship building and mobilization. Adept businessmen and association heads must have a talent for cultivating and deploying social capital to deliver ‘services’. There are interesting parallels in the way that businessmen and association heads elect to deploy relationships to ‘serve’ their ‘clients’.
Associations are an important component of European civil society. Francis Fukuyama (2001) proposes,

“it was only by coming together in civil associations that weak individuals become strong; the associations that they form could either participate directly in political life (as in the case of a political party or interest group) or could serve as ‘schools of citizenship’ where individuals learn the habits of cooperation that would eventually carry over into public life” (page 11).

Associations play an important role in migrant politics. In Europe, associations are considered a form of political participation (Martiniello, 2005), one of the few forms that is open to migrants (Soysal, 2006; Montuori, 2007). This is certainly the case in Italy where a national consultative body composed of select migrant associations was charged with immigrant representation as well as twenty regional consultative bodies.

Ethnic associations can be a vehicle for immigrant agency. Group membership offsets trait-based “deficiencies” in participation (Verba et al., 1995) and promotes political action and the ignition of interest in politics (Klesner, 2007; La Due Lake & Huckfeldt, 1998; Verba et al., 1995). Scott McClurg (2003) summarizes the literature on group membership and political participation. Groups are (1) a place where political knowledge is disseminated (Putnam, 2000), (2) where people can be reached and mobilized for action (Leighley, 1995), and (3) lower the transaction costs of participation by cultivating politically relevant skills (Verba et al., 1995).

In her study of immigrant associations in Turin and Milan, Tiziana Caponio (2005) described the evolution of immigrant associations from politically-motivated student political groups to nationality-based groups. Caponio made three general observations, all of which were substantiated in this research: (1) that the number of immigrant
associations did not necessarily reflect the size of the national community, (2) that larger groups did not necessarily have advantages in organization, and (3) that Italian associations (particularly church-based associations) had edged out immigrant associations in the provision of services.

The dynamic of intergroup relationships affects the effectiveness of communities in organizing political events or in seeking to pursue opportunities (Tillie, 2004). Informant 771 described the differences in how migrant communities coordinate,

“When it comes to the African associations, they have been able to unite. They have [sic] more than 200 associations, and they work together on many things. The same thing is happening with Eastern Europeans. With Asia and Latin America, it is a bit more difficult because—well, apart from the fact that Asia is enormous—it’s difficult to put China with the Middle East, and so it’s chaotic, to make a generalization. But when it comes to the Indian subcontinent...well...for smaller groups. Latin America is a bit different because they have a long history here, and so they have formed mono-national groups they don’t work much with others, paradoxically. And, therefore, this is what the work here consists of.” (endnote needed?)

The coordinator of one of the largest formal ‘networks’ of immigrant associations, Informant 771, believes that the situation in Rome is even more complicated than elsewhere in Italy. She says, “Rome is a unique city....Rome is an agglomerate. Until a few years ago, the only office for political asylum was here, so everyone flocked to Rome. So even though there are so many associations, they are not even able to address all the requests, no?” (endnote needed?) Connecting and coordinating groups requires high degrees of brokerage and leadership.

Melanie Knights (1996) documents the successful mobilization by Asian immigrants in 1990 when they successfully staged a hunger strike to force Roman police administration to recognize their rights to amnesty as was decreed in Italy’s Martelli Act of 1990. Two
things are noteworthy about this event as it relates to my research: the first is the role of Italian political parties (particularly from the left) in organizing and assisting the Asian communities’ leadership in mobilizing co-ethnics, and the other is the role of Asian businessmen in assembling and mobilizing their co-ethnics.

Areas where immigrant businesses are concentrated also provide important points of contact (Zhou, 2004). The historic quarter of the Esquilino is important to immigrants and Italians alike. The main plaza in the neighborhood, Piazza Vittorio, has emerged as a symbol of possibility for city’s migrant residents. The neighborhood itself is epitomized by its park, trade union offices, schools, university, and, of course, market.

Not only is the centrally-located neighborhood the most diverse in the city, it is also an area where immigrant businesses have thrived. Beginning with African businesses in the late 80s, the Esquilino is now dominated by Chinese and Bangladeshi business owners. These entrepreneurs have previously worked together to expand their rights to own and manage businesses in Italy(Montouri, 2007). The covered market at Piazza Vittorio is one of the largest sites for ethnic business in Italy. Here, as one association head, Informant 745, says, “non vado al mercato solo per comprare, ma anche per relazionare. [“I don’t go to the market just to shop, I also go to be social” (own translation).]”

Entrepreneurs create politically-meaningful social benefits. *Who* entrepreneurs are—their leadership and reputation—creates avenues for inter-group and cross-group cooperation. *What* entrepreneurs do—their exchanges—builds organizational and communication channels that encourage innovation and knowledge transfer. Communities rich with
‘involved/invested’ entrepreneurs are positioned to meet their collective-action needs through mobilization.

Ethnic entrepreneurs with supply-and-demand chains that extend beyond their community of co-ethnics provide nodes at which inter-elite communication can be initiated—business associations. Just as civil society is instrumental in building trust, so are entrepreneurs. Neace (1999) says, “even though the entrepreneurs were striving to run successful, profitable enterprises, their social behavior also served as a forum whereby they had the potential to fulfill a natural longing for recognition, belongingness, and community creation”. The norms of relationship building and exchange established by entrepreneurs translate into other parts of life.

In general, for all local politics, but in the immigrant context in particular, the entrepreneurial community is one of these wellsprings, providing a breeding ground rich in organizational capacity and leadership training. Previous research on the associations of immigrant entrepreneurs has found that these collectivities formed by ‘elite-level’ community members are points of advocacy for the immigrant community. As Constantine et al. (2008) write, “ethnic entrepreneurship can bring within the efforts for promoting cultural diversity and religious tolerance” (page 57). Not only do immigrant business owners provide capital and other resources important for mobilization, but entrepreneurs are also figures of authority within their community. Moreover, they are authorities on their communities. Many business owners play more than one role, and quite a few serve as political representatives on the newly-instituted consultative body in Rome.
5.3 Conclusion

Network-centrality measures are individual-level measures that convey the importance of each node to the functionality of a network. While the overall scores for network centrality were generally low, entrepreneurs scored relatively higher than most other actors. Moreover, a number of entrepreneurs within the network had centrality measures so significantly higher that those scores separated them from other network actors; by leaps and bounds. This reflects entrepreneurs’ adeptness at cultivating social relationships that develop from their continued reliance on a network of relationships for different stages and processes of business making. What is noteworthy is that entrepreneurs scored highly in this network—that is, a network that was constructed to demonstrate how migration-relevant political information moves and mobilizes migrants. It would have been reasonable to expect that in this network, individuals employed full time in these kinds of activities would serve as the critical or central nodes in the network. We find that this is indeed so, but that additionally, entrepreneurs perform critical functions for holding the network together and for deploying it. In particular, the high Betweenness scores suggest that some components (or subgroups) within the network would be isolated without the brokerage activities of entrepreneurs.

For effective mobilization, the qualities of a network matter as much as the qualities of individuals within the network. In order to coordinate an activity, leaders need people to connect and mobilize. Klandermans and Oegama (1987) introduced the idea of mobilization potential to capture this reservoir of activists. They define mobilization potential as “the people in a society who could be mobilized by a social movement. It consists of those who take a positive stand toward a particular social movement” (page
I argue that the possibility of recruiting these individuals rests on the level of their connectivity to the network and to the level of organization and coordination within that same network.

These ideas are captured within the concept of ‘social capital’. I propose that social capital is not located in relationships themselves, but rather in patterns of interaction that could potentially emerge from the structure built on these relationships. For political mobilization, networks provide resources and structures necessary for recruitment. Mobilization requires some resources to begin and continue, and these resources arise out of network relationships (Francisco, 2010). Studying social capital as network-based allows us to understand how webs of relationships bring people and resources into social movements. In the following chapters, I compare and contrast the social capital stocks across different components within the network to explain different levels of success in mobilization and in capturing selective benefits.

**SUBSECTION 5.5 DESCRIPTIONS OF NETWORK COMPONENTS**

In the previous chapter, I used centrality measures to compare how nodes with different occupations are positioned to respond to migrant-relevant collective action problems (opportunities) by looking at their network location. In the next chapter, I will compare subgroups (called components) within the network to understand how different network structures affect subgroup mobilization potential. Before moving forward, I will describe the different communities and subgroups within the network being analyzed.
Figure 5.51 Map of In-Degrees, Whole Network depicts once more the 396-node network that was constructed for the fieldwork. Within this network are many subgroups, which are often multi-ethnic. It is also true, however, the dominant subgroups are those that rest within nationality-based sub-networks, each with their own “within community” norms and institutions. Familiarity with these national community structures, history, and norms is important for understanding the resulting substructures.

The relational structure employed for this analysis is the component. A component is a network structure wherein all nodes are connected to each other by a given number of relationships or path length. I chose to have components separated by a maximum of two relationships (this would span 3 people). Components, a more relaxed grouping than a clique, are useful because they allow us to study pendants (or nodes who are connected to
a network by a singular relationship). Employing hierarchical clustering, nine components were identified. Each component is labeled using the identification number of its central connector (the component node with the highest centrality measures). Records from field nodes confirm the results.

Activity in each subgroup centers on a ‘main node’. The characteristics of each of these central nodes are given below in Table 5.5.1 Central Node Characteristics. Except for Node 909 and Node 825, the central nodes serve in the network in a capacity that is different from their livelihood. At times these different roles complement each other, at others, they conflict. Four of the components included in this analysis are organized around business owners who also give their time to serve either as elected representatives or association heads.

Table 5.5.1 Central Node Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Livelihood of Main Node</th>
<th>Role #2 of Main Node</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>909 Association Head</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>Peruvian</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>828 Businessman (Call Center)</td>
<td>Representative on Consulate</td>
<td>Peruvian</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>838 Domestic Helper</td>
<td>Association Head</td>
<td>Filipino</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>825 Embassy Employee</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>Filipino</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>704 Businessman (Shipping and Remittances)</td>
<td>Adjunct Councilor</td>
<td>Filipino</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>714 Union Representative</td>
<td>Association Head</td>
<td>Filipino</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>819 Businessman (Multiple)</td>
<td>Association Head</td>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>790 Businessman (Call Center)</td>
<td>Association Head</td>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>731 Remittance Center Employee</td>
<td>Cultural Mediator</td>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

24 Hierarchical clustering in networks is a computational technique to identify comparable subgroups within a network by comparing the positional similarity and dissimilarities between the nodes.
5.51 Background

The typical pathway for an immigrant into Italy follows the pattern of chain migration described by MacDonald and MacDonald (1964). At the head of a chain is a ‘patron’ who recruits co-nationals, with offers of work and what the Italians call an appoggio (support). Unfortunately, there is a thin line between ‘support’ and ‘exploitation’ in these patron-client relationships. In a country were securing and maintaining ‘regular’ status is difficult (Ruspini, 2005), exploitation can become the rule rather than the exception (Knights, 1996; Ambrosini, 2006). The three migrant groups that this research focuses on have differential experiences of chain migration that have contributed to the shape of their national community network structure.

Peruvians in Rome

The first wave of Peruvians arrived in Italy in the late eighties during the first term of President Alan Garcia. Helped by the then recently established family reunification laws many of the upper middle class Peruvians during that time were able to sponsor a relative. The majority of Peruvians that I met while conducting fieldwork obtained their residency through these sponsorships. The Peruvians that arrived in later waves—during the presidency of Alberto Fujimori—often came from less well-to-do socio-economic backgrounds and from more rural regions of Peru. Thus the Peruvian community in Rome is strongly defined by its class divisions which have been imported from their countries of origin and persist despite the commonality of their experiences as migrants in Italy.

25 The terms regular and irregular immigration are employed to differentiate between legal/documented and illegal/undocumented immigration in Europe.
Like most immigrant groups, many Peruvians that come to Italy initially find work as
domestic helpers. Others also find work as manual laborers and delivery men. Compared
to immigrants from Asia – however - Peruvians, however, are better able to transition
into economic opportunities in line with their professional training because of the
similarities between Spanish and Italian. This strong resemblance gives Peruvians an
advantage since shared language eases the necessary interactions to achieve the transition
into higher economic opportunities by lowering transaction costs\(^{26}\) (Djajic, 2001).

Figure 5.52 *Map of the Peruvian Network* is the ‘network map’ of the Peruvian network
in Rome. In this network map, the size of each node reflects its *Betweenness*\(^ {27}\) score. The
map in Figure 5.52 *Map of the Peruvian Network* (as well as Figure 5.53 and Figure 5.54)
was visualized using the Netdraw (developed by Stephen Borgatti). The larger nodes are
critical for keeping network components together and indicate a point at which exchanges
are often brokered. The map suggests that the Peruvian community has three loci of
activity. I have labeled these the consulate component, the associational component, and
the soccer camp component. In the Peruvian community, these sub-groups function as the
glue that binds the entire community together.

\(^{26}\) Transaction costs are the costs incurred to make an exchange.
\(^{27}\) Betweenness is a measure of network centrality that indicates how important a person is for connecting other people
within the network.
Two of the loci are closely linked. These are the Peruvian consulate component and the associational component (component 909). The Peruvian consulate manages a number of social, diplomatic, and cultural programs in the Peruvian community. It is very active and widely recognized as an important institution. The consulate maintains a database of all of the associational contact information which it employs to keep association heads involved in consular activities. The consulate also works closely with Node 909, head of the associational component (Component 909).
I also prepared maps that show the central relationships that drive each component. In these maps, nodes are classified by occupation (color):

Node 909 heads an association which coordinates activities for all of the associations in the Peruvian network. She is what we would call the central connector of her component. Ideally, these central components play the role of Khademian and Weber’s (2008) collaborative capacity builder but this depends mainly on the structure of their component. Outside the Peruvian community, Node 909 is known for her ability to provide useful information about the Peruvian network for those wishing to access it. Node 909 holds a lot of power and influence in the community as do her preferred alters.

As we can see from the Green color of the majority of the nodes in the map, component 909 is moved primarily by nodes who are association heads. Being an association head
can be a profitable way to make a living, either through the receipt of government funds or through the collection of membership dues. This component is a hyper example of a ‘civic association’ because—as association leaders—each node in this component is by nature an activist. This component moves information about threats and opportunities that result externally but is seldom successful in working together to respond to these threats or opportunities without outside intervention. There is too much competition between its members.

At a surface level, the Peruvian network seems well organized. However, this cohesiveness is weakened by competition among association leaders. Competition divides the Peruvian voting base. Their elected representatives (Node 902 and Node 905, who are Adjunct Councilors at the district level) worked outside their national communities to achieve election. Node 902 attributed his campaign success to his connection to Romanians, saying that he could not have won the election without a multi-ethnic support base. Similarly, Node 799, running against co-nationals in the district elections, recognized that aligning herself with a non-Peruvian candidate (Node 704) would be beneficial for her campaign.

When it comes to relationships between migrant leaders and non-active Peruvians, the community exhibits low trust. One of the subjects interviewed for the study conveyed this distrust in the following way:

“Many Peruvians prefer to solve their problems on their own and only look out for themselves because the associations that are in place only think about economic gains...for who pays, there is help, for who doesn’t, there is nothing... Associations always ask something in exchange. It may not be money. It may be telling you to clean something or attend a protest that has nothing to do with you. 10-15 years ago there were associations who helped. Not anymore. Perhaps it’s
these laws that make this impossible. There are 3-4 associations that give simple but not substantial help (they can’t afford it)...there are also the consiglieri, but they can only give referrals. They don’t have the economic resources for more than that” (Node #, own translation?).

Node 828 has managed to overcome this distrust. His component – component 828 the soccer camp component - is depicted in the map on the right. A businessman and elected member of the Consultative Body, Node 828 began working with Peruvians in the early 1990s. He and his brother manage a soccer camp where Peruvians gather every weekend to play or watch soccer, eat Peruvian food, and listen to Peruvian music. One of the beauties of the soccer camp is that hosts a multi-national league involving immigrants from various African, Latin American, and Eastern European countries. These are the national groups that supported Node 828 in his successful campaign as adjunct councilor in 2004 and that elected him to the consultative body in 2006. Soccer is an instrumental cultural unifier. As one of my migrant interviews told me in passing, “the whole world revolves around a soccer ball. Soccer is the sport that unites the world”xxxiv (2011, own translation).

At the soccer camp, Node 828 provides information to his co-nationals (and others) about developments and mobilizes them to act. It was this activity that gained him sufficient popularity to become the underdog winner in the 2004 electoral race. He even used the
soccer camp to participate in Peruvian politics. It was there where he organized a campaign for Pedro Pablo Kuczynksi, candidate of the party Alleanza por il Gran Cambio. On April 10, 2012, Peruvian nationals convened outside the public high school Giulio Cesare to vote in the Peruvian national elections. This is the second time that the City of Rome has provided a public space for Peruvian national elections. It required coordination and cooperation between the City of Rome and the Peruvian consulate.

Node 828 agreed to discuss his experience, “I have a group that helped me, a group of university students. With them, we worked for a month. About a month we worked to bring Pedro Pablo Kuczynksi to the presidency. We did everything, and we did not manage [to succeed] for many reasons”xxxv (2011, own translation). This also shows the ‘reach’ of transnational political action. The Peruvian effort in Rome was connected to another in Spain. Node 828’s group was fast-organizing a series of meetings with dissatisfied Peruvians in Spain, illustrating the depth of the network reach involved in “the politics of in-between.” “Only 750,000 Peruvians abroad are registered, of whom only 50 percent vote. This is not good. We will have a meeting. Today, I heard from many people in Spain. We will do something, we will meet with other people to see what we can do to wake people up”xxxvi (2011, own translation).

Filipinos in Rome

Filipino chains were established by the first batch of Overseas Filipino Workers (OFWs) in Italy (ninety-five percent of whom were women) who arrived via an agreement—brokered by the Catholic Church—between Italian and Filipino governments (Basa & Jing de la Rosa, 2004). Once settled, Filipina workers recruited female relatives and
friends, establishing a wider circle of familiars. It was only in 1990—with the Martelli Act—that men joined these chains in significant numbers. By then, many of the network’s leaders had already established themselves, especially in stable communities in North Italy. The power of these leaders is often dependent on the sizes of their families. Many families have managed to bring as many as 200 relatives to the city.

Compared to other groups, Filipinos have a high degree of participation in civil society by non-practitioners (people who do not make their living by working in migration-related services). In Figure 5.53, we see two important brokerage relationships, Node 985 and Node 1046. These two nodes connect their communities to Node 701 who, as we discussed earlier, brings resources and relationships from the United Nations and Filipino private universities into the Filipino community. Their high Betweenness scores reflect less their value to the Filipino community, and more their value to those isolates who, without them, would not be able to ‘plug into’ the community.

**Figure 5.53 Map of the Filipino Network**
Within the Filipino network, this study focuses on four components: component 838 (the religious community component), component 825 (the embassy component), component 704 (the adjunct councilor component), and component 714 (the trade union component). In all but one case (component 825), all of these component central nodes began as volunteers in a religious community and one (node 838) is still involved in this capacity.

“Di ba ang sabi nila, saan man tumungtong ang Filipino ay una niyang hahanapin ay simbahan?”

---- Node 709, Consigliere Aggiunto

The religious faith of the Filipinos has given them a point of commonality around which to organize. Local parishes throughout Rome give Filipino groups permission to use parish grounds and facilities (Crane, 2004). These church groups or communities are province or geography based. There are 44–46 religious associations or communities in Rome. The presence of this large number of comparable, cohesive, and well-defined subgroups or clusters permits the mobilization and maintenance of organizational structures within the broader network.

Leaders of religious associations congregate at Sentro Filipino, the Filipino Catholic chaplaincy at Santa Prudenza on the first Thursday of each month. Coordination outside of the church is done by zone (the communities are grouped into East, West, North and South clusters). Information distributed by the chaplaincy at the Thursday meetings are distributed to family heads, and word is then spread through gossip channels or in the

28 Translation: Don’t they say that no matter where Filipinos may find themselves, the first thing they look for is a church?
announcements made directly following the celebration of mass. Despite the high levels of organization in the Filipino community, word of mouth, or passaparola, remains a powerful force in information dissemination. One leader, Node 838, jokingly observes, “pero kahit na, nauunahan kami ng mga tsismosa. [Translation: But despite our efforts, we still lose to the gossips]” A caveat is that in informal, word-of-mouth information channels, (mis)information can spread like wildfire. Moreover, the glut of information (and misinformation) can produce information overload. A proliferation of gossip reduces certainty over the quality of information, resulting in second-guessing and at times, paralysis.

Node 838 is the leader of a religious association and one of the officers of PIDA (the Philippine Independence Day Association discussed in Chapter 3). Most of the activities he is active in are related to organizing social events for Filipinos to gather. When it comes to the practical and political concerns of his co-nationals, he provides referrals but does not have the means to provide the resources himself. Like many of the religious community leaders, he makes his living as a domestic worker (orange nodes). Time is the main limitation that these nodes face. Most of them must restrict their participation to the days off for domestic help which are Thursdays and Sundays. While having shared days

---

[Translation: “But despite our efforts, we still lose to the gossips.”]
off means that Filipinos are commonly free on the same days and thus easier to coordinate, it also means that they are often unable to participate in opportunities from outside the Filipino community that do not happen on these days. Thus, they are cut off from opportunities offered by the city and state government.

Moreover, as we see in the network map, a majority of the active relationships in component 838 (the religious community component) are between domestic helpers (orange). It is often the case that Node 838 must access key resource people through other conduits.

Leaders of religious associations like Node 838 join other association heads on the last Thursday of each month at the Philippine Embassy where they are briefed on social issues. Offering a palette of services and functioning as the gateway to Italian institutions, the address at Via Cipro is a familiar gathering space for Filipinos. However, the relationships of trust between the Filipino embassy and the citizens that they serve are not cemented. Speaking of past embassy interactions with Filipino community leaders, embassy consulate employee (Informant 825) and longtime employee of the Filipino Department of Labor and Employment compared the Filipinos in Rome to those she served in the Philippines:

“Iba rin dito….Iba ang klase ng galit nila ([Translation:] It is different here, their anger is different)…their anger is coming from professional frustrations and unmet personal [relationship] expectations which means if they feel that services are not what they should be, they get belligerent.” (2011, own translation)

Node 825’s position is one of the many positions that have been instituted for the Philippines’ Program for Overseas Filipino Workers which was part of the policy to aggressively export Filipino labor. The employees of the program oversee and
administer a benefits program that covers everything from pension plans to the repatriation of human remains. Because the positions rotate staff from country to country, the employees of the Labor Office commonly do not speak Italian and, despite having the formally recognized links to Italian government, often lean heavily on other Filipinos with less formalized but more ‘practical’ relationships with state agencies, like Node 704, an elected representative to the city, and Node 703, an employee of the Province of Rome.

**Map 4. Component 825, The Embassy Component**

The presence of these two institutional agents in the Filipino community provides an over-arching structure for exchange and coordination so that Filipinos in Rome may address Filipino problems within the Filipino community, with minimal need for Italian state intervention. Acting as an ‘official’ intermediary between Filipino nationals and Italian institutions, these two within community actors limit the imperatives for practical and social exchanges between Filipinos and the state.

An overreliance on ethnic channels suggests that host institutions are inadequate or ill-fitting. In some cases, it can result in low participation in government programs or in under-compliance of new rules. As Kristine Crane (2004) has observed, “ethnic
information channels may replace or overlap with official channels in ways that interfere with policy implementation”.

The city of Rome sought to penetrate these communities through instating the political representatives. In the words of Mayor Veltroni’s delegate, Franca Eckart Coen, the goal was to give immigrants the “capacity to speak for themselves and not through interpreters” (Coen and Rossi, 2004). Migrant elected representatives tend to move information forwards through established and informal avenues. Nigerian attorney Victor Emeka Okeadu (Informant 768), the most senior adjunct councilor, describes his method of information dissemination as follows: “remember, we have a political union called the African Union, like the European Union, that serves as an umbrella. I could say that it is a synthesis of any representation, even at my level. Under the formula of the African Union we have five regions, and that’s the North Africa, South Africa, Central Africa, East, and West Africa. So I think normally, I move along under that parameter in most of my decisions. And whenever I do or request something from the continent, in terms of my..ehh..political scope, I think I move with such a formula.”

The same is true for Node 704, a businessman (Node 704 owns a shipping and receiving business which has recently expanded into remittances) and an adjunct councilor. The relationships that drive this component are friendships or business relationships that he and his wife, Node 897, have cultivated. Business relationships and friendships are, of course, not mutually exclusive.
Aside from 704, this component has three important boundary spanners: Nodes 703, 705, and 709. Node 703 is a cultural mediator and employee of the Province of Rome. Most importantly, she is the editor in chief of the only Filipino language newspaper published in Rome. Node 709 is one of the few Filipino insurance brokers in Rome, and she is also the adjunct councilor for her municipal district. Aside from that, she produces Filipino programming for the migrant cable channel and is the editor of Node 703’s online newspaper. Finally, there is Node 705 who manages the only Filipino-run, publicly-funded daycare in Rome and whose association was among the pioneer associations in the city.

Along with Node 714, Node 705 is one of the pillars of the Filipino community whose early activism permitted a Filipino presence in some pivotal decisions regarding immigration. What makes this component particularly successful is the mix of relationships and resources each node manages to introduce into the component.
Of all the nodes, Node 714 has perhaps the longest record of politically-motivated participation pre-dating the Martelli Act. Filipinos have a particularly strong relationship with CGIL (Krane, 2004). Node 714 is a union representative who has a relationship with CGIL. Node 714 is also the president of one of the two politically-centered Filipino groups in Rome. In an interview, she shared her activism during that period. In the interview transcript, the importance of personal connections and network position is apparent.

[Translation:] “In the 90s we began to make more concrete demands regarding migrant rights. In those days, our work contract was different from those given to Italians. So we pushed the labor unions to support us in asking for equal contracts for migrant domestic workers. This was a success not only for the Filipino community, but also three others: the contratto nazionale, a national labor contract for domestics. From this, we established a migrant federation composed of different migrant associations including students, like an Egyptian student association, Palestinians. This expanded our concerns to the political realm, beyond labor. These were the rights we helped establish through Martelli, like the right to convene in federations and migrant initiatives. Or to petition for family members to join us in Italy, which before was not there. These initiatives that go beyond culture were made possible because the government could see that they had support within the migrant community.”

Within the Filipino community, her popularity is declining because of a controversy that resulted as a result of the *quota rossa* which reserves one of the four Adjunct Councilor positions to a woman. When not a single female candidate managed to gain enough votes in the 2004 elections, she -- as the female candidate with the most votes -- was chosen to replace Node 704 (who had received the most votes) as representative for Asia. Node 714 is illustrative of the importance of outside ties, because her continued ties to CGIL and other non-Filipino groups maintain her prominence within the Filipino community. Similarly, her access to co-ethnics makes her an attractive partner to CGIL.
Bangladeshis in Rome

Recruiters still make up part of Bangladeshi chains into Italy. These chains often begin with working age male Bangladeshis who come to Italy seeking economic opportunity. Once sufficiently ‘established’ (once free of the patron-client relationships that typify these chains), Bangladeshis have lengthened these chains by bringing in male relatives and friends. It is often the case in these male-driven chains that wives and children often make the tail-end of these chains (Harney, 2007).

Figure 5.54 Map of the Bangladeshi Network

When comparing Bangladeshis to Filipinos and Peruvians the limited role of embassy and consular employees in the network is noteworthy. Perhaps it is reflective of institutional arrangements in Bangladesh, arrangements which carry consequences for integration. None of the Bangladeshis interviewed or surveyed nominated the Bangladeshi embassy or consulate as a place where one would get practical or political support for their life as foreign residents in Italy. In fact, the two acknowledged
relationships that embassy and consular employees have are to Italians who established these relationships through contacts working in the Food and Agriculture Organization.

Rather than a unified social network, the Bangladeshi network is better described as a complex system of interconnected and porous clusters (2010 Osservatorio Romano). Organization and mobilization is facilitated by the dense settlement patterns of Bangladeshis along contiguous residential areas or quartieri stretching from Esquilino to Centocelle. News travels quickly via word of mouth across this area traversed by the ATAC Bus 105.

Coordination in the Bangladeshi community is commonly centered on two activities: associations and businesses (40% of Bangladeshi nodes were businessmen and 20% belonged to/headed associations). With very few exceptions, associational leaders are also business leaders. Many of the clusters in this network are organized around provincial and political lines. The insufficiencies and complications of accessing state-sponsored services have enabled Bangladeshi middle men to effectively replace Italian agencies in the production and delivery of public goods. “Leaders” maintain strong lines of communication with their own members and with the Italian entities to which they are tied. Information quickly moves from associational leadership, to members, to their peers through word-of-mouth channels.

Competition between subgroups can be high, reducing possibilities for meaningful intergroup cooperation and making it difficult for Italians to reach Bangladeshis outside established hierarchical channels. The many associations cluster around two important and defining poles in the community, Informants 819 and 790. In order to move within the community, one must align oneself with one of these powerful leaders.
Both Node 819 and Node 790 participated in the communal elections with the selection of Bangladeshi candidates like Node 901, adjunct councilor and loyalist to Node 819. Node 819, associational head, businessman, and husband to Node 822—who is an elected member of the consulate—is one of the most established Bangladeshi leaders in Rome. This is one of the most business-rich components, Node 819 himself owns 13. His association began serving the Bangladeshi community in 1983, and he relies strongly on a network of co-national business associates.

Node 790 broke away from Node 819’s association and began a rivalry that divides the community along ethnic and provincial lines. A businessman and association head, Node 790’s revolutionary, anti-establishmentarian position have won him the loyalty of many Bangladeshi and Muslim immigrants while his marriage to Italian lawyer, Node 791, gives him strong connections to Italians leaders—connections that allow him to secure selective benefits for his followers.

“Nowhere else in the world will you see Pakistanis, Bangladeshis, and Indians working together. Even in business. Only in Italy. This is the space we have created.”

Map 7. Component 819, The "Original" Component

Map 8. Component 790
The Protest Component
He is widely recognized as an important immigrant leader. As Node 777, an Italian state employee working with small businesses proclaimed, “I cingalese a roma sono lui...e’ una figura storica.”\(^{30}\) Not only is he important for the Bangladeshi community, survey and interview responses reflect his power and influence across national groups. His ‘services’ range from formal services like cultural mediation and document processing to less formal services like counseling and mediation between spouses. Acting as surrogate village elders, his association leaders assist families in resolving problems so that their issues are contained within the community.

Religion provides another point at which information can be exchanged and influence expanded. Moreover, it is a source of inter-ethnic exchange. The Great Mosque, is the home of the entire Muslim community in Rome. Frequenting the mosque makes leaders findable and accessible, particularly to Italians. In recent years, Bangladeshis have become sufficiently numerous to establish their own mosques, often supported and patronized by wealthy and powerful businessmen. The financial backing of the mosques by immigrant leaders only serves to expand their influence in the very faithful Bangladeshi community.

Node 731 works as a cultural mediator for the public library and at a remittance center (as can be seen by the size of his node in Figure 4.54 Map of the Bangladeshi Network, he has the highest Betweenness score in the network). He also is the secretary for a small Italian association headed by retired Italian businessman, Node 744. His work at the remittance center makes him close friends with his coworker Node 834 who owns a small business with his brother-in-law. This relationship allows Node 731 to access other

\(^{30}\) [Translation:] "He is the Chingalese community in Italy...he is an historic figure."
Bangladeshi businessmen like Node 879. Additionally, because he is not an association head and therefore not in direct competition with others, he manages to build and keep relationships with all.

**Map 9. Component 731, The Bridging Component**

![Map 9. Component 731, The Bridging Component](image)

Many of the relationships in his component are cemented not by formal ties, such as membership or employment, but by happenstance. A cultural mediator, Node 731 has managed to build and preserve many of the relationships that he has built in his many roles within the Bangladeshi community. He is commonly sought after for advice and help by his co-nationals who know him as a person with many useful connections.

Similarly, he was approached by Italian Node 744. Node 744 began his associational work as a result of a request made by a friend who is a doctor. The doctor approached Node 744 for help by the Bangladeshis he treated after a storm Sidol devastated the Bangladeshi countryside. Node 744 convened fifteen Bangladeshis with a group of thirty Italian businesspeople in his home for dinner. They decided to establish an association, Node 744, wanting to maintain control, decided to become the president, but he still needed a Bangladeshi in order to gain access to the community. Their association is also network driven: Node 744 met Node 731 while he was working for another Italian association, Node 745’s association in the Market of Piazza Vittorio.
5.52 Using Information Exchange to Compare Across Components

Information is one of the important outputs of social capital (Sandefur and Laumann, 1990). Knowledge about information channels is important to understanding how political participation is organized and coordinated. Additionally, it allows a better comparison across the components that we have identified and discussed in this section of the dissertation.

While Italian newspapers carry the latest developments in a timely manner, language can be a barrier. Filipinos try to combat misinformation through Filipino newspapers, Ako ay Filipino and Kabayan, the Internet, and Filipino radio programs. The community is highly ‘wired’ and Facebook is a common tool for organizing meetings and events. Newspapers often provide information around which Filipinos mobilize. As such, media in the community is an instrument that both incites and reports mobilization. For instance, it was an article in a Filipino Tagalog newspaper that sparked the controversy on Filipino names in Italian documents (that resulted in the early retirement of the Filipino Ambassador) discussed in Chapter 3. Node 772 believes that the language employed was incendiary: “in the beginning, Node 703’s newspaper broke the news with this headline: ‘They are removing the name of my beloved mother.’ That was the first news our people received” (own translation).

This is also true for Peruvian newspapers (like the popular Communita’ Latina) and other Spanish-language newspapers and media (websites like latinosinitalia.it). In the Bengali community, however, the newspaper is in itself an instrument of mobilization. Top-down information within the Bangladeshi community is often spread through written media.
There is more than one Bengali paper in rotation, and each association also routinely publishes newspapers and distributes them in the newsstands of Bengali neighborhoods. Interview records show that leaders use these newspapers to organize demonstrations. Bengalis know where to find this information and are very responsive to these calls.

*If we ever have a need, if we have problems with the government administration, finances, another association, we spread the word. We insert a flyer in our newspaper Il Dhuumcatu which is in stands throughout Rome (free in grocery stores) and within 48 hours, we are in Piazza. Our newspaper goes out every morning at 7:00 a.m (Informant 790, own translation).*

Observing information transfer, then, allows us to better understand the potential for political mobilization in these communities.

An important measure of speed of information dissemination is path length. Paths are measures of network distance. A path is a count of the smallest number of nodes that a piece of information must traverse before it arrives at its intended target. The paths that take individual nodes to Italian institutional resources (and vice versa) can tell us how quickly information spreads from host institutions to immigrants. Logically, the shorter a path is, the quicker the pace of information spread and the lower the degree of information corruption. An interrupted path indicates that critical relationships are missing. This is a clear indicator of isolation. Conversely, a higher number of paths to key targets indicates high macrostructure density. Opening up the analysis to the whole network, an analysis of paths shows that there are multiple and, often times, short paths (the longest path is 5 steps) between Italian institutions and individual immigrants.

**Table 5.52 Measures of Within-Component Node Distance**
Taking a closer look at the path lengths and densities in individual components (see Table 5.52 *Measures of Within-Component Node Distance*) we see that components which are more closely bounded (components with low fragmentation scores) are also less connected to the overall network.

**5.53 Conclusion**

In this section I described the communities and components. I also reported the results of case study analysis that I performed to determine and compare each component’s structural characteristics. Sassanova et al. (2010) propose that it is possible “that different kinds of people may be more likely to construct different kinds of networks deserves greater attention.” And interview and ethnographic records show that some of the structures that result come about from the personalities and positions within each component. Other important relational structures have evolved from the limitations that result from each components location within the community network. These locations are indicative of power distributions inside the network. Node 838, for example, being deeply embedded within the Filipino network and less connected to other networks is
much less likely to successfully mobilize co-nationals than Node 714, who sits on the periphery of the Filipino network but has strong ties to a powerful trade union. In the following section, we compare the components discussed here with each other using graph theoretic methods.

Not only do networks permit individuals to access new information, but the ability to benefit from this information is also determined by one’s position within the network (Tsai, 2001). The centrality of nodes within a component indicates the quality of the resources which can be circulated while the structure of the component indicates the group’s ability to employ or deploy these resources. Access to new information and opportunities is not useful when the types of social relationships that foster cooperation through network closure are missing (Burt, 1998; Gargiuglio & Benassi, 2006). Moreover, the ability to create new ties that bring information and resources is facilitated by some degree of cohesion (Kenis & Knoke, 2002). Given that most individuals belong to multiple networks characterized by both closure and structural holes, it is useful to understand networks as possessing both qualities. In general, the sacrifice of path length for density is minimal (no more than one additional node to cross) thus the benefits accruing to high social capital groups are still clear. These are proposals which I investigate more thoroughly in the following Chapter.
CHAPTER 6. SOCIAL CAPITAL, NETWORKS, AND POLITICAL PARTICIPATION

A leading scholar on migration in Italy, Maurizio Ambrosini (2006, p.1) unequivocally declares, “studiare le migrazioni significa ancora oggi imbattersi nelle reti dei migranti.” (Translation: “Studying migration continues to involve encounters with migrant networks.”). Immigration reorganizes social arrangements so that formerly unassociated individuals find themselves situated in (and dependent on) a network of relationships with co-ethnics. Those situated within these networks draw upon economic, political, and emotional resources available through the network to sustain them beyond the early period of their immigrant experience (Borjas, 1994; Djajic, 2003; MacDonald & MacDonald, 1965; Portes & Sensenbrenner, 1993). In Italy, these dynamics are complicated by the diverse makeup of immigrant neighborhoods (Ambrosini, 2002; Ammendola, et al., 2004; Montouri, 2007; Mudu, 2006). This diversity creates organizational problems that burden processes of economic (Kloosterman & Rath, 2001) or political (Costa & Khan, 2002) mobilization.

6.1 BACKGROUND: SOCIAL CAPITAL MECHANISMS AND POLITICAL PARTICIPATION

Networks promote action. With most political activity, numbers bring success. For political participation to take hold as a practice within a migrant community, it is encouraging to observe others in the act of participation. As more of one’s neighbors are mobilized, it shifts actors’ perceptions of the likelihood of success. As participation is taken up by a critical mass of network members, it can sweep through the network and become an ‘infective’ behavior (Podolny, 1983). Not only do networks provide an informal structure for ‘civic instruction’, they also reorient expectations of success
(Klandermans & Oegema, 1987). Similarly, networks are a source of social learning, a strategic behavior that allows organisms to survive environmental changes (Lebel et al., 2010).

As discussed earlier (see Chapter 1), the Social Capital embedded in networks manifest themselves differently depending on the function for which they are used. Some network structures promote certain mechanisms over others. Similarly, some goals require certain mechanisms for fulfillment rather than others (Coleman, 1988). For example, the social structures that produce the mechanisms that facilitate technological innovation in the life sciences are markedly different from those that facilitate organized crime. The former would operate through a structure of weak ties and structural holes (Owen-Smith and Powell, 2004) while the latter would only be possible with strong ties (Arias, 2006).

To be specific, I propose that the structures conducive to political participation are also cultivated in entrepreneurial activity. In particular, entrepreneurs tend to balance that blend of strong within group relationships that foster trust and teamwork with weak ties which promote innovation or economic opportunity. This mixed embedded structure is the same structure that promotes the information dissemination and spirit of cooperation and camaraderie necessary for promoting political participation. Here I take a look at the following mechanisms – norms, information, and reciprocity – which I employ to compare the ‘political mobilization capacity’ within the study’s nine components.

**Mechanism #1: Norms**

Cooperation is a Social Capital output said to be produced through iterative game playing (Hofbauer & Sigmund, 2003; Ostrom et al, 1994; Ostrom, 1990) akin to those described in Coleman’s (1988) concentration of obligations. This value of collective Social Capital
emerges when human behavior cedes to a set of circumscribed behavioral expectations in ways that maximize aggregate group (if not individual) benefit. These ‘norms’ that manifest as a result of social capital permit collective holders of social capital to discover and pursue opportunities they otherwise could not (Fukuyama, 2001; Westlund & Bolton, 2003; Tsai & Goshal, 1998).

Norms are often unwritten but jointly understood prescriptions for behavior that permit individuals to make choices based on a socially-informed calculation of anticipated responses of others (Crawford & Ostrom, 1995; Coleman, 1987; Lewis, 1969). They are the oil on the hinges that move the machinery of community forward. Institutions consist of those “rules in play”.

Networks are among the social structures that bear and enforce these norms (Fukuyama, 2001; Huckfeldt, 1979). Coleman (1988) sees a network attribute that he calls closure, as a necessary ingredient for the production of effective norms. Group closure is a condition where all members are directly connected to one another and bound by a third, common, relationship. The third party connections in a closed group render all relationships public, thus increasing the reputational gains from cooperation (Burt, 1999; Coleman, 1988; Garguglio & Benassi, 2000). To achieve a high degree of closure, the boundaries of a group or network must be clearly defined by the presence of highly connected, reciprocal relationships.

**Mechanism #2: Generalizable Trust**

Of the many types of trust necessary for promoting exchanges and cooperation, generalizeable trust is the one most associated with political participation (Uslaner and
This form of trust captures individual trust in state institutions to consider and respond positively to their political activities. This form of trust should increase with exposure to host institutions; exposure that is promoted by bridging ties to nodes ‘residing’ within the host (Lancee, 2010). Thus, this research considers not just the social structures that beget cohesion/closure and promote norms, it also considers the structural holes that promote trust. A balance of both structures is necessary to promote mechanism #3, Information.

Mechanism #3: Information

Social capital promotes information exchange by (1) encouraging recipients and transmitters to seek and share information and (2) encouraging people to invest in a shared language and jargon that decreases the costs and complications associated with exchange.

Information promotes political participation by exposing individuals to politically relevant information and by providing knowledge on possible avenues to respond to this new information. The exchange of knowledge, what Weber and Khademian define as “socially mediated information” (2008, p. 338), between migrant and host is imperative for integration. Shared institutional language maps the lay of the land, guiding individuals on how to make acceptable choices. In essence, individuals exchange analogies and metaphors in order to make sense of local politics (Schlesinger & Lau, 2000); these metaphors and analogies are useful for a country’s new residents who are hampered by language and cultural differences. For example, empirical studies have shown that information networks are critical in migrant uptake of host welfare programs (Devillanova, 2007).
Networks determine the quality and quantity of information available to an individual (Sandefur & Laumann, 1998). There are a number of ways along which the quality of information spread can be assessed. Here, information spread is assessed according to its reach, speed and accuracy. Reach concerns whether a piece of information arrives at the intended target. Transferring information to the appropriate target increases the likelihood that it will be employed gainfully (Habyarimana et al., 2007). Speed, or efficient information transmission, is beneficial as (1) it ensures the early adoption of information and, (2) connected to the idea of accuracy, it ensures lower distortion of that information. Accuracy concerns the completeness and correctness of information upon arrival. Not only is misinformation potentially expensive, it discourages action in subsequent iterations.

In dense networks, nodes that ‘carry’ information are more likely to encounter information targets or people connected to information targets. Thus, ‘dense’ or ‘saturated’ groups will have advantages in speed of information spread (Sandefur & Laumann, 1998). Moreover, in cases where it is important that information arrives at a specific target while preserving the content and consistency of information, then familiarity with the structure information channels is critical to effective information dissemination (Habayarima et al., 2001). In this case, density can also be considered as positive for transmitting information accurately.

However, while density increases the number of avenues for exchange, it comes at a cost in terms of the quality or quantity of information that is exchanged (Buskens & Yamaguchi, 1999). Highly dense and closed subgroups tend to be isolated from the
greater network (Portes & Sensenbrenner, 1993) and so information can be repetitive and redundant (Sandefur & Laumann, 1998; Burt, 1992). In an environment characterized by the constant entry of new nodes and the transience of existing nodes, such as that of immigration, repetition and redundancy hold value. However, in general it disadvantages a component in mobilization by limiting the opportunities around which to mobilize.

6.2 Data and Methods

The component measures reported in this Chapter provide information on how the component is structured and ignores relationships that component members may have to nodes outside the immediate component being studied. This allows us to understand how the relationships within the components are structured so that we may better understand the possibility of mobilizing these relationships. I also compare individualized network measures for the component’s central connector to assess the reach of a component across the whole network. Focusing on position network wide responds to Kenis and Knoke’s (2002) reminder that “the distortion of time and information being transferred calls attention to need for instrumental ties”.

Mixed embeddedness\(^{31}\) is how I refer to the condition of nodes placed in a large, loose network with multiple, cohesive subgroups which the nodes can span through their relationships to multiple internal boundary spanners (also referred to as information brokers\(^{32}\)) and who also make connections to “out-group” nodes. Nodes positioned centrally and peripherally in multiple structures, i.e. in a system of mixed embeddedness,

\(^{31}\)I borrow loosely from Kloosterman and Rath’s (2001) model of mixed-embeddedness, previously applied to immigrant entrepreneurship to see political mobilization as dependent on opportunity structures available through networks within and without the immigrant community.

\(^{32}\)Cross and Prusack, 2002
are best able to create benefits for themselves and their community by disseminating time-sensitive or ‘perishable’ information.

Categorizing components

What then is structure that best produces the forms of social capital beneficial to political participation? I proposed that closed components with strong boundedness that promotes cooperation are poised to mobilize when the central actors within these components have access to outside resources through their bridging relationships. To illustrate, I offer Figure 6.1 *Categories of Components*, a 2*2 matrix where information from the connectivity of the central connector (vertical axis) is combined with information about the closure of the component (horizontal axis). Four categories emerge. Of these categories, the mixed embedded components have the clear advantages in political participation given their advantages in the cultivation of trust, norms as well as information exchange.

**Figure 6.1 Categories of Components**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOW BETWEENNESS SCORE</th>
<th>OPEN NETWORK</th>
<th>CLOSED NETWORK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PENDANT COMPONENTS:</td>
<td></td>
<td>RECEPTOR COMPONENTS:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ NORMS</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ NORMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ TRUST</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ TRUST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ REACH</td>
<td></td>
<td>↓ REACH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ SPEED</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ SPEED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ ACCURACY</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ ACCURACY</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HIGH BETWEENNESS SCORE</th>
<th>MIDDLEMEN COMPONENTS:</th>
<th>MIXED EMBEDDED COMPONENTS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>↓ NORMS</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ NORMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ TRUST</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ TRUST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ REACH</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ REACH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ SPEED</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ SPEED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ ACCURACY</td>
<td></td>
<td>↑ ACCURACY</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Looking at the horizontal axis: closed and open networks.*
Reciprocal relationships tend to result in and from “structural balance” (Cartwright and Harary, 1956; Davis, 1963; Davis and Leinhardt, 1972). Balance theory borrows from the mathematical idea of transitivity (Hanneman & Riddle, 2005; Wellman, 1980) whereby if A knows B and B knows C, A is likely to know C. Thus, following balance theory, reciprocal relationships tend to be strengthened by third party ties. As Ronald Burt (1997) writes, “third parties to the relationship and transform what was private into public.” In balanced, reciprocal relationships trust is more likely and goal attainment is more likely since exchanges are promoted because (1) there are reputational losses connected to “cheating” (Coleman, 1990) and (2) finding well-meaning intermediaries to smooth communication is more likely (Reagans and McEvily, 2003). For example, in the case of information exchange, Hansen (1999) proposes that while weak relationships suffice when exchanging ‘simple knowledge’, strong relationships are necessary for the transfer of complex knowledge. Reciprocal ties facilitate information exchange, even if it comes at a cost to the message transmitter (Reagans & McEvily, 2003). Moreover, reciprocal ties will encourage individuals to seek out information in order to strengthen ties (Xu et al., 2010).

In contrast, Burt suggests that hierarchy is a more effective mechanism for goal attainment than reciprocity (2000). In relatively flat networks, where there is no clear central figure of authority, the leadership necessary to move collective action forward is missing. To measure closure, constraint, a network measure developed by Ronald Burt (2001) is expanded and employed. According to Burt, constraint “measures the extent to which a network is directly or indirectly concentrated within a single contact” (2001, p. 39). Constraint increases with network density and hierarchy while it decreases with
network size (number of nodes in a network). I calculated an index that takes into account Burt’s constraint factors (size, hierarchy) and reciprocity to provide an indicator of closure which shows us how these components have balanced hierarchy – organization – against reciprocity – trust.

Looking at the vertical axis: bridging relationships.

Central connectors are those nodes with the highest measures of Betweenness within the component. These are the nodes that hold the component together. Information usually passes through them in order to circulate through their component (Cross & Prusack, 2000). As such, they ensure reach within the component.

Central Connectors also often play critical roles as Boundary Spanners. That is, they serve as the node that connects their group to the outside world. Boundary spanners are those nodes within the component who are best positioned to broker relationships (Burt, 2001). Thus, the betweenness scores of these central connectors indicate the components potential bridging relationships. Bridging ties are those connections to outside groups through what Granovetter (1973) coined ‘weak ties’, which create opportunities to broker exchanges between two distinct clusters (Burt, 2001). The central connector’s position within the entire network speaks to her (and therefore her component’s) ability to access resources. We assess this reach using the central connectors network-wide betweenness score.
**Glossary**

Nodes – are network entities

Ties – are relationships shared by Nodes

Size – is a simple count. It is the number of nodes in a network or network substructure.

Distance – in networks, distance measures the number of relationships that separate two nodes. For example, if Tim and Sally are friends, then their distance is 1. And if Gwen is friends with Sally and not Tim, then the distance between Tim and Gwen is 2 because 2 relationships separate them.

Density – is the ratio of actual relationships in a network to all the possible relationships in that social structure. This measure is a way to envision how distances between network nodes impact structure.

Reciprocity – measures the extent to which there is mutuality in the network. For example, if Sarah reports that Bill is her friend, but Bill does not report that Sarah is his friend, then their tie (relationship) would be considered non-reciprocal.

Hierarchy – is the degree to which nodes are strongly tied to one central contact. Studying hierarchy one can tell which positions receive a disproportionate share of ties and the positions from which these ties arise (Galascweicz & Wasserman, 1993).

Compactedness/Fragmentation – are alternative measures of network cohesion/constraint that indicate the degree to which substructures contain other substructures.

---

6.3 RESULTS: SOCIAL CAPITAL IN ACTION, INFORMATION AND MOBILIZATION IN THE MIGRANT COMMUNITY

As its title suggests, Table 6.1 *Basic Measures of Constraint* reports the estimates of closure by reporting measures of constraint (density and hierarchy), as well as summary
measures for reciprocity and a summary measure of constraint the Constraint Index. As can be expected from a multi-ethnic dispersed network, the overall community has a very low density (.0134), which suggests a high degree of separation between the network’s subgroups. This is good for our analysis as it is an early indication that comparing components is appropriate given the inferable separation between groups suggested by the network density score.

Table 6.1 Basic Measures of Constraint

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Reciprocity</th>
<th>Density</th>
<th>Hierarchy</th>
<th>Constraint Index</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>All Network</strong></td>
<td>0.427</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>0.6276</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>909</td>
<td>0.5667</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.3568</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>828</td>
<td>0.4667</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.1249</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>838</td>
<td>0.5023</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.2348</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>825</td>
<td>0.5016</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.4124</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>704</td>
<td>0.5453</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.3566</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>714</td>
<td>0.4861</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.6966</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>819</td>
<td>0.4672</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.3703</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>790</td>
<td>0.4651</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.3706</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>731</td>
<td>0.497</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.5035</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In Italy, immigrant political dynamics are complicated by the diverse makeup of immigrant neighborhoods (Ambrosini, 2002, Ammendola, et al., 2004; Montouri, 2007; Mudu, 2006). This diversity can create organizational problems that burden the processes of economic (Kloosterman & Rath, 2001) or political (Costa & Khan, 2002) mobilization. Inter-elite cooperation can be useful for overcoming divisions between ethnic communities, allowing them to jointly achieve collective goals (Lipjhart, 1968). Some measure then must be used to study this connectivity. I use the Betweenness score.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NODE 909</th>
<th>NODE 828</th>
<th>NODE 838</th>
<th>NODE 825</th>
<th>NODE 704</th>
<th>NODE 714</th>
<th>NODE 819</th>
<th>NODE 790</th>
<th>NODE 731</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In-Degrees</td>
<td>0.117</td>
<td>0.029</td>
<td>0.068</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>0.224</td>
<td>0.063</td>
<td>0.018</td>
<td>0.013</td>
<td>0.076</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out-Degrees</td>
<td>0.086</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td>0.049</td>
<td>0.089</td>
<td>0.133</td>
<td>0.052</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>0.023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Betweenness</td>
<td>0.103</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td>0.016</td>
<td>0.026</td>
<td>115.194</td>
<td>29.769</td>
<td>8.535</td>
<td>5.45</td>
<td>11.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hub</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>0.037</td>
<td>0.207</td>
<td>0.296</td>
<td>0.357</td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>0.027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authority</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>0.031</td>
<td>0.156</td>
<td>0.239</td>
<td>0.252</td>
<td>0.181</td>
<td>0.033</td>
<td>0.017</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.2 Central Connector Centrality Measures
The central connector’s Betweenness score indicates that component’s access to outside resources via the central connector’s bridging relationships. The higher the betweenness score, the higher the number of bridging relationships. This and other measures of connectivity are reported in Table 6.2 Central Connector Centrality Measures. As expected, nodes belonging to highly dense components will tend to have a central connector with low bridging ties. For example, Component 838 – which has the highest density in the network – also has a central connector with the lowest Betweenness score and both low hub and authority scores.

To compare mixed embedded components to other structures, I combine and synthesize the information in Table 6.2 and Table 6.3. The result of this effort is presented visually in Figure 6.2 Components Classified.

**Figure 6.2 Components Classified**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOW BETWEENNESS SCORE</th>
<th>OPEN NETWORK</th>
<th>CLOSED NETWORK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PENDANT COMPONENTS:</td>
<td>838 (10.53; .016)</td>
<td>RECEPTOR COMPONENTS:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>909 (15.81; .103)</td>
<td>825 (17.20; .026)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>828 (17.06; .009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIDDLEMEN COMPONENTS:</td>
<td>714 (9.01; 29.769)</td>
<td>MIXED EMBEDDED COMPONENTS:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>819 (14.82; 8.535)</td>
<td>704 (35.81; 115.194)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>790 (16.52; 5.45)</td>
<td>731 (19.19; 11.67)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Pendant Components**

These components are the most disadvantaged components. They are connected to the rest of the network through one bridging relationship and at such are at the mercy of the discretion (in the case of Component 909) or the capacities (in the case of Component 838) of their central connector. In fact, my ethnographic records show that these components and their member nodes tend to be onlookers rather than participants in both
politics and policy making. The majority of their organizational capacities tend to be dedicated to participating in the celebration of national feasts or other cultural celebrations within their communities.

Receptor Components

These components with the highest density measures low connectivity --- Component 825 and 828 --- are components where information tends to circulate rapidly because both components have low average distances (as reported in Table 6.3 Measures of Within-Component Node Distance). Nodes within these components are separated by no more than one person, meaning that relationships within these components are usually ‘direct’. Thus, nodes within these components make for the easiest targets within the community’s mobilization capacity.

Not only are the central nodes (Node 828 and Node 825) easily targeted for recruitment by other nodes (such as Node 704), but they are also quickly able to disseminate information through their dense and reciprocal networks. I call these receptor components. They receive and react to new information, but rarely move to seek new information. These components will always try to act collectively but their positioning means that they will always be responding to policy change rather than promoting it. These are the components that provide the manpower that fuels a political movement.

Middlemen Components

Absent bridging connections, nodes are left to the mercies of intermediaries. Previous research has shown that the Italian government prefers to work with Italian associations or intermediaries (Caponio, 2005). This has consequences—not only do Italian
intermediaries serve to further separate migrants from the state, they themselves operate within the migrant community with the help of ethnic intermediaries. When language, trust, and culture are impediments, conventional information sources are replaced by brokers or ‘middle men’.

It is often the case that information networks include multiple brokers who may convolute and complicate the process of communication. As anyone who has ever played Chinese whispers or Telephone before can attest, information has a way of changing with every pass (Baker, 1984). As conveyors, rather than producers, of information, intermediaries may mistranslate or misrepresent critical information. The business of information exchange for money has become so profuse that many subjects interviewed emphasized that they provide referrals and information for free, “non come gli altri….”

For some middle men, making a profit depends partially on preserving the distance between institutions and their ‘clients’.

The ethnographic record suggest that Components 819, 790 and 714 are all, to some extent, middlemen. These individuals bask in a glow that reflects the power within their networks. Informant 799 reports a considerable mistrust among migrants: “our people trust people who have a position with the City of Rome. If a friend told the same thing, they would not believe them. When they go to a service desk if they see an Italian and a migrant sitting next to each other, they prefer to present their inquiry to the Italian because they believe that Italians know more” (2011, own translation)

---

\(^{33}\) Translation: not like the others
Nodes 819 and 790 are both business men who maintain the distance between institutions and their co-ethnics to sustain their political power. Some have even suggested that these components promote exploitative relationships. In Node 714’s case, her status in her community is contingent on her position as the sole conduit to her trade union and other resources she accesses through this relationship. All in all, the Middlemen components that have been studied have successfully mobilized their co-ethnics and other immigrants to participate, particularly in forms of protest. However, in some cases, many have questioned if these activities benefit the organizers or the communities.

**Mixed Embedded Components**

For these components, the most successful in using their connections to mobilize and create opportunities for themselves and their co-ethnics have had a balance of both high hierarchy and high reciprocity/density. The central nodes in these components are often able to recruit their co-ethnics to participate in politics either by voting or through protest. The two components which show the balance best of bridges and cohesion are Component 704 (Index Score = 36.81) and Component 731 (Index Score = 19.19). The different roles and behaviors of each node affects their betweenness scores. In interview records, Node 731 reported that his career as a cultural mediator for the City of Rome has made him known as a person who can help. Oftentimes, he uses these relationships basically to connect people to one another by providing them with each other’s contact information.

What is most interesting is Node 704 who used his entrepreneurial network to bring him a position as an elected representative in which he now works to promote immigrant
rights as well as to capture selective benefits for his constituents. Immigrant political representatives are the most ‘common’ ethnic information conduits employed by Italian institutions. Out-group ties are particularly important, not just for accessing novel resources and information, but also for maintaining legitimacy. It is in this legitimacy that ethnic representatives have an advantage.

6.4 CONCLUSION

An emerging strain in immigrant literature recognizes the benefits of balancing both strong ties and weak ties (Burt, 1992; Raegans & McEvily, 2004). For example, Djajic (2003) observes that while the tendency of immigrants to cluster together along national lines (and even to some extent provincial) reflects the incompleteness of their integration, it is these community structures that provide the stable environment that supports the academic performance and economic success of the second generation.

The analysis has shown that in many ways, the social capital stocks of components centered around entrepreneurs are comparable to those centered around association heads and trade union representatives reminding us once again that organizations tend to have structural similarities that carry through to other areas. Different types of social capital are useful for different purposes (Portes, 2000) and ethnic entrepreneurs are able to build and balance these forms of social capital (Casson & Giusta, 2007). Additionally, their profit-making and community-centered activities and their ‘findability’ (Habyarimana et al., 2007), mean that immigrant entrepreneurs have a greater possibility of being recruited to political activity compared to others, and these activities also place them in
critical positions where they act as brokers between their communities and host institutions.

The necessary ingredient for closure is frequency of interaction (Bankston and Zhou, 2006). Closure tends to be high in family units, in friendship groups and in small, tight knit communities. Civic associations and religious groups promote closure by providing a venue where people routinely meet. By routinizing economic exchanges, entrepreneurs promote closure, but by seeking opportunities outside the group, opportunities also create structural holes.
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

Immigration has emerged as a political problem in Italy. The national government has responded by placing greater restrictions and policy burdens on immigrants. The increasing buy-in by Italians of the construction of immigrants as culturally and morally inferior as well as an economic threat has been used by Italian policy entrepreneurs. They have leveraged these imposed identities of deviancy to strip immigrant workers of rights they were given in previous policy making cycles (Zincone, 2006). The increase of policy burdens discourages migrant political participation in mainstream political activity (Schneider & Ingram, 1993). In addition, it encourages them to rely on with-in community institutions and to participate in non-normative activity like protest. As I stated earlier, policy adoption begins with social construction and ends with networks (Chapter 2).

Who people approach when seeking assistance is a reflection of network structures. Some communities (Filipinos, for example) show greater reliance on within community resources or co-nationals. More within-community contacts translate into higher levels of embeddedness. Alternatively, others have a greater reliance on resources outside the community. Contacts with native Italians increase immigrant access to a variety of resources and prepare them to participate effectively in mainstream politics. Some types of contacts (such as contacts with Italian government representatives, Catholic associations and with other Italian associations) provide bridging relationships that increase immigrant access to resources and open their eyes to the possibilities for participation within mainstream politics. While other contacts do more than that.
Contacts with Muslim Organizations or Trade Unions not only increase access to resources, they also increase contacts across migrant national groups.

More than contacts, the quality of and level of embeddedness within a network dictate participations. In chapter 3, I compare immigrant participation in communal elections against their participation in protest. Survey results indicate that factors commonly associated with political participation such as education and group membership seem to have negligible impacts on the low-level participation of immigrants in Rome. Instead, it is relationships that pull people in to act.

Occupation and networks affected the level of migrant participation in these acts. The strong reliance of Filipino workers on Italians for employment, for example, constrained their participation. Hoping to maintain good relationships with Italians, Filipinos tend to attend to collective action problems within the community and to avoid non-normative acts such as protest. While participation in these mainstream activities is low, within community participation is high. I show that not only do networks lead to different levels of coordination and mobilization, but that a failure to adhere to networks can be politically expensive. Moreover, these established within community networks can be mobilized for key actors to achieve their political goals.

Immigrant entrepreneurs in Rome have – thus far – been some of these key players. As discussed in chapter 3, not only have migrant entrepreneurs provided leadership as association members and, at times, heads, they have also run as candidates in the municipal elections. Immigrant entrepreneurs made use of the capacities they built as business owners to participate more effectively in politics. One of the most important
capacities that they have employed is that of building, maintaining, and then mobilizing networks of relationships.

Initial evidence for this is given by the high measures for centrality that the social network’s entrepreneurs have compared to other network nodes (Chapter 4). It can be expected that in a network that looks at how information and resources for migrants is exchanged that association heads and government employees will be central actors. Indeed, I provide some evidence that supports these expectations. In addition, I find that ethnic entrepreneurs are just as important as other nodes who are involved, full time, in providing services to immigrants. Moreover, in some cases, these entrepreneurs function as the sole linking node between the immigrants they know and nodes from other national groups.

We are not interested solely in the position of each node but also in the social structures of the sub-network groups where they are embedded. To study this I measure and compare network measures for nine components or subgroups. All of these subgroups are embedded within a larger nationality based networks. The composition of these networks dictates how subgroups go about responding to collective action problems.

Along with norms, information is one of the basic outputs of social capital (Sandefur and Laumann, 1998). Thus, studying the effectiveness and efficiency of information transfer within these components allows us to extrapolate the distribution of social capital in the network. Employing social network analysis techniques to measure and describe social capital, I found that the entrepreneurs studied here are effective at cultivating relationships to form social capital because a majority of the relationships that they
cultivate are already hierarchical in structure and multiplex in nature (Chapter 5 and illustrated in Section 4.5). Not only do they build structures that possess hierarchy—a network characteristic—thus promoting organization and mobilization, they balance it against reciprocity, an indicator of network stability (Kenis and Knoke, 2002).

Moreover, the high scores for centrality for entrepreneurs that the analysis reports indicate that they often serve as bridges to Italians. This is confirmed by ethnographic records. In fact, because they are less dependent on brokering relationships than other leaders (such as association heads) they are more likely to be generous in connecting nodes. Thus, the findings of this project suggest that entrepreneurs do not serve to embed their co-nationals in ethnic communities. Rather, they serve as critical bridges between their co-nationals, other migrants and Italians.

7.1 IMPLICATIONS

The first set of implications I would like to put forward have to do with how we conduct research on entrepreneurship in combination with society. This preliminary work on the social capital of ethnic entrepreneurs and their impacts on the political participation of immigrant communities in Italy produces results that indicate that further study should be made into the social implications of entrepreneurial networks. If Social Capital is to be incorporated in such a study (or any study for that matter), it would benefit from a more careful consideration that separates social capital functions from products (Lee, 2010) as has been done in this thesis and that incorporates social network analysis in a practical rather than implied way (Burt, 2000).
The findings that result from this research also have a number of implications regarding immigration policy as it concerns immigrant integration (specifically) and policy compliance (generally). In policy evaluation we measure success as the presence of a causal relationship between treatment and outcome. But, regardless of the ‘success’ measure that results from these methods of study, if the program fails at the onset to reach the individuals who are being targeted, can we really consider the outcome as a ‘success’ despite the outcomes for those who actually participate? By employing social network analysis techniques we stand to gain fuller understanding of who participates and through which modality. And as a result, we can formulate better policies to address the needs of the targeted communities.

In this analysis, I have provided evidence to support previous research that proposes that Italian intermediaries (be they Catholic associations, Immigration Focused Associations and Trade Unions) constitute the preferred modalities by which immigrants in Rome access services and information (Caponio, 2004; Krane, 2004); a finding that begs the recognition of policymakers seeking to involve ethnic communities.

In addition, I show that ethnic associations are critical conduits to political participation within the immigrant community. By organizing community centered events, even the most innocuous such as a celebratory picnic, they induce bonding social capital, organizational capacity, and group together people who may later be recruited for political participation, as was the case in the Filipino community’s religious communities. Additionally, they serve as a training ground for future political activists like Nodes 704, 709 and 790. The poor recognition of these entities by the Italian state is then a concern. These ethnic associations often operate informally failing to meet the
requirements necessary to register with the Italian government. Not only does this cut them off from state resources, it also means that they are cut off from participation. At least in this early stage of immigration into Italy, some effort must be made to include these groups. This effort must consider the special constraints for immigrants such as their non-traditional working hours and conditions. The requirements made of ethnic groups cannot be equivalent to those made of Italian groups who face substantially different constraints.

Another consideration relates to the observed importance of entrepreneurship as a mode of empowerment not just for the entrepreneur but also for their communities. Many of these immigrant businesses in Italy operate informally. The opportunities to formalize a business are quite restrictive and would benefit from being revisited and restructured. Legalizing and formalizing these entities puts immigrant communities closer to mainstream and promotes dialogue between host and immigrant. Given that in the US and UK, a substantial number of business startups are migrant enterprises (Levie, 2006), these businesses may provide important sources of growth in host economies (Ndofer and Priem, 2011).

7.2 LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

A number of important questions regarding the participation of these migrant groups remain unanswered. First, this project looks at immigrant social networks at one point in time. As such, it does not tell us about the dynamism or stability of the network. Thus, we miss some important information. One of the pieces of knowledge we are missing is the responsiveness of the network to change. This information allows us to understand if networks can withstand externally occurring challenges or is flexible enough to mutate to
meet new opportunities. Although interview records provide an account of how networks have moved to respond to change in the past, these retrospective accounts are prone to substantial bias. Second, because the network was only measured at one point in time, it is hard to infer what the churn rate is within the network. Such a measure would give us some idea of the overall stability of the network as a social system.

Second, because this network was collected via qualitative interview rather than survey, I was unable to construct a predictive model based on network data. Thus while this project does provide information on social capital and social position, attributes that have been shown to be positively related to political participation (La Due Lake & Huckfeldt, 1998, Putnam, 2000; Jacobs & Tillie, 2004) and to immigrant integration (Portes, 2000), it does not test for a causal relationship between the stocks of social capital found and the political participation of network nodes. These limitations are offset by the empirical account of how these quantified relationships have been mobilized to invoke (or fail to) participation.

Third, this network does not include transregional and transnational ties. The existence and maintenance of these transregional and transnational ties are quite relevant for a host of immigrant decisions (Massey, 1990) including those that pertain to political participation. While costly to administer, a study that tracks transnational networks would be worthwhile. Such a study would provide important clues about how the network driven behavior of immigrants may be attributable to relationships with nodes located in sending countries.
Most of the limitations of this research, however, have not hampered us at arriving at an understanding of if and how immigrant entrepreneurs participate in their communities to move political its capacities forward. Thus, they do not get in the way of the purpose of the research project nor do they take away from the value of the study findings. In essence, these limitations point the direction towards future studies in political participation. Longitudinal data on the networks, for example, would provide the necessary information to model how information spreads (Buskens & Yamaguchi, 1999; Valente, 1996) while an expanded data set collected via survey of nodes would permit us to develop a predictive model of political participation that network measures (for example, of betweenness). One set of analysis that is beyond the purview of this thesis but that should be implemented using the data collected is an analysis of information contagion in the model. The construction of simulated model of information spread complemented by qualitative observations promise to provide useful insights on collective organization.

It is worth mentioning that the collection of data via snowball sampling biases the network towards the ego (or beginning nodes) and away from possible alternative egos within the network. However, I believe that enough effort was made (by cross checking data through interview and by reading the newspaper publications) to validate the results from fieldwork.

7.3 CONCLUSIONS

Because of their necessarily increased interaction with natives, the entrepreneurs I studies are more likely to learn the host country language. As such, they benefit from reduced information collection costs (Verba et al., 1995) and lowered transaction costs (Djajic,
2003). Moreover, these entrepreneurs often serve as intermediaries, a critical function for migrant communities (Ambrosini, 2006). Constantine et al. (2008), for example, observed that Turkish business associations in Romania provide political and cultural advocacy for the Turkish community. Their visibility means that entrepreneurs are within the ‘reach’ of host natives wishing to exchange information and ideas about life, society, and politics. Having this wealth of resources and information within a community should benefit it.
It is also true, that some scholars have pointed out that civic engagement may be replacing rather than encouraging political participation (Theiss-Morse and Hibbing, 2005)

"...ho incontrato molti immigrati e parlando con loro ho scoperto che Roma è la capitale europea dove gli extracomunitari vivono meglio, non perché sia una città particolarmente cordiale e pacioccona, ma perché i suoi abitanti sono talmente abituati a vedere scorrere la storia davanti ai propri occhi da non meravigliarsi più di nulla."

NOTES FROM TRANSLATIONS IN THE MANUSCRIPT:

iii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 795.

iv Taken from Interview Transcript with organizer of public prayer for Muslim youth.

v Taken from The Guardian Sunday 17 October 2010 Angela Merkel: German multiculturalism has 'utterly failed'

vi Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 714.

vii Taken from La Reppublica Ma il premier spinge per un accordo unico 'Voglio un patto anche per ronde e immigrati' 15 April 2009.

viii Taken from La Reppublica, In fuga dalla classe mista, 14 February 2009.

ix Translated from La Reppublica, L' economia italiana è già multietnica, 12 May 2009.

x Taken from interview transcript with Victor Emeka Okeadu. Interview given in English.

xi Taken from interview transcript with informant 851.

xii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 849.

xiii Taken from the Interview Transcript of Informant 790

xiv Taken from the Interview Transcript of Informant 790.

xv Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 799.

xvi Taken from Interview transcript with Informant 799.

xvii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 795.

xviii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 790.

xix Taken from Interview Transcript with Victor Emeka Okeadu, Interview given in English

xx Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 714

xxi Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 714

xxii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 850

xxiii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 790
xxiv Taken from Interview Transcript of Young Bengali Woman, Second Generation Immigrant and Organizer of a Public Prayer

xxv Taken from article “article name”: “Il voto ha invece confermato la maggiore iniziativa degli emigrati asiatici, i più organizzati anche in campagna elettorale con strategie varie: dall'invio di sms per ricordare il candidato da scegliere, all'uso di pulmini per trasportare gli elettori più pigri. Gli sforzi hanno dato frutti: su 19 municipi, ben 7 sono andati ai filippini, 7 ai bangладesi e uno a un indiano.”

xxvi Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 707

xxvii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 799

xxviii Record from 795 Interview

xxix Taken from the Interview Transcript with Marco Wong. Interview given in English.

xxx Taken from the Interview Transcript with Marco Wong. Interview given in English.

xxxi Taken from the Interview Transcript with Informant 777: “Conoscere tante persone…conoscere tante esperienze e’ certamente una ricchezza che mi ha dato questo lavoro che partano delle esperienze umane e si entrecollano nelle cose interprenditoriale e produttive.”

xxii Taken from the Interview Transcript with Informant 784: “insert Italian?”

xxiii Taken from the Interview Transcript with Informant 745: “insert Italian?”

xxiv Taken from interviews given on the soccer field at Centocelle

xxv Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 828

xxvi Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 828

xxvii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 768. Interview given in English

xxviii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 714

xxix Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant Node 790

x Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 772

xi Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 79

xlii Taken from Interview Transcript with Informant 799.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Andall, J. 1990. New Migrants, Old Conflicts: The Recent Migration into Italy *The Italianist* 10: 151-174


Basa, C. and Jing de la Rosa, R. 2004. Me, Us and Them: Realities and Illusions of Filipina Domestic Workers. Ograrosol: Roma IT


Buskens, V. and Yamaguchi, K. 1999. A New Model for Information Diffusion in Heterogeneous Social Networks *Sociological Methodology* 29:281-325


de Rooij, E. A. 2011. Patterns of Immigrant Political Participation: Explaining Differences in Types of Political Participation between Immigrants and the Majority Population in Western Europe European Sociological Review First Published online February 17, 2011: 10.1093/esr/jcr010


Pietrobelli, C., Rabellotti, R. and Sanfilippo, M. 2009. Chinese FDIs in Italy. 6th ASIALICS International Conference.


223 | Nguyen Long


Vitae

Le Anh Nguyen
Indiana University Bloomington
School of Public and Environmental Affairs
1315 East 10th Street, SPEA 201
Bloomington
47405-1701, USA
Telephone: (812) 855-6766
E-mail address: lenguyen@umail.iu.edu

Education
INDIANA UNIVERSITY, Bloomington, Indiana
PhD, School of Public and Environmental Affairs and the Department of Political Science
Major Fields: Public Policy, Policy Analysis and American Politics
Dissertation: Immigrant Entrepreneurship and Citizenship in Italy
Expected Completion: May 2012

INDIANA UNIVERSITY, Bloomington, Indiana
Bachelor of Arts in Economics and Political Science
Minor in Italian
May 2001

Areas of Interest
Social Network Analysis, Social Capital, Immigration Policy and Politics, Human Capital
Development, Economic Development, Policy, Entrepreneurship, Citizenship Studies, Minority
and Group Politics

Research Interests
My primary research interests lie in the study of socio-economic and political mobility of
members of marginalized communities through social networks. My dissertation research
focuses on the relationship between the economic activities of immigrants in Rome, Italy
and their political integration into their new country of residence. Immigrant self-
employment is a main focus of this project which seeks to ascertain if immigrant
entrepreneurship builds social capital useful for political integration.

Employment History
INDIANA UNIVERSITY OFFICE FOR WOMEN’S AFFAIRS Bloomington, Indiana
Outreach Coordinator, August 2008 – July 2009
My main responsibilities were to formulate and implement an outreach plan for the office. In fulfilling my responsibilities to the office, I produced articles for the office’s annual magazine, Majority Report and assisted in office grant-writing activities.

INDIANA ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL Indianapolis, Indiana
Director of Research, May, 2003-April 2005
I was the Project Manager for strategic plans for State of Indiana, A New Path to Progress and for the 13 regional offices of the Department of Commerce. I managed every aspect of the process including, but not limited to: designing the project work plan and marketing campaign, coordinating planning efforts throughout Indiana, data gathering and analysis for this project. I was also the project manager for other publications, including an Assessment of Customer Satisfaction for Labor Market Information Unit completed under contract with Department for Workforce Development.

INDIANA WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT Indianapolis, Indiana
Labor Market Analyst, September 17, 2001- May 23, 2003
My responsibilities included the collection, reporting and maintenance of records for the Unemployment Insurance program. In addition, I prepared reports based on Indiana Employment statistics required by the US Department of Labor and the State of Indiana. Finally, on an ad hoc basis, I analyzed state demographic and economic trends and prepared reports based on this analysis.

Internships
INDIANA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION Indianapolis, Indiana
June 2001- September 2001

Fellowships, Grants and Scholarships
INDIANA UNIVERSITY OFFICE FOR WOMEN’S AFFAIRS
Research Grant, 5,000 Dollars

INDIANA UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF PUBLIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
Doctoral Student Travel Grant, 2012: 600 Dollars

COLLEGIO CARLO ALBERTO
Fellowship in Italian Studies, 2011: 10,000 Euros

INDIANA UNIVERSITY GRADUATE SCHOOL
Grant in Aid of Doctoral Research 2011: 738.00 Dollars

Teaching and Tutoring Experience
INDIANA UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF PUBLIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS, Fall 2011
V160 National and International Policy
This course covers current debates regarding United States public policy on national and
international levels. Some policy issues covered are economics, crime, security, health, and environment.

INDIANA UNIVERSITY DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE Fall 2009
Y353 The Politics of Gender and Sexuality
Students in this course are exposed to various theoretical frameworks through which they can better understand the myriad number of issues and policies associated with gender and sexuality. This course is designed to teach students how to answer research related questions on the relationship between gender, sexuality and politics.

I.U. SCHOOL OF PUBLIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS Fall 2006 – Fall 2008, Fall 2011
V161 Urban Problems and Solutions
V161 Urban Problems and Solutions is an introduction to urban policy issues. Topics include political, social, and economic foundations and development of cities and suburbs, urban planning, poverty, and other urban problems.

INDIANA UNIVERSITY DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE Fall 2007
Y100 American Political Controversies
This course introduces students to the most relevant political controversies related to the distribution of rights and resources in American society by exploring both sides of current and past political debates and by examining the role of the public sector in addressing them.

CLASSES ASSISTED
Political Science Y376 International Political Economy
Political Science Y100 American Political Controversies
Economics E202 Introduction to MacroEconomics

Research Assistant Posts
JOURNAL OF POLICY ANALYSIS AND MANAGEMENT Bloomington, Indiana
Research Associate, January 2006 – May 2006

INSTITUTE FOR DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES Bloomington, Indiana
Research Associate, August 2005 – December, 2005

POLICY ANALYTICS Indianapolis IN
Consultant, April 2005 – August 2005

BALL STATE UNIVERSITY CENTER FOR COMMUNITY AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
Consultant, April 2005 – August 2005

Service
Overseas Filipinos’ Society for the Promotion of Economic Security (OFSPES), Turin Italy
Volunteer Lecturer, Leadership and Social Entrepreneurship (LSE) Training, 2011
LSE is a training program designed to build capacities of Filipinos in Italy on leadership and social entrepreneurship skills.

Women Exposed Art Benefit Show 2010, Bloomington Indiana
Organizer, 2010
WE is an annual art benefit and exhibit organized to support Middle Way House Bloomington, Indiana’s Women’s Shelter.

Leadership, Ethics and Social Action (LESA at PACE), Bloomington Indiana
Faculty Mentor, 2010
The LESA Capstone experience (now known as Political and Civic Engagement (PACE) program) offers students an opportunity to pull together the learning from his/her major into a useful, tangible product.

Commission on Multicultural Understanding, Bloomington Indiana
Member Executive Board, 2008-2009

Women’s Student Association, Bloomington Indiana
Faculty Advisor, 2008-2009

Women of Color Leadership Institute, Bloomington Indiana
Faculty Advisor, 2008-2010

**Relevant Training**
Aside from Microsoft Office, STATA and SPSS, I have received formal training in:
Structured Query Language (SQL) for Benefits, Timeliness and Quality Database of the Department of Labor


**Foreign Languages**
English: Fluent
Italian: Fluent
Tagalog: Mother tongue
German: Basic knowledge

**Conference Papers&Posters**

4th Annual Political Networks Conference and Workshops,
University of Michigan, June 2011
Poster: “Passaparola, The Movement of Political Information and Organization in Two Immigrant Communities In Rome”

Second International Conference on Spaces and Flows
Prato, Italy, November 2011
Sociologies Stream
30 Minute Paper Presentation: “Gossip, Cheap Talk and Information: The Movement of Practical Political Information in a Multi-ethnic City”

70th Annual Midwest Political Science Association Conference
Chicago, IL, April 2012
Urban and Local Politics Panel: Urban social capital and civil society

70th Annual Midwest Political Science Association Conference
Chicago, IL, April 2012
Political Networks: State, Urban and Local Political Networks Panel
Paper Presentation: “Side Streets versus Freeways: Identifying the Most Efficient Route for Information Transfer among Multi-Ethnic Leadership in Rome”

Peer Reviewed Publications


“Caught in the Middle: Networks and Institutional Integration of two Asian Communities in Rome”. Forthcoming.

Non Peer Reviewed Publications

2(a): 12

